FINAL MINUTES 10/27-8/09 ICOC MEETING

Locations:

MAIN LOCATION: Luxe Hotel Sunset Ballroom 11461 Sunset Boulevard Los Angeles, CA 90049 TELEPHONIC LOCATION: ValleyCare Health System 5575 West Las Positas Blvd. Suite 300 Pleasanton, CA 94588

Ricardo Azziz/David Dafoe	Present
Robert Birgeneau/Robert Price	Present
Floyd Bloom	Present
David Brenner	Absent
William Brody	Absent
Susan Bryan/Jacob Levin	Present
Marcy Feit	Present
Michael Friedman	Present
Leeza Gibbons	Present
Michael Goldberg	Absent
Sam Hawgood	Absent
Bob Klein	Present
Sherry Lansing	Present
Gerald Levey	Present
Ted Love	Present
Ed Penhoet	Present
Phil Pizzo	Present
Clair Pomeroy	Present
Francisco Prieto	Present
Carmen Puliafito	Present
Robert Quint	Present
John Reed/ Jeannie Fontana	Present
Duane Roth	Present
Joan Sameuleson	Present
David Serrano-Sewell	Present
Jeff Sheehy	Present
Oswald Steward	Present
Art Torres	Present

Agenda Items:

Agenda Item #4 Chairman's Report

• Bob Klein gave the Chairman's report

Agenda Item # 5 President's Report.

- Alan Trounson gave the <u>President's Report.</u>
- <u>08-09 Budget Summary</u>

ACTION ITEMS

Action Item # 6 Consideration of resolutions regarding (Click on Links below):

- a. Alta Charo, founding member of Standards Working Group; and
- b. Don Fisher, CIRM supporter and community leader.

Motion:

- Motion made by Sherry Lansing to approve resolution honoring Sherry Lansing and Don Fisher
- Motions seconded by Art Torres

Vote:

• The ICOC by group voice vote passed the motion

Agenda Item #7Consideration of items relating to the Grants Working Group, including but not limited to:

- a. Appointment of new scientific members;
- b. Appointment of Co-Vice Chair; and
- c. <u>Amendments</u> to the <u>Grants Working Group Bylaws</u> related to the process for appointment and selection of GWG Chairs.

Motion:

- Motion made by Carmen Puliafito to approve the appointment of new Scientific Members of the GWG and Appointment of alternate John Sladek as a regular Member of the GWG upon the next opening
- Motion seconded by Sherry Lansing

Vote:

• The ICOC by group voice vote approved the motion.

Agenda Item #8 Consideration of recommendations from Finance Subcommittee regarding criteria for evaluation of eligibility for recourse loans and process for financial review of loan applications.

• Discussion led my Michael Goldberg

Motion:

• Recommendation of the Finance Subcommittee regarding criteria for evaluation of eligibility for recourse loans and process for Financial Review of Loan Applications. With one exception- Prior version of the process memo was included in the Board's packet rather than the version of the memo that was received and recommended by the Finance Subcommittee, which includes and additional exception pursuant to which the Finance Subcommittee can review the terms of a loan

Vote:

• The ICOC by group voice vote approved the motion

Agenda Item #9 Consideration of amendment to the Loan Administration Policy, including but not limited to, a proposal to eliminate the requirement that applicants identify whether they would accept a non-recourse loan if they are not eligible for a recourse loan.

Motion:

- Motion made by Art Torres to approve Finance Subcommittee LAP Amendment
- Motion Seconded by Ted Love

Vote:

• The ICOC by group voice vote approved the motion.

Agenda Item #10 Consideration of contract for legal services with Nancy J. Koch, J.D.

Discussion led by Elona Baum

Motion:

- Motion made by Carmen Puliafito to approve the contract extension with Amendment of at \$100,000 at six months.
- Motion Seconded by David Serrano Sewell

Vote:

• The ICOC by group voice vote approved the Amendment in the Koch contract.

Agenda Item #11 Consideration of recommendations from Grants Working Group on applications for Disease Team Research Awards.

 Applications presented by Bettina Steffen, Rosa Canet-Aviles, Pat Olson, Michael Yaffe

Motion:

- Motion made by Jeff Sheehy to move Application 1485 to Tier 1
- Motion seconded by Bob Klein

Vote:

• The ICOC by individual voice vote passed the motion to move Application 1485 to Tier 1

Motion:

- Motion made by Ted Love to move Application 1480 to Tier 1
- Motion seconded by Francisco Prieto

Vote:

• The ICOC by Voice Vote passed the motion to move Application 1480 to Tier 1

Motion:

- Motion made by Joan Samuelson to move Application 1491 up to Tier 1
- Motions seconded by Carmen Puliafito

Vote:

- Motion fails, ICOC by Individual Voice Vote
- 6 Yes Votes, 12 No Votes, 2 Abstain, 6 Conflicts

Motion:

- Motion made by Ted Love to move Application 1421 to Tier 1
- Motion seconded by Francisco Prieto

Vote:

• The ICOC by individual voice vote passed the motion to move Application 1421 to Tier 1

Motion:

- Duane Roth made a motion to approve all Applications in Tier 1 except 1471, which is conditionally approved subject to final consideration in December.
- Motion seconded by Art Torres

Vote:

• The ICOC by individual voice vote approved the motion.

Motion:

- Motion made by Art Torres not to fund any Grants in Tier 3
- Motion seconded by Ted Love

Vote:

• The ICOC by Individual Voice vote passed the motion

CLOSED SESSION

Agenda Item #12. Discussion of confidential intellectual property or work product and prepublication, confidential scientific research or data, and financial information relating to applications for Disease Team Research Awards, including grants and loans. (Health & Safety Code 125290.30(d) (3) (B) and (C)).

- Executive Session Held
- b. Discussion of Personnel (Government Code section 11126, subdivision (a); Health & Safety Code section 125290.30(d) (3) (D)). Public report of any action taken, if necessary during closed session.
 - *It is expected that the items below this point will occur on October 28, 2009*

ACTION ITEMS

Agenda Item #13 Continuation of consideration of recommendations from Grants Working Group on applications for Disease Team Research Awards.

SEE AGENDA ITEM #11

Agenda Item #14 Consideration of financial approval of applications for recourse or non-recourse Disease Team Research Award loans.

• No vote needed due to vote on Agenda Items 8 and 9

Agenda Item # 15 Consideration of Update to Strategic Plan.

• Discussion led by Alan Trounson

Motion:

- Motion made by Sherry Lansing to approve updated Strategic Plan
- Motion seconded by Michael Goldberg

Vote:

• The ICOC by group voice vote approved the motion.

Agenda Item # 16 Consideration of appointment of new member(s) to the Standards Working Group.

 The ICOC by group voice vote approved the motion to appoint new members of the SWG

Agenda Item #17 Consideration of revisions to CIRM Medical and Ethical Standards Regulations Sections 100070, 100080 and 100090.

• Presentation given by Geoff Lomax

Motion:

- Motion made by Oswald Steward
- Motion seconded by Floyd Bloom

Agenda Item #18 Consideration of travel supplement for CIRM Bridges to Stem Cell Research Awards, RFA 08-04.

• Discussion led by Michael Yaffe

Motion:

- Motion made by Duane Roth to approve Bridges Supplemental Travel
- Motion seconded by Ted Love

Vote:

• The members of the ICOC who were eligible to vote by individual voice vote approved the motion

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Agenda Item #19 Discussion of results of survey of Grants Working Group members regarding public disclosure of financial interests.

• Presentation given by Gil Sambrano

Agenda Item #20 Public comment The Committee will accept public testimony on any matter under its jurisdiction that is not on the agenda, but the Committee cannot act on any such matter at this meeting.

• No public Comment at this meeting

	Indon	ndont Citizana Ovarainht C
	Independent Citizens Oversight	
	10/27/09	
		Wote Motion 1 Motion Maker: Sheehy Seconded: Klein
Members	Attendance	Description: Move Application 1485 to Tier 1 from Tier 3
Ricardo Azziz for Donald Dafoe	P / 4:55, Ricardo Azziz for	
Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz	Donald Dafoe	Α
Robert Price for Robert Birgenau	P P	Y
Floyd Bloom	P	<u> </u>
David Brenner	A	
William Brody	A	
Jacob Levin for Susan Bryant	P	<u> </u>
Marcy Feit	P	I
Michael Friedman	A ·	
Leeza Gibbons	P	V
Michael Goldberg	P / 8:45	
Sam Hawgood	A A	S
Bob Klein	P	V
Sherry Lansing	P / Left, 7:00	l .
Gerald Levey	P P	Y
Ted Love	P	Ÿ
Ed Penhoet	P	Ÿ
Phil Pizzo	A	and the contract of the contra
Claire Pomeroy	P	Ÿ
Francisco Prieto	P	Ÿ
Carmen Puliafito	Ä	
Robert Quint	P / 4:55	Y
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed	P / Left, 7:00	-
Duane Roth	P	N
Joan Samuelson	P	Y
David Serrano Sewell	P / 8:00	Ý
Jeff Sheehy	Р	Ÿ
Jon Shestack	P / 5:10	N
Oswald Steward	P	A
Art Torres	P	Y
	P: 23	Y : 15
	A : 6	N: 2
Total		A: 2
		C: 3

	ommittee	Ind
	On:	
	Motion 2 Motion Maker: Love Seconded: Prieto	
Members	Description: Move Application 1480 to Tier 1 from Tier 3	Attendance (Morning)
Ricardo Azziz for Donald Dafoe	_	P. Donald Dafoe for
Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz	С	Ricardo Azziz
Robert Price for Robert Birgenau	Y	P
Floyd Bloom	Ý	Р
David Brenner		A
William Brody	C	A
Jacob Levin for Susan Bryant	Č	P / 9:44
Marcy Feit		Α Α
Michael Friedman		P
Leeza Gibbons	Y	P / 9:01
Michael Goldberg	Ċ	P
Sam Hawgood		Α
Bob Klein	Υ	Р
Sherry Lansing	Participation Control of the Control	А
Gerald Levey	С	Р
Ted Love	Υ	Р
Ed Penhoet	Υ	Р
Phil Pizzo		Р
Claire Pomeroy	N	. Р
Francisco Prieto	Y	P / 8:46
Carmen Puliafito		Р
Robert Quint	Y	Ω
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed		Α
Duane Roth	N	Р
Joan Samuelson	Y	Р
David Serrano Sewell	Y	P
Jeff Sheehy	Y	Р
Jon Shestack	Y	P / 9:24
Oswald Steward	С	Р
Art Torres	Y	Р
	Y: 13	P: 23
Total	N : 2	A : 6
iotai	A : 0	
	C : 10	

	10/28/09	
	Vote On:	
	Motion 3 Motion Maker: Samuelson Seconded: Puliafato	Motion 4 Motion Maker: Bloo Seconded: Shestad
Members	Description: Move Application 1491 to Tier 1 from Tier 3	Description: Move Application 142 Tier 1 from Tier 3
Ricardo Azziz for Donald Dafoe Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz	С	С
	N1	
Robert Price for Robert Birgenau	N N	Y
Floyd Bloom	N	Y
David Brenner		
William Brody	Λ	Ç
Jacob Levin for Susan Bryant	I A C	Ţ
Marcy Feit Michael Friedman	C	С
Leeza Gibbons	Y	Y
Michael Goldberg	Y	C
Sam Hawgood	o	<u> </u>
Bob Klein	N N	Υ
Sherry Lansing		,
Gerald Levey	N	Υ
Ted Love	N	Ý
Ed Penhoet	N	Ý
Phil Pizzo	N	Ý
Claire Pomeroy	N	Ċ
Francisco Prieto	· Y	Ÿ
Carmen Puliafito	N	C
Robert Quint	N	Y
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed		С
Duane Roth	N	Y
Joan Samuelson	Y	Y
David Serrano Sewell	Y	Y
Jeff Sheehy	С	Υ
Jon Shestack	A	Y
Oswald Steward	N	Y
Art Torres	, Å	Y
	Y: 6	Y: 18
Total	N: 12	N : 0
Total	A : 2	A : 0
	C: 6	C : 7

	Independent Citizens	Oversight Committee	
	10/28/09		
	Vote On:		
	Motion 5 Motion Maker: Roth Seconded: Torres	Motion 6 Motion Maker: Steward Seconded: Bloom	
Members	Description: Approve Funding for all Applications in Tier 1, Except 1471, which is Conditionally Approved Subject to Final Consideration in December	Description: Approve SWG Recommendations	
Ricardo Azziz for Donald Dafoe Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz	Y/C	Υ	
	Υ	Y	
Robert Price for Robert Birgenau Floyd Bloom	Y/C		
David Brenner	1/0	I	
William Brody	_		
Jacob Levin for Susan Bryant	Y/C	Y	
Marcy Feit	1/0	1	
Michael Friedman	Y/C	V	
Leeza Gibbons	Ý	Ÿ	
Michael Goldberg	Y/C	 	
Sam Hawgood	170	I	
Bob Klein	Y	Y	
Sherry Lansing	Y/C		
Gerald Levey	Y/C	Y	
Ted Love	Y	Ÿ	
Ed Penhoet	Ý	Ÿ	
Phil Pizzo	Y/C	Y	
Claire Pomeroy	Y/C	Ÿ	
Francisco Prieto	Y/C	Y	
Carmen Puliafito	Y/C	Y	
Robert Quint	Y	Y	
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed			
Duane Roth	Υ	Y	
Joan Samuelson	Y	Y	
David Serrano Sewell	Y	Y	
Jeff Sheehy	Y/C	Y	
Jon Shestack		Y	
Oswald Steward	Y/C	Y	
Art Torres	Y	Y	
	Y : 23	Y : 23	
Tatal	N : 0	N : 0	
Total	A : 0	A: 0	
	C: 13 (Y/C)	C : 0	

The control of the property of the control of the c	401	20/00
	10/28/09 Vote On:	
	Motion 7	Motion 8
	Motion Maker: Torres	Motion Maker: Torre
	Seconded: Bloom	Seconded: Love
	Seconded, Bloom	Geconded, Love
Members		
Wembers		
	Description:	Description:
가 하다	Approve Finance	Approved Finance
발생들은 아무리 아무리를 하셨다면서 가입하셨다.	Subcommittee re	Subcommittee re L/
보이는 회사를 하지만 그런 한화되는 없이	Process/Criteria	Amendment
Ricardo Azziz for Donald Dafoe	Υ	Y
Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz		
Robert Price for Robert Birgenau	Y	Υ
Floyd Bloom	Υ	Υ
David Brenner		
William Brody		V.
Jacob Levin for Susan Bryant	Υ	Υ
Marcy Feit	V	V
Michael Friedman	Y	Y
Leeza Gibbons	Y	Y
Michael Goldberg Sam Hawgood	1.	Ţ
Bob Klein	Υ	Υ
Sherry Lansing	I	Į I.
Gerald Levey	Y	V
Ted Love	Ý	Y
Ed Penhoet	Ý	Ý
Phil Pizzo	Ý	Ÿ
Claire Pomeroy	Ÿ	Ý
Francisco Prieto	Y	Ÿ
Carmen Puliafito	Y	Y
Robert Quint	Y	Y
Jeannie Fontana <i>for John Reed</i>		
Duane Roth	Y	Υ
Joan Samuelson	Y	Υ
David Serrano Sewell	Y	Υ
Jeff Sheehy	Υ	Y
Jon Shestack	Y	Υ
Oswald Steward	Y	Y
Art Torres	Y	Y
	Y : 23	Y : 23
	N: 0	N : 0
	A : 0	A: 0
	C: 0	C: 0

	Independent Citizens	Oversight Committee	
	10/28/09		
	Vote On:		
	Motion 9 Motion Maker: Puliafito Seconded: Sewell	Motion 10 Motion Maker: Lansing Seconded: Torres	
Members	Description: Approve Koch Contract Amendment at \$100,000 for Six Months	Description: Approve Resolution Honoring Don Fisher and Alta Charo	
Diagonal Amin for Donald Defen			
Ricardo Azziz for Donald Dafoe Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz	Y	Y	
Robert Price for Robert Birgenau	Y	Y	
Floyd Bloom	Y	Y	
David Brenner			
William Brody	V	V	
Jacob Levin for Susan Bryant	Y	Y	
Marcy Feit	V	V	
Michael Friedman Leeza Gibbons	Y	Y	
Michael Goldberg	Y	Y	
Sam Hawgood	1		
Bob Klein	Υ	Y	
Sherry Lansing	I I	_	
Gerald Levey	Y	Y	
Ted Love	Ÿ	Y	
Ed Penhoet	Y	Y	
Phil Pizzo	Ÿ	Y	
Claire Pomeroy	Y	Y	
Francisco Prieto	Ÿ	Y	
Carmen Puliafito	Y	Y	
Robert Quint	i v	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed			
Duane Roth	Y	Y	
Joan Samuelson	Ŷ	Ý	
David Serrano Sewell	Y	Y	
Jeff Sheehy	Y	Y	
Jon Shestack	Y	Y	
Oswald Steward	Y	Y	
Art Torres	Y	Υ	
	Y : 23	Y : 23	
Total		N: 0	
Total		A : 0	
		C : 0	

	Independent Citizens	Oversight Committee	
		8/09	
		On:	
	Motion 11 Motion Maker: Puliafito Seconded: Lansing	Motion 12 Motion Maker: Torres Seconded: Love	
Members	Description: Approve Appointment of New Scientific Members of GWG, and Appointment of Alternate John Sladek as a Regular Member of the GWG Upon the Next Opening	Description: Approve Appointment of Joan Samuelson and Jeff Sheehy as Co-Vice Chairs of the GWG	
Ricardo Azziz for Donald Dafoe			
Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz	Y	Y	
Robert Price for Robert Birgenau	Y	Y	
Floyd Bloom	Y	Ý	
David Brenner			
William Brody	_		
Jacob Levin for Susan Bryant	Υ Υ	Y	
Marcy Feit			
Michael Friedman	Y	Υ	
Leeza Gibbons	T Y	Ÿ	
Michael Goldberg	Ý	Y	
Sam Hawgood			
Bob Klein	Y	Y	
Sherry Lansing			
Gerald Levey	Y	Y	
Ted Love	Ŷ	Y	*
Ed Penhoet	Υ	Y	
Phil Pizzo	Y	Y	
Claire Pomeroy	Y	Y	
Francisco Prieto	Y	Y	
Carmen Puliafito	Y	Y	
Robert Quint	Y	Y	
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed			
Duane Roth	Y	Y	
Joan Samuelson	Y	Y	
David Serrano Sewell	Y	Y	
Jeff Sheehy	Y	Y	
Jon Shestack	Y	Y	
Oswald Steward	Y	Y	
Art Torres	Y	Y	
	Y: 23	Y: 23	
Total	N : 0	N: 0	
iotai	A: 0	A : 0	
	C : 0	C : 0	

	Independent (Citizens Oversi	ght Committee
		10/28/09	
	Vote On: Motion 13 Motion Maker: Torres	10/20/03	Vote On: Motion 14 Motion Maker: Love
Members	Seconded: Bloom Description: Defer Consideration of GWG Recommendations re Amendment of GWG Bylaws Regarding Appointment of Administrative Chair and Acting Chair of GWG	Attendance (Afternoon)	Seconded: Torres Description: Do Not Fund Tier 3
Ricardo Azziz for Donald Dafoe Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz	Υ	Р	Y/C
Robert Price for Robert Birgenau	Υ	P.	Y/C
Floyd Bloom	Ÿ	Р	Y/C
David Brenner		Ä	170
William Brody		A	
Jacob Levin for Susan Bryant	Y	P	Y/C
Marcy Feit	,	Ā	170
Michael Friedman	Y	P	Y/C
Leeza Gibbons	Ý	Р	Y
Michael Goldberg	Ÿ	Р	Y/C
Sam Hawgood		A	
Bob Klein	Y	Р	Y
Sherry Lansing		P	Y/C
Gerald Levey	Υ	Р	Y/C
Ted Love	Y	Р	Y
Ed Penhoet	Y	Р	Y
Phil Pizzo	Y	P	Y/C
Claire Pomeroy	Y	Р	Y/C
Francisco Prieto	Y	Р	Y/C
Carmen Puliafito	Y	Р	Y/C
Robert Quint	Y	Р	Y
Jeannie Fontana <i>for John Reed</i>		Α	
Duane Roth	Y	Р	Y
Joan Samuelson	Y	Р	Y
David Serrano Sewell	Y	P	Ý
Jeff Sheehy	Υ	P	Y/C
Jon Shestack	Y	A	
Oswald Steward	Y	P	Y/C
Art Torres	Y	Р	Y
	Y: 23	P: 23	Y: 23
Total	N: 0	A : 6	N : 0
10101	A : 0		A : 0
	C : 0		C: 14 (Y/C)

그림의 그는 그 그 맛있다. 그들은 이 가장 하는 것이 되었다.	10/28/09		
	Vote On:		
	Motion 15 Motion Maker: Torres Seconded: Samuelson	Motion 16 Motion Maker: Roth Seconded: Love	
Members	Description: Approve Appointment of New SWG Member	Description: Approve Bridges Travel Supplement	
Ricardo Azziz for Donald Dafoe			
Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz	· Y		
Robert Price for Robert Birgenau	Υ		
Floyd Bloom	Ÿ		
David Brenner			
William Brody			
Jacob Levin <i>for Susan Bryant</i>	Y		
Marcy Feit			
Michael Friedman	Υ		
Leeza Gibbons	Y	Y	
Michael Goldberg	Y		
Sam Hawgood			
Bob Klein	Υ	Y	
Sherry Lansing	Υ		
Gerald Levey	Y		
Ted Love	Y	Y	
Ed Penhoet	Υ		
Phil Pizzo	Υ		
Claire Pomeroy	Y		
Francisco Prieto	Υ		
Carmen Puliafito	Y		
Robert Quint	Υ	Y	
Jeannie Fontana <i>for John Reed</i>	V.	V.	
Duane Roth	Y	Y	
Joan Samuelson	Y	Y	
David Serrano Sewell	Y	Y	
Jeff Sheehy	Y		
Jon Shestack	V		
Oswald Steward	Y	Y	
Art Torres			
	Y: 23	Y: 8	
Total	N: 0	N : 0	
lotal	A: 0	A: 0	

ann an t-airean an an t-airean an t-air	Independent Citizens Oversight Committee 10/28/09
	Vote On:
	Motion 17
	Motion Maker: Lansing
	Seconded: Goldberg
	·
Members	
	Description:
	Approve Strategic Plan
	Update
[[[[[[[[[[[[[[[[[[[
Ricardo Azziz for Donald Dafoe	
Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz	Υ .
Robert Price for Robert Birgenau Floyd Bloom	·
David Brenner	
William Brody	V
Jacob Levin for Susan Bryant	Y
Marcy Feit	
Michael Friedman	Y
Leeza Gibbons	Y
Michael Goldberg	Y
Sam Hawgood	
Bob Klein	Y
Sherry Lansing	Y
Gerald Levey	Y
Ted Love	Y
Ed Penhoet	Y
Phil Pizzo	Υ
Claire Pomeroy	Y
Francisco Prieto	Y
Carmen Puliafito	Y
Robert Quint	Y
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed	
Duane Roth	Υ
Joan Samuelson	Ÿ
David Serrano Sewell	Ÿ
Jeff Sheehy	
Jon Shestack	_
Oswald Steward	V
Art Torres	
ALLIUITES	Y 22
	Y: 23
Total	N: 0
	A : 0
	C : 0