

ICOC MEETING
 Draft Minutes
 Thursday July 26th, 2012

Main Location:

- Marriott Waterfront SFO, 1800 Old Bayshore Hwy Burlingame, CA 94010

Other Locations:

- Sanford-Burnham Medical Research Institute, 10901 North Torrey Pines Road, La Jolla, CA 92037
- 409 North Larchmont Blvd, Los Angeles, CA 90004
- 5575 West Las Positas Blvd., Suite 300, Pleasanton, CA 94588

Robert Price <i>for Birgeneau</i>	P
David Brenner	P
Jacob Levin <i>for Bryant</i>	P
Marcy Feit	P
Ted Krontiris <i>for Friedman</i>	P
Leeza Gibbons	P
Michael Goldberg	P
Sam Hawgood	P
Stephen Juelsgaard	P
Sherry Lansing	P
Bertram Lubin	P
Michael Marletta	NP
Shlomo Melmed	P
Phil Pizzo	P (9:12 AM)
Claire Pomeroy	P
Francisco Prieto	P
Carmen Puliafito	NP
Robert Quint	P (10:29 AM, Left 2:15 PM)
Duane Roth	P
Joan Samuelson	P
David Serrano Sewell	P
Jeff Sheehy	P
Jon Shestack	P
Oswald Steward	P
Jonathan Thomas	P
Art Torres	P
Kristiina Vuori	P
James Economou <i>for Washington</i>	P
	26 P
	2 NP

REPORTS & DISCUSSION ITEMS

Agenda Item #4 Chairman's Report

- Report given by Jonathan Thomas

Agenda Item #5 President's Report, including but not limited to update regarding CIRM's response to Performance Audit recommendations Financial Report

- Report given by Alan Trounson

ACTION ITEMS

Agenda Item #6 Consideration of applications for Disease Team Therapy Development Awards (RFA 10-05)

Extraordinary petition DR2-05272

- Report given by Kevin Whittlesey

Extraordinary petition DR2-05288

- Public comment made by Dr. Don Gazit and Dr. Hyun Bae

Extraordinary petition DR2-05426

- Report given by Bettina Steffan

Motion # 1

- Motion made by Art Torres to Refer Disease Team Therapy Development Award Application No. 5426 for Additional Review of New Information by Peer Review Group with Direction to the President and Co-Vice Chair Sheehy to Determine the Make-Up of the Peer Review Panel, or Subset of the Panel, and Request that Peer Review Recommendation be Presented to the Board at its Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting (September 6, 2012)
- Motion Seconded by Jon Shestack

Vote

- The ICOC by individual voice vote approved the motion.
- 20 YES; 0 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 6 CONFLICTS

Extraordinary petition DR2-05735

- Report given by Ingrid Caras

Motion # 2

- Motion made by Art Torres to Refer Disease Team Therapy Development Award Application No. 5735 for Additional Review of New Information by Peer Review Group with Direction to the President and Co-Vice Chair Sheehy to Determine the Make-Up of the Peer Review Panel, or Subset of the Panel, and Request that Peer Review Recommendation be Presented to the Board at its Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting (September 6, 2012)
- Motion Seconded by Jon Shestack

Vote

- The ICOC by individual voice vote approved the motion.
- 24 YES; 0 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 1 CONFLICTS

Extraordinary petition DR2-05416

- Report given by Karen Berry

Motion # 3

- Motion made by Ted Krontiris to refer Disease Team Therapy Development Award Application No. 5416 for Additional Review of New Information by Peer Review Group with Direction to the Senior Vice President Feigal to Determine the Make-Up of the Peer Review Panel, or Subset of the Panel, and Request that Peer Review Recommendation be Presented to the Board at its Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting (September 6, 2012)
- Motion seconded by Art Torres

Vote

- The ICOC by individual voice vote approved the motion.
- 15 YES; 0 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 10 CONFLICTS

Extraordinary petition DR2-05320

- Report given by Karen Berry

Motion # 4

- Motion made by Steve Juelsgaard to move Disease Team Therapy Development Award Application No. 5320 from Tier 3 to Tier 1
- Motion seconded by David Serrano Sewell

Vote

- The ICOC by individual voice vote approved the motion.
- 21 YES; 0 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 2 CONFLICTS

Extraordinary petition DR2-05739

Motion #5

- Motion made by Steve Juelsgaard to Refer Disease Team Therapy Development Award Application No. 5739 for Additional Review of New Information by Peer Review Group with Direction to the President and Co-Vice Chair Sheehy to Determine the Make-Up of the Peer Review Panel, or Subset of the Panel, and Request that Peer Review Recommendation be Presented to the Board at its Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting (September 6, 2012)
- Motions seconded by Kristina Vuori

Vote

- The ICOC by group voice vote approved the motion.
- 8 YES; 6 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 7 CONFLICTS

Motion #6

- Motion made by Duane Roth to table motion 5
- Motion seconded by Steve Juelsgaard

Vote

- The ICOC by group voice vote approved the motion.
- 23 YES; 0 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 0 CONFLICTS

Motion #8

- Motion made by Art Torres to approve Disease Team Therapy Development Award Applications in Tier 1
- Motion seconded by Duane Roth

Vote

- The ICOC by individual voice vote approved the motion.
- 19 YES; 0 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 11 CONFLICTS

Motion #9

- Motion made by Steve Juelsgaard to take Motion 5 off the table
- Motion seconded by Duane Roth

Vote

- The ICOC by group voice vote approved the motion.
- 19 YES; 0 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 0 CONFLICTS

Extraordinary petition DR2-05352

Motion #10

- Motion made by Duane Roth to Refer Disease Team Therapy Development Award Application No. 5352 for Additional Review of New Information by Peer Review Group with Direction to the President and Co-Vice Chair Sheehy to Determine the Make-Up of the Peer Review Panel, or Subset of the Panel, and Request that Peer Review Recommendation be Presented to the Board at its Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting (September 6, 2012)
- Motion seconded by Art Torres

Vote

- The ICOC by individual voice vote approved the motion.
- 12 YES; 2 NO; 1 ABSTENTION; 7 CONFLICTS

Extraordinary petition DR2-05365

Motion #11

- Motion made by Art Torres to Approve Disease Team Therapy Development Award Application 5365, Subject to Stanford's Agreement that it Will Pay for any Costs in Excess of the Amount Budgeted for the Production of the Monoclonal Antibody Necessary for the Proposed Research and that They Obtain, to CIRM's Satisfaction, the Rights Necessary to Obtain or Produce the Necessary Monoclonal Antibody

- Motions seconded by David Serrano Sewell

Vote

- The ICOC by individual voice vote approved the motion.
- 11 YES; 2 NO; 3 ABSTENTION; 7 CONFLICTS

CLOSED SESSION

Agenda Item #7

Discussion of confidential intellectual property or work product, prepublication data, financial information, confidential scientific research or data, and other proprietary information relating to applications for Disease Team Therapy Development Awards (RFA 10-05) and applications for Research Leadership Awards (RFA 09-04) (Health & Safety Code 125290.30(f) (3) (B) and (C)).

- See Motions Made on Agenda Item #6

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Agenda Item #8

Communications Update

- Agenda Item Moved to next ICOC Meeting

ACTION ITEMS

Agenda Item #9

Consideration of proposed amendments to the Intellectual Property Regulations, including but not limited to revenue sharing provisions and definitions.

- Agenda Item Moved to next ICOC Meeting

Agenda Item #10

Consideration of Early Translational IV Concept Proposal

- Agenda Item Moved to next ICOC Meeting

Agenda Item #11

- Consideration of a resolution honoring Ted Love.

Agenda Item #12

- Consideration of amendments to the Grants Administration Policy.

Agenda Item # 13

- Consideration of appointment of new Scientific members of the Grants Working Group.

Agenda Item #14

Consideration of applications for Research Leadership Awards (RFA 09-04)

- Report given by Michael Yaffe

Motion # 7

- Motion made by Jeff Sheehy to approve Research Leadership Award Application No. 6536
- Motion seconded by David Serrano Sewell

Vote

- The ICOC by individual voice vote approved the motion.
- 23 YES; 0 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 0 CONFLICTS

Agenda Item #15

Consideration of minutes from the May 2012 ICOC Board Meeting

- Agenda Item Moved to next ICOC Meeting

ICOC Board Meeting

		7/26/12	7/26/12
		VOTE	VO
MEMBERS	ATTENDANCE	MOTION 1	MOTION 2
		DESCRIPTION	DESCRIPTION
		Refer Disease Team Therapy Development Award Application No. 5426 for Additional Review of New Information by Peer Review Group with Direction to the President and Co-Vice Chair Sheehy to Determine the Make-Up of the Peer Review Panel, or Subset of the Panel, and Request that Peer Review Recommendation be Presented to the Board at its Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting (September 6, 2012)	Refer Disease Team Therapy Development Award Application No. 5735 for Additional Review of New Information by Peer Review Group with Direction to the President and Co-Vice Chair Sheehy to Determine the Make-Up of the Peer Review Panel, or Subset of the Panel, and Request that Peer Review Recommendation be Presented to the Board at its Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting (September 6, 2012)
Robert Price <i>for Birgeneau</i>	P	Y	Y
David Brenner	P	Y	Y
Jacob Levin <i>for Bryant</i>	P	Y	Y
Marcy Feit	P	C	Y
Ted Krontiris <i>for Friedman</i>	P	Y	Y
Leeza Gibbons	P	Y	Y
Michael Goldberg	P	Y	Y
Sam Hawgood	P	Y	Y
Stephen Juelsgaard	P	Y	Y
Sherry Lansing	P	C	Y
Bertram Lubin	P	Y	Y
Michael Marletta	NP		
Shlomo Melmed	P	C	C
Phil Pizzo	P (9:12 AM)	Y	Y
Claire Pomeroy	P	C	Y
Francisco Prieto	P	C	Y
Carmen Puliafito	NP		
Robert Quint	P (10:29 AM, Left 2:15 PM)	Y	Y
Duane Roth	P	Y	Y
Joan Samuelson	P	Y	Y
David Serrano Sewell	P	Y	Y
Jeff Sheehy	P	Y	Y
Jon Shestack	P	Y	Y
Oswald Steward	P	Y	Y
Jonathan Thomas	P	Y	Y
Art Torres	P	Y	Y
Kristiina Vuori	P	Y	Y
James Economou <i>for Washington</i>	P	C	
	26 P	20 Y	24 Y
	2 NP	0 N	0 N
		0 A	0 A
		6 C	1 C
		PASS	PASS

LEGEND
Attendance
NP – Not Present
P – Present
Votes
A – Abstain
C – Conflict
N – No
VV – Voice Vote
Y – Yes
Y/C – Yes, except for those which I have a conflict

ICOC Board Meeting

	5/12		7/26/12			
	TE		VOTE			
	MOTION 3 Maker: Krontiris Second: Torres	MOTION 4 Maker: Juelsgaard Second: Serrano Sewell	MOTION 5 Maker: Juelsgaard Second: Vuori	MOTION 6 Maker: Roth Second: Juelsgaard	MOTION 7 Maker: Sheehy Second: Serrano Sewell	MOTION 8 Maker: Torres Second: Roth
	DESCRIPTION	DESCRIPTION	DESCRIPTION	DESCRIPTION	DESCRIPTION	DESCRIPTION
	Refer Disease Team Therapy Development Award Application No. 5416 for Additional Review of New Information by Peer Review Group with Direction to the Senior Vice President Feigal to Determine the Make-Up of the Peer Review Panel, or Subset of the Panel, and Request that Peer Review Recommendation be Presented to the Board at its Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting (September 6, 2012)	Move Disease Team Therapy Development Award Application No. 5320 from Tier 3 to Tier 1	Refer Disease Team Therapy Development Award Application No. 5739 for Additional Review of New Information by Peer Review Group with Direction to the President and Co-Vice Chair Sheehy to Determine the Make-Up of the Peer Review Panel, or Subset of the Panel, and Request that Peer Review Recommendation be Presented to the Board at its Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting (September 6, 2012)	Table Motion 5	Approve Research Leadership Award Application No. 6536	Approve Disease Team Therapy Development Award Applications in Tier 1
MEMBERS						
Robert Price <i>for Birgeneau</i>	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y/C
David Brenner	C	Y		Y	Y	
Jacob Levin <i>for Bryant</i>	C	Y		Y	Y	Y/C
Marcy Feit	C				Y	Y/C
Ted Krontiris <i>for Friedman</i>	Y	C		Y		
Leeza Gibbons	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y
Michael Goldberg	C	Y		Y	Y	Y/C
Sam Hawgood	C	Y		Y	Y	Y/C
Stephen Juelsgaard	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y
Sherry Lansing	C	Y		Y	Y	
Bertram Lubin		Y		Y	Y	Y/C
Michael Marletta						
Shlomo Melmed	Y	C		Y	Y	
Phil Pizzo	C	Y		Y		
Claire Pomeroy	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y/C
Francisco Prieto	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y/C
Carmen Puliafito			Tabled			
Robert Quint	Y					
Duane Roth	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y
Joan Samuelson	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y
David Serrano Sewell	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y
Jeff Sheehy	C	Y		Y	Y	Y/C
Jon Shestack	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y
Oswald Steward	C	Y		Y	Y	Y/C
Jonathan Thomas	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y
Art Torres	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y
Kristiina Vuori	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y/C
James Economou <i>for Washington</i>	C				Y	
	15 Y	21 Y		23 Y (VV)	23 Y	19 Y
	0 N	0 N		0 N	0 N	0 N
	0 A	0 A		0 A	0 A	0 A
	10 C	2 C		0 C	0 C	11 C
	PASS	PASS		PASS	PASS	PASS

LEGEND
Attendance
NP – Not Present
P – Present
Votes
A – Abstain
C – Conflict
N – No
VV – Voice Vote
Y – Yes
Y/C – Yes, except for those which I have a conflict

ICOC Board Meeting

	7/26/12		7/26/12	
	VOTE		VOTE	
	MOTION 9 Maker: Juelsgaard Second: Roth	MOTION 5 [OFF TABLE] Maker: Juelsgaard Second: Vuori	MOTION 10 Maker: Roth Second: Torres	MOTION 11 Maker: Torres Second: Serrano Sewell
	DESCRIPTION Take Motion 5 Off the Table	DESCRIPTION Refer Disease Team Therapy Development Award Application No. 5739 for Additional Review of New Information by Peer Review Group with Direction to the President and Co-Vice Chair Sheehy to Determine the Make-Up of the Peer Review Panel, or Subset of the Panel, and Request that Peer Review Recommendation be Presented to the Board at its Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting (September 6, 2012)	DESCRIPTION Refer Disease Team Therapy Development Award Application No. 5352 for Additional Review of New Information by Peer Review Group with Direction to the President and Co-Vice Chair Sheehy to Determine the Make-Up of the Peer Review Panel, or Subset of the Panel, and Request that Peer Review Recommendation be Presented to the Board at its Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting (September 6, 2012)	DESCRIPTION Approve Disease Team Therapy Development Award Application 5365, Subject to Stanford's Agreement that it Will Pay for any Costs in Excess of the Amount Budgeted for the Production of the Monoclonal Antibody Necessary for the Proposed Research and that They Obtain, to CIRM's Satisfaction, the Rights Necessary to Obtain or Produce the Necessary Monoclonal Antibody
MEMBERS				
Robert Price <i>for Birgeneau</i>	Y	N	N	Y
David Brenner			C	
Jacob Levin <i>for Bryant</i>	Y	C	Y	A
Marcy Feit	Y	C	C	C
Ted Krontiris <i>for Friedman</i>				C
Leeza Gibbons	Y	Y	Y	Y
Michael Goldberg	Y	Y	Y	C
Sam Hawgood	Y	N	C	C
Stephen Juelsgaard	Y	Y	Y	Y
Sherry Lansing		C	C	C
Bertram Lubin	Y	N		A
Michael Marletta		C		
Shlomo Melmed			C	Y
Phil Pizzo				C
Claire Pomeroy	Y	C	Y	N
Francisco Prieto	Y	C	Y	Y
Carmen Puliafito			C	
Robert Quint				
Duane Roth	Y	N	Y	Y
Joan Samuelson	Y	Y	Y	Y
David Serrano Sewell	Y	Y	Y	Y
Jeff Sheehy	Y	N	C	C
Jon Shestack	Y	N	A	A
Oswald Steward	Y	C	N	N
Jonathan Thomas	Y	Y	Y	Y
Art Torres	Y	Y	Y	Y
Kristiina Vuori	Y	Y	Y	Y
James Economou <i>for Washington</i>				
	19 Y (VV)	8 Y	12 Y	11 Y
	0 N	6 N	2 N	2 N
	0 A	0 A	1 A	3 A
	0 C	7 C	7 C	7 C
	PASS	PASS	PASS	PASS

LEGEND
Attendance
NP – Not Present
P – Present
Votes
A – Abstain
C – Conflict
N – No
VV – Voice Vote
Y – Yes
Y/C – Yes, except for those which I have a conflict