

FINAL MINUTES 8/19-20/09 ICOC MEETING

Date: Wednesday, August 19, 2009

Time: 4:30-9:00 PM (Estimated)

Location:

Robertson Auditorium
Mission Bay Conference Center
1675 Owens Street
San Francisco, CA 94143

Date: Thursday, August 20, 2009

Time: 9:30 AM - 5:00 PM (Estimated)

Locations:

Robertson Auditorium
Mission Bay Conference Center
1675 Owens Street
San Francisco, CA 94143

TELEPHONIC LOCATION:

City of Hope
1500 E. Duarte Road
Duarte, California 91

Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz	Present
Robert Price for Robert Birgeneau	Present
Floyd Bloom	Absent
David Brenner	Present
William Brody	Present
Jacob Levin for Sue Bryan	Present
Marcy Feit	Present
Michael Friedman	Present
Leeza Gibbons	Present
Michael Goldberg	Absent
Sam Hawgood	Present
Bob Klein	Present
Sherry Lansing	Absent
Gerald Levey	Absent
Ted Love	Present
Ed Penhoet	Present
Phil Pizzo	Present
Claire Pomeroy	Present
Francisco Prieto	Present
Elizabeth Fini for Carmen Puliafito	Present
Robert Quint	Present
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed	Present
Duan Roth	Present
Joan Samuelson	Present
David Serrano Sewell	Present
Jeff Sheehy	Present
Jonathon Shestack	Absent
Oswald Steward	Absent
Art Torres	Present

CONSENT ITEMS

AGENDA ITEM #4. Approval of minutes from December 9-10, 2008, January 29-30, April 29-30 and June 17-18, 2009 ICOC meetings.

REPORTS

AGEDNA ITEM #5. Chairman's Report

- Report given by Bob Klein

AGENDA ITEM #6 President's Report.

- Report given by Alan Trounson
- Report on Contracts & Interagency Agreements
- CIRM Report on Operations

ACTION ITEMS

Agenda Item #7 Consideration of recommendations from the Legislative Subcommittee regarding:

- (a) CIRM's response to the Little Hoover Commission Report on CIRM**
 - i. Little Hoover Commission Report on CIRM**
 - ii. Memo from Remcho, Johansen and Purcell to Little Hoover Commission**
 - iii. Letter from Senate Majority Leader Dean Florez to Little Hoover Commission**
- (b) Endorsement of a public healthcare option as part of national healthcare legislation currently under consideration by the US Congress**

Discussion for item 7A led by Art Torres

Motion:

- Motion not to endorse the recommendation of the Little Hoover commission No. 8, poll the peer reviewers to determine whether they would resign if they were required to publicly disclose their financial interests. Staff's recommendation was to endorse this proposal to take an anonymous poll of the GWG Members

Vote:

- The ICOC by individual voice vote voted not to pass the Motion. Motion failed. Vote 7 YES VOTES 12 NO VOTES

Motion:

- Motion made by Art Torres to adopt the recommendations of the Legislative Subcommittee as laid out in the memo w/amendments with the provision to remove item #8
- Motion seconded by Duane Roth

Vote:

- The ICOC by group voice vote passed the motion

Motion:

- Motion made by Art Torres to Adopt Leg. Subcommittee Recommendations with Modification to First Recommendation as follows "Oppose Little Hoover Commission recommendations 1-5 based on counsel's advice that the proposed amendments to Prop. 71 would violate the California Constitution and Prop. 71 and would fail to respect, as the California Courts have recognized, the precious right of the 7 million voters who approved Prop. 71
- Motion seconded by Duane Roth

Vote:

- The ICOC by voice vote passed the motion

Discussion for item 7B led by Jeff Sheehy

Motion:

- Motion made by Jeff Sheehy to endorse inclusion of public option as part of federal healthcare reform legislative
- Motion seconded by Phil Pizzo

Vote:

- The ICOC by individual voice vote passed the motion VOTE: 16 YES 3 NO 2 Abstentions

Agenda item #8 Consideration of approval of new members of the Grants Working Group and process and delegated authority for approval of Working Group chairs.

- Discussion led by Gil Sambrano

Motion:

- Motion made by Ted Love Appoint Dr. Prieto as Patient Advocate member of Grants Working Group
- Motion seconded by Art Torres

Vote:

- The ICOC by group voice vote passed the motion w/Francisco Prieto abstaining

Agenda Item #9 Consideration of adjustment to honoraria for non-ICOC members of Grants Working Group.

- Discussion led by Gil Sambrano
-

Motion:

- Motion mad by Duane Roth to Adopt staff proposal to adjust compensation to \$750 per day for scientific members, alternates and specialists of the Grants Working Group
- Motion seconded by Ted Love

Vote:

- The ICOC by group voice vote passed the motion

Agenda Item #10 Consideration of Concept Proposal for CIRM Research Leadership Awards

- Discussion led by John Robson

Motion:

- Motion made by Jeanine Fontana to Approve concept plan for CIRM Research Leadership Awards, except to lift limit of four awards per year
- Motion seconded by Duane Roth

Vote:

- The ICOC by individual voice vote passed the motion VOTE 18 YES 2 NO

Agenda Item #11 Consideration of Concept Proposal for CIRM Stem Cell Transplantation Immunology Awards.

- Discussion led by Sohel Talb

Motion:

- Motion made by Jeff Sheehy Approve concept plan for CIRM Stem Cell Transplantation Immunology Awards, but without institutional limits
- Motion seconded by David Serrano Sewell

Vote:

- The ICOC by individual voice vote passes, VOTE; 20 YES 1 NO

Agenda Item #12 Consideration of designation of Art Torres as Chair of Legislative Subcommittee

Motion:

- Motion made by Duane Roth to Appoint Art Torres as Chair of Legislative Subcommittee
- Motion seconded by Sam Hawgood

Vote:

- The ICOC by group voice vote passes the motion with Art Torres abstaining

Agenda Item #13 Consideration of recommendations from Grants Working Group on applications for Basic Biology 1 Awards.

- Discussion led by Michael Yaffe, Rosa Canet-Aviles,

Motion:

- Motion made by Leeza Gibbons to move Application 1339 to Tier 1 for funding
- Motion seconded by Art Torres

Vote:

- The ICOC by individual voice vote voted against this motion VOTE 7 YES 12 NO 2 Abstentions

Motion:

- Motion made by Bob Klein to move Application 1298 to Tier1 for funding
- Motion seconded by Francisco Prieto

Vote:

- The ICOC by individual voice vote voted against this motion VOTE 6 YES 12 NO

Motion:

- Motion made by Duane Roth not to fund Tier III applications in Basic Biology I
- Motion seconded by Art Torres

Vote:

- The ICOC by group vote passed the motion

Motion:

- Motion made by Duane Roth to fund applications in Tier 1 if Basic Biology I
- Motion seconded by Leeza Gibbons

Vote:

- The ICOC by individual voice vote passed the motion

CLOSED SESSION

Agenda Item #14

- Discussion of confidential intellectual property or work product and prepublication, confidential scientific research or data relating to applications for Basic Biology 1 Awards. (Health & Safety Code 125290.30(d) (3) (B) and (C)).**
- Discussion of Personnel (Government Code section 11126, subdivision (a); Health & Safety Code section 125290.30(d) (3) (D)).**

- Public report of any action taken, if necessary, during closed session.

It is expected that most of the items below this point will occur on August 20, 2009

ACTION ITEMS

Agenda Item #15 Continuation of consideration of recommendations from Grants Working Group on applications for Basic Biology 1 Awards.

- See Agenda Item #13

Agenda Item#16 Consideration of interim regulation regarding CIRM Intellectual Property Policy provisions applicable to CIRM loans

- **Memo on interim regulation regarding CIRM IP provisions applicable to CIRM loans**
- Discussion led by Elona Baum and Ed Penhoet

Motion:

- Motion made by Jeff Sheehy to approve the proposed IP regulations that were posted for public comment on August 3, 2009 with one exception: that the definition of Exclusive Licenses be changed to the version pending just prior to August 3, 2009 version
- Motion seconded by Art Torres

Vote:

- The ICOC by voice vote approved the motion

Agenda Item #17. Consideration of consolidation of for-profit and non-profit Intellectual Property regulations

- Discussion led by Scott Tocher

Motion:

- Motion made by Jeff Sheehy to adopt interim regulation regarding CIRM IP regulations applicable to CIRM loans

Vote:

- The ICOC by individual voice vote passed the motion

Agenda Item #18 Consideration of update to Scientific Strategic Plan.

- Presented by Alan Trounson

Agenda Item #19 Consideration of update on Loan Program including but not limited to agreements with Delegated Underwriters.

- Discussion led by John Robson

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Agenda Item #20 Update regarding Major Facilities projects

- Report on Major Facilities Projects give by John Robson

Agenda Item #21 Update regarding federal biosimilars legislation

- Biosimilars amendment passed in committee 7/31/09
- Report given by Duane Roth

Agenda Item #22 Public comment. The Committee will accept public testimony on any matter under its jurisdiction that is not on the agenda, but the Committee cannot act on any such matter at this meeting.

- Public comment for Judy Robertson and Irene

###

AUGUST 19, 2009

MOTION Adopt Leg. Subcommittee recommendations except with reference to Item 8

Motion Maker Torres

Seconded Roth

MEMBER	YES	NO	CONFLICT	ABSTAIN
Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz				
Robert Price for Birgeneau				
Floyd Bloom			Not Attending	
David Brenner				
William Brody			Not Attending	
Jacob Levine for Susan Bryant				
Marcy Feit				
Michael Friedman				
Leeza Gibbons				
Michael Goldberg			Not Attending	
Sam Hawgood				
Bob Klein				
Sherry Lansing			Not Attending	
Gerald Levey			Not Attending	
Ted Love				
Ed Penhoet				
Phil Pizzo				
Claire Pomeroy				
Francisco Prieto				
Elizabeth Fini for Puliafito				
Robert Quint				
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed				
Duane Roth				
Joan Samuelson				
David Serrano Sewell				
Jeff Sheehy				
Jonathan Shestack			Not Attending	
Oswald Steward				
Art Torres				
TOTAL	0	0	0	0

MOTION WITHDRAWN

AUGUST 19, 2009

MOTION Appoint Dr. Prieto as Patient Advocate member of Grants Working Group

Motion Maker Love

Seconded Torres

MEMBER	YES	NO	CONFLICT	ABSTAIN
Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz				
Robert Price for Birgeneau			Not Attending	
Floyd Bloom			Not Attending	
David Brenner				
William Brody			Not Attending	
Jacob Levine for Susan Bryant				
Marcy Feit				
Michael Friedman				
Leeza Gibbons				
Michael Goldberg			Not Attending	
Sam Hawgood				
Bob Klein				
Sherry Lansing			Not Attending	
Gerald Levey			Not Attending	
Ted Love				
Ed Penhoet				
Phil Pizzo				
Claire Pomeroy				
Francisco Prieto				
Elizabeth Fini for Puliafito				
Robert Quint				
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed				
Duane Roth				
Joan Samuelson			Not Attending	
David Serrano Sewell				
Jeff Sheehy				
Jonathan Shestack			Not Attending	
Oswald Steward			Not Attending	
Art Torres				
TOTAL	0	0	0	0

VOICE VOTE- MOTION CARRIES WITH DR. PRIETO ABSTAINING

AUGUST 19, 2009

Adopt staff proposal to adjust compensation to \$750 per day for scientific members, alternates and specialists of the Grants Working Group

MOTION

Motion Maker

Roth

Seconded

Love

MEMBER	YES	NO	CONFLICT	ABSTAIN
Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz				
Robert Price for Birgeneau			Not Attending	
Floyd Bloom			Not Attending	
David Brenner				
William Brody			Not Attending	
Jacob Levine for Susan Bryant				
Marcy Feit				
Michael Friedman				
Leeza Gibbons				
Michael Goldberg			Not Attending	
Sam Hawgood				
Bob Klein				
Sherry Lansing			Not Attending	
Gerald Levey			Not Attending	
Ted Love				
Ed Penhoet				
Phil Pizzo				
Claire Pomeroy				
Francisco Prieto				
Elizabeth Fini for Puliafito				
Robert Quint				
Jeannie Fotnana for John Reed				
Duane Roth				
Joan Samuelson			Not Attending	
David Serrano Sewell				
Jeff Sheehy				
Jonathan Shestack			Not Attending	
Oswald Steward			Not Attending	
Art Torres				
TOTAL	0	0	0	0

VOICE VOTE- MOTION CARRIES UNANIMOUSLY

AUGUST 19, 2009

Approve concept plan for CIRM Stem Cell
Transplantation Immunology Awards, but without
institutional limits

MOTION

Motion Maker

Sheehy

Seconded

Serrano Sewell

MEMBER	YES	NO	CONFLICT	ABSTAIN
Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz	1			
Robert Price for Birgeneau			Not Attending	
Floyd Bloom			Not Attending	
David Brenner	1			
William Brody	1			
Jacob Levine for Susan Bryant	1			
Marcy Feit	1			
Michael Friedman	1			
Leeza Gibbons	1			
Michael Goldberg			Not Attending	
Sam Hawgood	1			
Bob Klein	1			
Sherry Lansing			Not Attending	
Gerald Levey			Not Attending	
Ted Love	1			
Ed Penhoet	1			
Phil Pizzo	1			
Claire Pomeroy		1		
Francisco Prieto	1			
Elizabeth Fini for Puliafito	1			
Robert Quint	1			
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed	1			
Duane Roth	1			
Joan Samuelson			Not Attending	
David Serrano Sewell	1			
Jeff Sheehy	1			
Jonathan Shestack			Not Attending	
Oswald Steward			Not Attending	
Art Torres	1			
TOTAL	20	1	0	0

ROLL CALL VOTE- MOTION CARRIES 20-1

AUGUST 19, 2009

MOTION Approve concept plan for CIRM Research Leadership Awards, except to lift limit of four awards per year

Motion Maker Fontana

Seconded Roth

MEMBER	YES	NO	CONFLICT	ABSTAIN
Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz	1			
Robert Price for Birgeneau				
Floyd Bloom	Not Attending			
David Brenner	1			
William Brody	1			
Jacob Levine for Susan Bryant		1		
Marcy Feit	1			
Michael Friedman				
Leeza Gibbons	1			
Michael Goldberg	Not Attending			
Sam Hawgood	1			
Bob Klein	1			
Sherry Lansing	Not Attending			
Gerald Levey	Not Attending			
Ted Love	1			
Ed Penhoet	1			
Phil Pizzo	1			
Claire Pomeroy	1			
Francisco Prieto	1			
Elizabeth Fini for Puliafito	1			
Robert Quint	1			
Jeannie Fotnana for John Reed	1			
Duane Roth	1			
Joan Samuelson	1			
David Serrano Sewell		1		
Jeff Sheehy				
Jonathan Shestack	Not Attending			
Oswald Steward				
Art Torres	1			
TOTAL	18	2	0	0

ROLL CALL VOTE- MOTION CARRIES 18-2

AUGUST 19, 2009

MOTION Move Basic Biology I Application 1339 to Tier 1
Motion Maker Gibbons
Seconded Torres

MEMBER	YES	NO	CONFLICT	ABSTAIN
Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz		1		
Robert Price for Birgeneau			1	
Floyd Bloom	Not Attending			
David Brenner		1		
William Brody		1		
Jacob Levine for Susan Bryant		1		
Marcy Feit				1
Michael Friedman				
Leeza Gibbons	1			
Michael Goldberg	Not Attending			
Sam Hawgood		1		
Bob Klein	1			
Sherry Lansing			1	
Gerald Levey	Not Attending			
Ted Love	1			
Ed Penhoet			1	
Phil Pizzo		1		
Claire Pomeroy		1		
Francisco Prieto				1
Elizabeth Fini for Puliafito		1		
Robert Quint		1		
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed	1			
Duane Roth	1			
Joan Samuelson				
David Serrano Sewell	1			
Jeff Sheehy		1		
Jonathan Shestack	Not Attending			
Oswald Steward				
Art Torres	1			
TOTAL	7	10	3	2

ROLL CALL VOTE- MOTION FAILS 7-10, WITH 2 ABSTENTIONS

AUGUST 19, 2009

MOTION Do Not Fund Tier 3 Basic Biology I

Motion Maker Roth

Seconded Torres

MEMBER	YES	NO	CONFLICT	ABSTAIN
Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz	1		1	
Robert Price for Birgeneau				
Floyd Bloom			Not Attending	
David Brenner	1		1	
William Brody	1		1	
Jacob Levine for Susan Bryant	1			
Marcy Feit	1		1	
Michael Friedman				
Leeza Gibbons	1			
Michael Goldberg			Not Attending	
Sam Hawgood	1		1	
Bob Klein	1			
Sherry Lansing			Not Attending	
Gerald Levey			Not Attending	
Ted Love	1			
Ed Penhoet	1		1	
Phil Pizzo	1		1	
Claire Pomeroy	1			
Francisco Prieto	1			
Elizabeth Fini for Puliafito	1		1	
Robert Quint	1			
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed	1		1	
Duane Roth	1			
Joan Samuelson				
David Serrano Sewell	1			
Jeff Sheehy	1		1	
Jonathan Shestack			Not Attending	
Oswald Steward				
Art Torres	1			
TOTAL	20	0	10	0

ROLL CALL VOTE- MOTION CARRIES UNANIMOUSLY

AUGUST 19, 2009

MOTION Fund Tier 1 of Basic Biology

Motion Maker Roth

Seconded Gibbons

MEMBER	YES	NO	CONFLICT	ABSTAIN
Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz	1		1	
Robert Price for Birgeneau				
Floyd Bloom	Not Attending			
David Brenner	1		1	
William Brody	1		1	
Jacob Levine for Susan Bryant	1			
Marcy Feit	1		1	
Michael Friedman				
Leeza Gibbons	1			
Michael Goldberg	Not Attending			
Sam Hawgood	1		1	
Bob Klein	1			
Sherry Lansing	Not Attending			
Gerald Levey	Not Attending			
Ted Love	1			
Ed Penhoet	1			
Phil Pizzo	1		1	
Claire Pomeroy	1		1	
Francisco Prieto	1		1	
Elizabeth Fini for Puliafito	1		1	
Robert Quint	1			
Jeannie Fotnana for John Reed	1		1	
Duane Roth	1			
Joan Samuelson				
David Serrano Sewell	1			
Jeff Sheehy	1		1	
Jonathan Shestack	Not Attending			
Oswald Steward				
Art Torres	1			
TOTAL	20	0	11	0

ROLL CALL VOTE- MOTION CARRIES UNANIMOUSLY

AUGUST 19, 2009

MOTION Adopt interim regulation regarding CIRM IP regulations applicable to CIRM loans

Motion Maker Sheehy

Seconded Love

MEMBER	YES	NO	CONFLICT	ABSTAIN
Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz	1			
Robert Price for Birgeneau				
Floyd Bloom	Not Attending			
David Brenner	1			
William Brody	1			
Jacob Levine for Susan Bryant	1			
Marcy Feit	1			
Michael Friedman				
Leeza Gibbons	1			
Michael Goldberg	Not Attending			
Sam Hawgood	1			
Bob Klein	1			
Sherry Lansing	Not Attending			
Gerald Levey	Not Attending			
Ted Love	1			
Ed Penhoet	1			
Phil Pizzo	1			
Claire Pomeroy	1			
Francisco Prieto	1			
Elizabeth Fini for Puliafito	1			
Robert Quint	1			
Jeannie Fotnana for John Reed	1			
Duane Roth	1			
Joan Samuelson				
David Serrano Sewell	1			
Jeff Sheehy	1			
Jonathan Shestack	Not Attending			
Oswald Steward				
Art Torres				
TOTAL	19	0	0	0

ROLL CALL VOTE- MOTION CARRIES UNANIMOUSLY

AUGUST 19, 2009

Approve the proposed IP regulations that were posted for public comment on August 3, 2009 with one exception: that the definition of Exclusive Licenses be changed to the version pending just prior to August 3, 2009 version

MOTION

Motion Maker

Sheehy

Seconded

Torres

MEMBER	YES	NO	CONFLICT	ABSTAIN
Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz				
Robert Price for Birgeneau				
Floyd Bloom	Not Attending			
David Brenner				
William Brody	Not Attending			
Jacob Levine for Susan Bryant				
Marcy Feit				
Michael Friedman				
Leeza Gibbons				
Michael Goldberg	Not Attending			
Sam Hawgood				
Bob Klein				
Sherry Lansing	Not Attending			
Gerald Levey	Not Attending			
Ted Love				
Ed Penhoet				
Phil Pizzo				
Claire Pomeroy				
Francisco Prieto				
Elizabeth Fini for Puliafito				
Robert Quint				
Jeannie Fotnana for John Reed				
Duane Roth				
Joan Samuelson				
David Serrano Sewell				
Jeff Sheehy				
Jonathan Shestack	Not Attending			
Oswald Steward				
Art Torres				
TOTAL	0	0	0	0

VOICE VOTE- MOTION CARRIES UNANIMOUSLY

AUGUST 19, 2009

Approve the proposed IP regulations that were posted for public comment on August 3, 2009 with one exception: that the definition of Exclusive Licenses be changed to the version pending just prior to August 3, 2009 version

MOTION

Motion Maker

Sheehy

Seconded

Torres

MEMBER	YES	NO	CONFLICT	ABSTAIN
Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz				
Robert Price for Birgeneau				
Floyd Bloom			Not Attending	
David Brenner				
William Brody			Not Attending	
Jacob Levine for Susan Bryant				
Marcy Feit				
Michael Friedman				
Leeza Gibbons				
Michael Goldberg			Not Attending	
Sam Hawgood				
Bob Klein				
Sherry Lansing			Not Attending	
Gerald Levey			Not Attending	
Ted Love				
Ed Penhoet				
Phil Pizzo				
Claire Pomeroy				
Francisco Prieto				
Elizabeth Fini for Puliafito				
Robert Quint				
Jeannie Fotnana for John Reed				
Duane Roth				
Joan Samuelson				
David Serrano Sewell				
Jeff Sheehy				
Jonathan Shestack			Not Attending	
Oswald Steward				
Art Torres				
TOTAL	0	0	0	0

VOICE VOTE- MOTION CARRIES UNANIMOUSLY