

## MINUTES OF 9/25/08 ICOC MEETING

**Location:**  
 University of California, San Diego  
 Price Center  
 Ballroom B  
 9500 Gilman Drive  
 La Jolla, CA 9293-0008

Ricardo Azziz <b>Alternate Stephen Vamvakas</b>	Present
Robert Birgeneau	Absent
Floyd Bloom	Present
David Brenner	Present
Susan V. Bryant <b>Alternate Jacob Levin</b>	Present
Marsha Chandler <b>Alternate Kim Witmer</b>	Present
Marcy Feit	Present
Michael A. Friedman	Absent
Leeza Gibbons	Absent
Michael Goldberg	Present
Sam Hawgood	Present
Robert Klein	Present
Sherry Lansing	Absent
Gerald S. Levey	Present
Ted W. Love	Absent
Ed Penhoet	Present
Philip A. Pizzo	Absent
Claire Pomeroy <b>Alternate Ann Bonham</b>	Present
Francisco J. Prieto	Present
Robert Quint	Present
John C. Reed <b>Alternate Jeanne Fontana</b>	Present
Duane Roth	Present
Joan Samuelson	Absent
David Serrano Sewell	Absent
Jeff Sheehy	Present
Jonathan Shestack	Absent
Oswald Steward	Present

**Agenda Item # 4: Approval of minutes from August 12-13, 2008 ICOC meetings.**

This item was deferred to a later meeting.

**Agenda Item # 5: Chairman's Report.**

Chairman Klein gave a report beginning by inviting a group of Huntington's Disease patient advocates to speak. He thanked them, stressing the importance of personal statements like theirs in underlining how urgent our task is to move safely, accountably but quickly to a result.

He reported briefly on the following given the time constraints for the meeting:

- Regarding the state budget and the fact the CIRM is not part of the state budget and interest payments on our bonds are separately funded outside the state budget for the first 5 years of the CIRM's existence.
- Regarding the national confusion about the need for embryonic stem cell research given iPS research and the advances being made in that area, he directed board members and members of the audience to a science statement by scientific leaders posted by the International Society for Stem Cell Research, in which all signatories concur that embryonic stem cell research remains the gold standard in this country and the world, and that the entire spectrum of stem cell research is needed.
  - You can view the statement at this URL:  
<http://www.isscr.org/documents/ScienceStatementSept162008.pdf>
  - You can view the growing list of signatories at this URL:  
<http://www.isscr.org/ScienceStatementEndorsers.cfm>

**Agenda Item # 6: President's Report**

Dr. Trounson gave a report, including information on several recent science articles, newly hired personnel including Vice President for Operations John Robson; the President's current priorities including national and international collaborations and MOUs; workshops completed and in planning stages; the CIRM Grantee meeting; and completed and/or planned grant reviews and RFAs.

To view Dr. Trounson's slides for his report, see this URL:  
[http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/092508\\_item\\_6.pdf](http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/092508_item_6.pdf)

**Agenda Item # 7: Communications Report**

Chief Communications Officer Don Gibbons reported on Stem Cell Awareness Day activities that had begun the afternoon before at 5:00, in order to coincide with Victoria, Australia's

celebration on the same date. Events included webcasting the Spotlight on Diabetes from before the meeting and also an afternoon online live chat with stem cell scientists, geared toward school kids. The Stem Cell Basics information on CIRM's web site, made live before Stem Cell Awareness day so kids could prepare for the live chat, is available at this URL:  
<http://www.cirm.ca.gov/about/default.asp>

**Agenda Item # 8: Presentation on CIRM program budget and funds available for research grants and loans.**

Chairman Klein, at the board's request, gave a presentation on CIRM funds available for grants and loans, funds allocated as of August 2008 and a draft model for CIRM commitment flows through 2017.

To view the presentation, see this URL:

[http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/092508\\_item\\_8.pdf](http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/092508_item_8.pdf)

**Agenda Item # 9: Continuation of consideration of recommendations from Grants Working Group of New Faculty Awards II applications.**

The board considered New Faculty II applications that had been postponed from the August 12-13, 2008 meeting. At the previous ICOC meeting, the board approved 23 New Faculty II grants, but postponed final decisions on nine Tier 2 applications and 22 Tier 3 applications for today's meeting. None of the remaining applications, carried over from August, were approved for funding.

**Agenda Items # 10 & 11: Closed Session on Personnel and Confidential IP, Work Product or Data Relating to and Public Report of Any Action Taken During Closed Session:**

There was no action to report from the Closed Session.

**Agenda item # 12: Consideration of appointment of new scientific members for Grants Working Group**

**Motion:**

- Dr. Bloom moved for approval of the proposed new scientific members of the Grants Working Group.
- Dr. Levey seconded the motion.

**Vote:**

- The ICOC, by voice vote, approved this motion, approving the new scientific members for the Grants Working Group.

To view the names and biographies of the new members approved, see this URL:  
[http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/092508\\_item\\_12.pdf](http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/092508_item_12.pdf)

**Agenda Item # 13: Consideration of names for CIRM funded Major Facilities**

**Motion:**

- Mr. Roth moved for approval of the proposed names for CIRM funded Major Facilities.
- Dr. Levey seconded the motion.

**Vote:**

- The ICOC, by voice vote, approved this motion, approving the proposed names for CIRM funded Major Facilities.

**Proposed names for CIRM funded facilities submitted for ICOC approval pursuant to the major facilities GAP section VIII, G, 2, included:**

- From University of California, Davis:

UC Davis Institute for Regenerative Cures  
A facility supported by the California Institute for Regenerative Medicine

- From University of Southern California:

The Eli and Edythe Broad CIRM Center for Regenerative Medicine and Stem Cell  
Research at USC

- From University of California, San Francisco:

The Eli and Edythe L. Broad Center for Regeneration Medicine and Stem Cell Research  
at UCSF  
Donor Name Building  
A facility supported by the California Institute for Regenerative Medicine

- From the San Diego Consortium for Regenerative Medicine:

Sanford Consortium for Regenerative Medicine  
An Institute of the California Institute for Regenerative Medicine

- From Stanford University School of Medicine:

Stanford Institutes of Medicine 1

John Doe Stem Cell Research Building  
A California Institute for Regenerative Medicine Facility

- From University of California, Irvine:

Sue and Bill Gross Hall  
A CIRM Institute

**Agenda Item # 14: Consideration of adoption of Interim Regulation regarding Policy for Extraordinary Petitions for ICOC Consideration of Applications for Funding.**

After a robust discussion, the board moved forward with a motion to approve as an Interim Regulation a policy for Extraordinary Petitions with some amendments developed during the discussion.

**Motion:**

- Dr. Steward moved for approval of the policy with amendments as per the board discussion.
- Mr. Roth seconded the motion.

**Vote:**

- The ICOC, by voice vote, approved this motion, approving the policy with amendments as discussed by the board.

To view the final policy, as approved and posted on the CIRM web site Policies page, see this URL: [http://www.cirm.ca.gov/policy/pdf/Extraordinary\\_Petitions\(00065319-5\).pdf](http://www.cirm.ca.gov/policy/pdf/Extraordinary_Petitions(00065319-5).pdf)

**Agenda Item # 15: Consideration of CIRM Loan Policy, including but not limited to:**

- a. Loan Portfolio Policies.**
- b. Business Review Processes for CIRM Loan Program.**

**Motion:**

- Mr. Goldberg moved that the ICOC :
  - Consider a loan program of \$500 million
  - Agree that the specific allocation of those loans be on an RFA-by-RFA basis
  - Ask the CIRM staff to bring back guidelines on the additional size that may occur for loans versus grants on any particular RFA given that we can recycle the loan proceeds but cannot do so with grants; this differential would provide an incentive for loans versus grants in any individual RFA.
  - Ask the CIRM staff to develop a Loan Administration RFP for review and adoption by the Finance Subcommittee as a recommendation by the Subcommittee to the ICOC at its December 2008 meeting.

- The motion was amended to also include the covenants and terms of the Loan Policy as developed by the Loan Task Force and approved by the Finance Subcommittee for recommendation to the ICOC. To view those covenants as approved, please see this URL:  
[http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/092508\\_item\\_15.pdf](http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/092508_item_15.pdf)
- Mr. Roth seconded the motion.

**Vote:**

- The ICOC, by voice vote, approved this motion as stated above, as a conceptual approval, to be refined and further discussed by the Finance Subcommittee before final approval by the ICOC.

**Agenda Item #16: Consideration of petition to designate a “covered stem cell line” as acceptably derived.**

**Motion:**

- Mr. Roth moved that the ICOC grant the petition as filed.
- Mr. Goldberg seconded the motion.

**Vote:**

- The ICOC, by voice vote, approved this motion, granting the petition as filed.

To view the petition as filed and granted, please see this URL:

[http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/092508\\_item\\_16.pdf](http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/092508_item_16.pdf)

**Agenda Item # 17: Consideration of project to consolidate non-profit and for-profit intellectual property regulations and approval to initiate process under Administrative Procedure Act.**

**Motion:**

- Mr. Sheehy moved approval of the proposal for CIRM staff to begin the process to consolidate the CIRM intellectual property regulations into one comprehensive document for eventual submission to the OAL.
- Dr. Prieto seconded the motion.

**Vote:**

- The ICOC, by voice vote, approved this motion.

To review the staff proposal for the intellectual property policy consolidation project, see

this URL: [http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/092508\\_item\\_17.pdf](http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/092508_item_17.pdf)

**Agenda Item # 18: Consideration of administrative Review of Letters of Interest in response to RFAs**

At the request of President Trounson, James Harrison gave a presentation on the concept for Science Office Review of Letters of Interest. Following his presentation, the board made several suggestions and asked the staff to pursue this project, bringing a fully developed proposal to the board at its next meeting in December 2008.

**Agenda Item # 19: Informational presentation on the proposed Disease Team RFA.**

CIRM Science Officer Dr. Bettina Steffen gave an informational presentation on the proposed Disease Team RFA, with the plan to present the full concept plan to the board at its next meeting in December 2008.

---

---

VOTE TALLIES

September 25, 2008  
New Faculty II

Dafoe = Vamvakas  
Bryant = Levin



- RN2-00902-1 ..... Dafoe, Lansing, Levey
- RN2-00903-1 ..... Hawgood, Sheehy
- RN2-00904-1 ..... Dafoe, Lansing, Levey
- RN2-00906-1 ..... Feit, Hawgood, Lansing, Sheehy
- RN2-00907-1 ..... Goldberg, Pizzo
- RN2-00908-1 ..... Bloom, Brenner, Lansing, Reed, Fontana
- RN2-00909-1 ..... Goldberg, Pizzo
- RN2-00910-1 ..... Bloom, Brenner, Goldberg, Lansing, Pizzo, Reed, Fontana
- RN2-00912-1 ..... Bryant, Lansing, Steward
- RN2-00913-1 ..... Bryant, Lansing, Steward
- RN2-00914-1 ..... Bloom, Price, Witmer
- RN2-00915-1 ..... Bryant, Lansing, Steward
- RN2-00917-1 ..... Lansing
- RN2-00918-1 ..... Bonham, Feit, Lansing, Prieto
- RN2-00919-1 ..... Feit, Hawgood, Lansing, Sheehy
- RN2-00920-1 ..... Dafoe, Lansing, Levey
- RN2-00921-1 ..... Bonham, Bryant, Feit, Lansing, Prieto
- RN2-00922-1 ..... Bonham, Feit, Lansing, Prieto
- RN2-00923-1 ..... Lansing, Penhoet, Price
- RN2-00924-1 ..... Bryant, Lansing, Steward
- RN2-00925-1 ..... Bloom, Dafoe, Lansing, Levey, Reed, Fontana
- RN2-00927-1 ..... Dafoe, Lansing, Levey
- RN2-00929-1 ..... Feit, Hawgood, Lansing, Sheehy
- RN2-00930-1 ..... Dafoe, Fontana
- RN2-00931-1 ..... Bloom, Brenner, Lansing, Reed, Fontana
- RN2-00932-1 ..... Bonham, Feit, Lansing, Prieto
- RN2-00933-1 ..... Feit, Hawgood, Lansing, Sheehy
- RN2-00934-1 ..... Feit, Hawgood, Lansing, Sheehy
- RN2-00935-1 ..... Bloom, Brenner, Dafoe, Lansing, Levey, Reed, Fontana
- RN2-00936-1 ..... Bloom, Fontana, Reed, Witmer
- RN2-00937-1 ..... Friedman
- RN2-00939-1 ..... Bloom
- RN2-00942-1 ..... Dafoe, Lansing, Levey
- RN2-00943-1 ..... Bloom
- RN2-00944-1 ..... Bryant, Lansing, Steward
- RN2-00945-1 ..... Bloom, Brenner, Lansing, Reed, Fontana
- RN2-00947-1 ..... Bloom, Brenner, Lansing, Reed, Fontana
- RN2-00948-1 ..... Bonham, Feit, Hawgood, Lansing, Prieto, Sheehy
- RN2-00949-1 ..... Bonham, Feit, Hawgood, Lansing, Prieto, Sheehy
- RN2-00950-1 ..... Feit, Hawgood, Lansing, Sheehy
- RN2-00952-1 ..... Hawgood, Sheehy
- RN2-00953-1 ..... Dafoe, Fontana



**September 25, 2008**

**MOTION** To fund new Faculty II Application  
00943-1

**Motion Maker** Prieto

**Seconded** Sheehy

<b>MEMBER</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>NO</b>	<b>CONFLICT</b>	<b>ABSTAIN</b>
Stephen Vamkas for Ricardo Azziz		1		
Floyd Bloom			1	
David Brenner		1		
Jacob Levin for Susan Bryant		1		
Kim Witmer for Marsha Chandler		1		
Marcy Feit		1		
Michael Goldberg		1		
Sam Hawgood		1		
Bob Klein		1		
Gerald Levey		1		
Ed Penhoet		1		
Ann Bonham for Claire Pomeroy		1		
Francisco Preto	1			
Robert Quint		1		
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed	1			
Duane Roth				1
Jeff Sheehy	1			
Oswald Steward		1		
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>

**September 25, 2008**

**MOTION** Not to fund remaining new Faculty  
II applications in Tier 2 and 3

**Motion Maker** Roth

**Seconded** Penhoet

<b>MEMBER</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>NO</b>	<b>CONFLICT</b>	<b>ABSTAIN</b>
Stephen Vamkas for Ricardo Azziz	1		Except	
Floyd Bloom	1		Except	
David Brenner	1		Except	
Jacob Levin for Susan Bryant		1	Except	
Kim Witmer for Marsha Chandler	1		Except	
Marcy Feit	1		Except	
Michael Goldberg	1		Except	
Sam Hawgood	1		Except	
Bob Klein				1
Gerald Levey	1		Except	
Ed Penhoet	1			
Ann Bonham for Claire Pomeroy		1	Except	
Francisco Preito		1	Except	
Robert Quint	1			
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed		1	Except	
Duane Roth	1			
Jeff Sheehy		1	Except	
Oswald Steward	1		Except	
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>5</b>		<b>1</b>