

FINAL MINUTES 6/17 & 6/18 ICOC MEETING

Location:
 Bel Aire Ballroom
 Bay Tower
 Sheraton San Diego Hotel & Marina
 1580 Harbor Island Drive
 San Diego, CA 92101

Ricardo Azziz	Present
Robert Birgeneu Alternate: Robert Price	Present
Floyd Bloom	Present
David Brenner	Absent
Susan Bryant Alternate: Jacob Levin	Present
Marsha Chandler	Present
Marcy Feit	Present
Michael Freidman	Present
Leeza Gibbons	Present
Michael Goldberg	Absent
Sam Hawgood Alternate: Nancy Milliken	Present
Bob Klein	Present
Sherry Lansing	Absent
Gerald Levey Alternate: Lenorad Rome	Present
Ted Love	Present
Ed Penhoet	Present
Phil Pizzo	Absent
Claire Pomeroy Alternate: Ken Burtis	Prsent
Francisco Prieto	Absent
Carmen Puliafito Alternate: Elizabeth Fini	Present
Robert Quint	Present
John Reed	Present
Duane Roth	Present
Joan Samuelson	Absent
David Serrano Sewell	Present
Jeff Sheehy	Present
Jon Shestack	Present
Oswald Steward	Absent
Art Torres	Present

CONSENT ITEMS

Agenda Item #4 Approval of minutes from August 12-13, September 25, December 9-10, 2008; and January 29th-30th and March 12, 2009 ICOC meetings.

Motion:

- Motion made by Ted Love to approve the minutes from prior meetings.
- Seconded by Art Torres

Vote:

- ICOC approved by group voice vote to pass the motion.

Agenda Item # 5 Approval of updated CIRM Conflict of Interest Code.

Motion:

- Motion made by Art Torres to approve the minutes from prior meetings.
- Seconded by Michael Friedman.

Vote:

- ICOC approved by group voice vote to pass the motion.

Agenda Item # 6 Chairman's Report

Report given by Bob Klein

Agenda Item # 7 President's Report

Report given by Alan Trounson

See URL for [President's Report](#)

Agenda Item #8 Consideration of funding for approved CIRM Research Training Program II awards.

Presentation given by Dr. Gil Sambrano

See URL for [Consideration of funding](#)

Motion:

- Motion made by Art Torres to adopt the recommendations of CIRM to fund the training programs and the intent is to have CIRM make that funding current as of July 1st to replace the prior deferral
- Seconded by Ted Love

Vote:

- A roll call vote was taken and members of the ICOC who were not conflicted voted by individual voice vote to approve recommendations.

Agenda Item # 9 Consideration of recommendations from Grants Working Group on Tier 2 Early Translational Research Awards applications.

Motion:

- Motion made by Dr. Azziz for tier 2 that CIRM do not fund all those applications with the exception of 1232.
- Seconded by Ted Love

Vote:

- The ICOC by individual voice vote approved the motion with the terms suggested by Dr. Trounson.

Motion:

- Motion made by Art Torres to Deny funding for the remaining Tier 2 candidates
- Seconded by Ted Love

Vote:

- The ICOC by individual voice vote approved the motion

CLOSED SESSION

10. Discussion of confidential intellectual property or work product and prepublication, confidential scientific research or data relating to Early Translational Research Awards applications. (Health & Safety Code 125290.30(d) (3) (B) and (C)).

Public report of any action taken, if necessary, during closed session.

ACTION ITEM

Agenda Item # 11 Consideration of 2009-2010 CIRM Budget.

Presentations given by John Robson and Margaret Ferguson

See links below for additional information

1. [Consideration of the 2009-10 CIRM Administrative Operating Budget](#)
2. [2009-10 Proposed Interagency and External Contract Budget Allocation](#)
3. [Proposed 2009-10 Operating Budget](#)
4. [CIRM Staffing Plan](#)
5. [Travel - Office of the Chair](#)

Motion:

- Motion made by Duane Roth to approve the budget with at 5% contingency with the modification that the President and the Chairman get together to discuss alternatives for staff support for the board and its services.
- Motion seconded by Ted Love

Vote:

- Motion was passed by ICOC by individual voice vote with 19 YES votes and 4 NO votes

Agenda item # 12 Consideration of contract with Remcho, Johansen & Purcell, LLP.

Motion:

- Motion made by Ted Love for approval
- Motion seconded by Art Torres

Vote:

- Vote was passed by ICOC by group voice vote

Agenda Item # 13 Consideration of consolidated Intellectual Property regulations.

- NO LONGER TO BE CONSIDERED AT THIS MEETING. TO BE CONSIDERED AT A FUTURE MEETING.

Agenda Item # 14 Consideration of appointment of at-large members and leadership of Evaluation Subcommittee.

This item was not considered at this meeting.

Agenda Item #15 Consideration of federal legislation, H.R. 1427/Waxman and H.R. 1548/Eshoo. Memo on FTC Report on Exclusivity
Presentation given by Nancy Koch

Motion:

- Motion made by Dr. Azziz that CIRM produce a learned response to the FTC noting the deficiencies, if you would as it is applicable to the Stem Cell Industry and biotech.
- Motion seconded by Art Torres

Vote:

- Vote was passed by ICOC by group voice vote

Agenda Item # 16 Consideration of guidelines for open voting roll.

Motion:

- Motion made by Art Torres for approval
- Motion seconded by Ted Love

Vote:

- Motion approved by ICOC by group voice vote

###

Approved at 4/28-9/10 ICOC Meeting

MOTION

To fund approved Training Grant II applications starting July 1, 2009

Motion Maker

Torres

Seconded

Love

MEMBER	YES	NO	CONFLICT	ABSTAIN
Ricardo Azziz			1	
Robert Price for Birgeneau			1	
Floyd Bloom			1	
David Brenner			1	
Jacob Levine for Susan Bryant			1	
Marsha Chandler			1	
Marcy Feit			1	
Michael Friedman			1	
Leeza Gibbons	1			
Michael Goldberg			1	
Nancy Milliken for Sam Hawgood			1	
Bob Klein	1			
Sherry Lansing			1	
Leonard Rome for Gerald Levey			1	
Ted Love	1			
Ed Penhoet			1	
Phil Pizzo			1	
Kenneth Burtis for Claire Pomeroy			1	
Francisco Prieto			1	
Elizabeth Fini for Puliafito			1	
Robert Quint				
John Reed			1	
Duane Roth	1			
Joan Samuelson	1			
David Serrano Sewell				
Jeff Sheehy			1	
Jonathan Shestack				
Oswald Steward			1	
Art Torres	1			
TOTAL	6	0	20	0

MOTION To fund Early Translational Research Award application 1232

Motion Maker Azziz

Seconded Love

<u>MEMBER</u>	<u>YES</u>	<u>NO</u>	<u>CONFLICT</u>	<u>ABSTAIN</u>
Ricardo Azziz	1			
Robert Price for Birgeneau	1			
Floyd Bloom		1		
David Brenner		1		
Jacob Levine for Susan Bryant	1			
Marsha Chandler				
Marcy Feit			1	
Michael Friedman				
Leeza Gibbons	1			
Michael Goldberg				
Nancy Milliken for Sam Hawgood	1			
Bob Klein	1			
Sherry Lansing			1	
Leonard Rome for Gerald Levey		1		
Ted Love	1			
Ed Penhoet				
Phil Pizzo				
Kenneth Burtis for Claire Pomeroy			1	
Francisco Prieto			1	
Elizabeth Fini for Puliafito	1			
Robert Quint				
John Reed				
Duane Roth		1		
Joan Samuelson				
David Serrano Sewell				
Jeff Sheehy	1			
Jonathan Shestack				
Oswald Steward				
Art Torres				1
TOTAL	9	4	4	1

Withdrawn for Substitute Motion

MOTION

To fund Early Translational Research Award application 1232 with direction to CIRM staff to work with the applicant and CIRM's grantees to optimize the models and to monitor costs

Motion Maker

Azziz

Seconded

Love

<u>MEMBER</u>	<u>YES</u>	<u>NO</u>	<u>CONFLICT</u>	<u>ABSTAIN</u>
Ricardo Azziz	1			
Robert Price for Birgeneau	1			
Floyd Bloom	1			
David Brenner				
Jacob Levine for Susan Bryant	1			
Marsha Chandler	1			
Marcy Feit			1	
Michael Friedman	1			
Leeza Gibbons	1			
Michael Goldberg				
Nancy Milliken for Sam Hawgood	1			
Bob Klein	1			
Sherry Lansing			1	
Leonard Rome for Gerald Levey	1			
Ted Love	1			
Ed Penhoet	1			
Phil Pizzo				
Kenneth Burtis for Claire Pomeroy			1	
Francisco Prieto			1	
Elizabeth Fini for Puliafito	1			
Robert Quint	1			
John Reed	1			
Duane Roth		1		
Joan Samuelson				
David Serrano Sewell	1			
Jeff Sheehy	1			
Jonathan Shestack	1			
Oswald Steward				
Art Torres	1			
TOTAL	19	1	4	0

Approved at 4/28-9/10 ICOC Meeting

To approve minutes of August 12-13, 2008, September 25, 2008, and March 12, 2009 meetings

MOTION

Motion Maker

Love

Seconded

Torres

<u>MEMBER</u>	<u>YES</u>	<u>NO</u>	<u>CONFLICT</u>	<u>ABSTAIN</u>
Ricardo Azziz				
Robert Price for Birgeneau				
Floyd Bloom				
David Brenner	Absent			
Jacob Levine for Susan Bryant				
Marsha Chandler				
Marcy Feit				
Michael Friedman				
Leeza Gibbons				
Michael Goldberg	Absent			
Nancy Milliken for Sam Hawgood				
Bob Klein				
Sherry Lansing	Absent			
Leonard Rome for Gerald Levey				
Ted Love				
Ed Penhoet				
Phil Pizzo	Absent			
Kenneth Burtis for Claire Pomeroy				
Francisco Prieto	Absent			
Elizabeth Fini for Puliafito				
Robert Quint				
John Reed				
Duane Roth				
Joan Samuelson				
David Serrano Sewell				
Jeff Sheehy				
Jonathan Shestack				
Oswald Steward	Absent			
Art Torres				
TOTAL	0	0	0	0

VOICE VOTE- CARRIED

Approved at 4/28-9/10 ICOC Meeting

To approve amendments to conflict of interest code and to direct staff to initiate process for accomplishing amendments

MOTION

Motion Maker

Torres

Seconded

Friedman

<u>MEMBER</u>	<u>YES</u>	<u>NO</u>	<u>CONFLICT</u>	<u>ABSTAIN</u>
Ricardo Azziz				
Robert Price for Birgeneau				
Floyd Bloom				
David Brenner	Absent			
Jacob Levine for Susan Bryant				
Marsha Chandler				
Marcy Feit				
Michael Friedman				
Leeza Gibbons				
Michael Goldberg	Absent			
Nancy Milliken for Sam Hawgood				
Bob Klein				
Sherry Lansing	Absent			
Leonard Rome for Gerald Levey				
Ted Love				
Ed Penhoet				
Phil Pizzo	Absent			
Kenneth Burtis for Claire Pomeroy				
Francisco Prieto	Absent			
Elizabeth Fini for Puliafito				
Robert Quint				
John Reed				
Duane Roth				
Joan Samuelson				
David Serrano Sewell				
Jeff Sheehy				
Jonathan Shestack				
Oswald Steward	Absent			
Art Torres				
TOTAL	0	0	0	0

VOICE VOTE- CARRIED

Approved at 4/28-9/10 ICOC Meeting
 Not to fund the remaining applications in Tier 2 of the Early
 Translational Research Awards

MOTION

Motion Maker

Torres

Seconded

Love

<u>MEMBER</u>	<u>YES</u>	<u>NO</u>	<u>CONFLICT</u>	<u>ABSTAIN</u>
Ricardo Azziz	1		Except	
Robert Price for Birgeneau	1		Except	
Floyd Bloom	1		Except	
David Brenner				
Jacob Levine for Susan Bryant	1			
Marsha Chandler	1		Except	
Marcy Feit	1		Except	
Michael Friedman	1		Except	
Leeza Gibbons	1			
Michael Goldberg				
Nancy Milliken for Sam Hawgood	1		Except	
Bob Klein	1			
Sherry Lansing				
Leonard Rome for Gerald Levey	1		Except	
Ted Love	1			
Ed Penhoet	1		Except	
Phil Pizzo				
Kenneth Burtis for Claire Pomeroy	1		Except	
Francisco Prieto				
Elizabeth Fini for Puliafito	1		Except	
Robert Quint	1			
John Reed	1		Except	
Duane Roth	1			
Joan Samuelson				
David Serrano Sewell	1			
Jeff Sheehy	1		Except	
Jonathan Shestack	1			
Oswald Steward				
Art Torres	1			
TOTAL	22	0	0	0

Approved at 4/28-9/10 ICOC Meeting

To direct CIRM staff to prepare a response to the FTC report on follow-on biologic drug competition noting its deficiencies, especially as related to the field of stem cell research

MOTION

Motion Maker

Azziz

Seconded

Torres

<u>MEMBER</u>	<u>YES</u>	<u>NO</u>	<u>CONFLICT</u>	<u>ABSTAIN</u>
Ricardo Azziz				
Robert Price for Birgeneau				
Floyd Bloom				
David Brenner	Absent			
Jacob Levine for Susan Bryant				
Marsha Chandler				
Marcy Feit				
Michael Friedman				
Leeza Gibbons				
Michael Goldberg	Absent			
Nancy Milliken for Sam Hawgood				
Bob Klein				
Sherry Lansing	Absent			
Leonard Rome for Gerald Levey				
Ted Love				
Ed Penhoet				
Phil Pizzo	Absent			
Kenneth Burtis for Claire Pomeroy				
Francisco Prieto	Absent			
Elizabeth Fini for Puliafito				
Robert Quint				
John Reed				
Duane Roth				
Joan Samuelson				
David Serrano Sewell				
Jeff Sheehy				
Jonathan Shestack				
Oswald Steward	Absent			
Art Torres				
TOTAL	0	0	0	0

VOICE VOTE- CARRIED

Approved at 4/28-9/10 ICOC Meeting

MOTION

To approve FY 2009-2010 budget with a 5% contingency and to direct Chair and President to report back to the Board within two weeks regarding alternatives for adequate staffing and a proposed implementation plan, including a closed session discussion of personnel

Motion Maker

Roth

Seconded

Chandler

<u>MEMBER</u>	<u>YES</u>	<u>NO</u>	<u>CONFLICT</u>	<u>ABSTAIN</u>
Ricardo Azziz	1			
Robert Price for Birgeneau	1			
Floyd Bloom	1			
David Brenner				
Jacob Levine for Susan Bryant	1			
Marsha Chandler	1			
Marcy Feit	1			
Michael Friedman	1			
Leeza Gibbons	1			
Michael Goldberg				
Nancy Milliken for Sam Hawgood	1			
Bob Klein	1			
Sherry Lansing				
Leonard Rome for Gerald Levey	1			
Ted Love	1			
Ed Penhoet	1			
Phil Pizzo				
Kenneth Burtis for Claire Pomeroy	1			
Francisco Prieto				
Elizabeth Fini for Puliafito	1			
Robert Quint	1			
John Reed	1			
Duane Roth	1			
Joan Samuelson		1		
David Serrano Sewell		1		
Jeff Sheehy		1		
Jonathan Shestack		1		
Oswald Steward				
Art Torres	1			
TOTAL	19	4	0	0