

MINUTES OF 4/28-29/09 ICOC MEETING

MAIN LOCATION:
Westin Bonaventure Hotel (4/28)
404 Figueroa Street
Los Angeles, CA

USC Keck School of Medicine(4/29)
Mayer Auditorium
1975 Zonal Avenue
Los Angeles, CA

TELEPHONIC LOCATION:
Stanford University
Clark Center, 318 Campus Drive
Stanford, CA

ValleyCare Health System
5575 West Las Positas Blvd
Pleasanton, CA

UC Davis School of Medicine
4610 X Street, Conference Room
Sacramento, CA

Ricardo Azziz	Present
Robert Birgeneau Alternate Robert Price	Present
Floyd Bloom	Present
David Brenner	Present
Susan Bryant Alternate Jacob Levin	Present
Marsha Chandler	Absent
Marcy Feit	Present
Michael Friedman	Present
Leeza Gibbons	Present
Michael Goldberg	Absent
Sam Hawgood	Present
Bob Klein	Present
Sherry Lansing	Present
Gerald Levey	Present
Ted Love	Present
Ed Penhoet	Present
Phil Pizzo	Present
Claire Pomeroy	Present
Francisco Prieto	Present
Carmen Puliafito	Present
Robert Quint	Present
John Reed Alternate Jeannie Fontana	Present
Duane Roth	Present
Joan Samuelson	Present
David Serrano Sewell	Present
Jeff Sheehy	Present

Jon Shestack	Present
Oswald Steward	Present
Art Torres	Present

I. **Agenda Item #4: Approval of Minutes**

moved to the June 2009 agenda

II. **Agenda Item #5: Approval of technical amendments to Grants Administration Policy (GAP) for Academic and Non-Profit Institutions**

The board approved the technical amendments to the GAP.

Motion:

* Ms. Lansing moved to approve the amendments

* Dr. Prieto seconded the motion

Vote:

By voice vote, the board approved the motion. Members who participated via telephone voted via a roll call vote.

III. **Agenda Item #6: Chairman's Report.**

James Harrison provided status update of the state's recent bond sale.

IV. **Agenda Item # 7: President's Report**

To see the report as presented, see this URL:

http://www.cirm.ca.gov/Agenda_4-28-09

Margaret Ferguson provided an update on CIRM's Operating Budget. John Robson provided an update on the status of CIRM's finances/ cash flow

V. **Agenda Item #8: CIRM grantee progress report monitoring**

moved to the June 2009 agenda

VI. **Agenda Item #9: Communications report, including but not limited to update on statewide education program**

Mr. Gibbons provided a report on the statewide education program, the results from the CIRM-sponsored Public Forums, the new CIRM website design, and other social media outlets (ie YouTube and Facebook)

VII. **Agenda Item #10: Consideration of recommendations from Grants Working Group on Early Translational Research Awards applications**

Board members approved funding for Tier 1 applications and rejected funding for Tier 3 applications. Tier 2 applications will be voted upon at a later meeting date.

Motion:

* Mr. Roth made a motion to fund all of Tier 1 grants subject to CIRM's standard pre-funding administrative review

* Ms. Gibbons seconded the motion

Vote:

The ICOC, via roll call vote, approved this motion.

Motion:

* Dr. Love made a motion to not fund Tier 3

* Mr. Roth seconded the motion

Vote:

The ICOC, via roll call vote, approved this motion.

VIII. **Agenda Item #12: Consideration of new scientific members for Grants Working Group**

The board approved the proposed new scientific members for the Grants Working Group

Motion:

* Dr. Bloom moved to approve the new members

* Dr. Levey seconded the motion.

Vote:

The ICOC, by voice vote, approved this motion, approving the proposed new scientific members for the Grants Working Group. Members who participated via telephone voted via a roll call vote.

To view the biographies of the new members as approved, see this URL and click on the link in Item #12. http://www.cirm.ca.gov/Agenda_4-28-09

IX. Agenda Item #13: Consideration of evaluation procedures for performance evaluation for Chair, Vice-Chair, and President.

The ICOC adopted procedures for evaluating the Chair, Vice-Chair, and President

Motion:

* Mr. Sheehy moved to approve the evaluation procedures as set for in Tab 13 with one amendment, and that is to designate the Chair and Vice Chair of the Governance Subcommittee as the Chair and Vice-Chair of the Evaluation Subcommittee.

* Dr. Pomeroy seconded the motion

Vote:

The motion did not carry

Motion:

* Dr. Prieto moved to adopt the original proposal for the Evaluation without determining who is the Chair of the committee.

* Dr. Steward seconded to motion.

Vote:

The ICOC, via roll call vote, approved this motion.

X. Agenda Item #14: Consideration of federal legislation, HR 1427 and HR 1548

The ICOC agreed to take a position on the pending legislation, but did not specify for which piece of legislation it would support.

Motion:

* Mr. Torres moved to poll the board and determine whether it wanted to take a formal position on the legislation.

* Dr. Puliafito seconded the motion.

Vote:

The ICOC, via roll call vote, approved this motion.

Motion:

* Dr. Fontana moved for the ICOC to consider and compare the principles that it would support and bring them forward to the ICOC on May 12

* Dr. Puliafito seconded the motion.

Vote:

The ICOC, via roll call vote, approved this motion.

XI. **Agenda Item #15: Consideration of Request for CIRM to co-sponsor the annual meeting of the International Society for Stem Cell Research**

Motion:

* Dr. Puliafito made a motion to co-sponsor the ISSCR conference with \$200,000 of donated funds.

* Mr. Roth seconded the motion.

XII. **Agenda Item #16: Consideration of comments on NIH draft guidelines for research utilizing human embryonic stem cells**

Dr. Lomax provided the board with an update on the recent activities to develop formal public comment to the NIH guidelines. An NIH Response Task Force will meet May 7 to develop recommendations to be presented for formal approval at a May 12 ICOC Board Teleconference.

No Vote taken

Additional Agenda Item

Agenda Item #1: Consideration of amended version of SB 471. Which would amend the California Education Code relating to stem cell research

Motion:

* Mr. Torres moved to add this item to the agenda

* Ms. Lansing seconded the motion

Vote:

The ICOC, by voice vote, approved this motion. Members who participated via telephone voted via a roll call vote.

Motion:

* Mr. Torres moves for the ICOC to approve a formal position supporting SB 471

* Ms. Lansing seconds the motion.

Vote:

The board, by voice vote, approved the motion. Members who participated via telephone voted via a roll call vote.

MOTION

To Approve Technical Amendments to
Grants Administration Policy for Academic
and Non-Profit Institutions

Motion Maker

Lansing

Seconded

Prieto

<u>MEMBER</u>	<u>YES</u>	<u>NO</u>	<u>CONFLICT</u>	<u>ABSTAIN</u>
Ricardo Azziz				
Robert Price for Robert Birgeneau				
Floyd Bloom				
David Brenner				
Jacob Levin for Susan Bryant				
Marsha Chandler	Absent			
Marcy Feit	Y (Tel)			
Michael Friedman	Absent			
Leeza Gibbons				
Michael Goldberg				
San Hawgood				
Bob Klein	Absent			
Sheery Lansing				
Gerald Levey				
Ted Love				
Ed Penhoet				
Phil Pizzo	Absent			
Claire Pomeroy	Y (Tel)			
Francisco Prieto				
Carmen Puliafito				
Robert Quint				
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed				
Duane Roth				
Joan Samuelson				
David Serrano Sewell				
Jeff Sheehy				
Jon Shestack				
Oswald Steward				
Art Torres				

TOTAL

Voice Vote- Motion Carries

MOTION

To Approve New Scientific Members for Grants Working Group

Motion Maker
Seconded

Bloom
Levey

<u>MEMBER</u>	<u>YES</u>	<u>NO</u>	<u>CONFLICT</u>	<u>ABSTAIN</u>
Ricardo Azziz				
Robert Price for Robert Birgeneau				
Floyd Bloom				
David Brenner				
Jacob Levin for Susan Bryant				
Marsha Chandler	Absent			
Marcy Feit	Y (Tel)			
Michael Friedman	Absent			
Leeza Gibbons				
Michael Goldberg	Absent			
San Hawgood				
Bob Klein	Absent			
Sherry Lansing				
Gerald Levey				
Ted Love				
Ed Penhoet				
Phil Pizzo				
Claire Pomeroy	Y (Tel)			
Francisco Prieto				
Carmen Puliafito				
Robert Quint				
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed				
Duane Roth				
Joan Samuelson				
David Serrano Sewell				
Jeff Sheehy				
Jon Shestack				
Oswald Steward				
Art Torres				

TOTAL

Voice Vote- Motion Carries

MOTION To Take Position on Biosimilar Issue

Motion Maker Torres

Seconded Penhoet

MEMBER	YES	NO	CONFLICT	ABSTAIN
Ricardo Azziz	1			
Robert Price for Robert Birgeneau				1
Floyd Bloom	1			
David Brenner	1			
Jacob Levin for Susan Bryant	1			
Marsha Chandler				
Marcy Feit	1			
Michael Friedman				
Leeza Gibbons	1			
Michael Goldberg				
San Hawgood	1			
Bob Klein	1			
Sheery Lansing	1			
Gerald Levey	1			
Ted Love	1			
Ed Penhoet	1			
Phil Pizzo				
Claire Pomeroy	1			
Francisco Prieto	1			
Carmen Puliafito	1			
Robert Quint	1			
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed	1			
Duane Roth	1			
Joan Samuelson	1			
David Serrano Sewell	1			
Jeff Sheehy				1
Jon Shestack		1		
Oswald Steward	1			
Art Torres	1			
TOTAL	22	1		2

MOTION To focus on biosimilar principles and present to ICOC on 5/12

Motion Maker Fontana

Seconded Puliafito

<u>MEMBER</u>	<u>YES</u>	<u>NO</u>	<u>CONFLICT</u>	<u>ABSTAIN</u>
Ricardo Azziz	1			
Robert Price for Robert Birgeneau	1			
Floyd Bloom	1			
David Brenner	1			
Jacob Levin for Susan Bryant	1			
Marsha Chandler				
Marcy Feit	1			
Michael Friedman				
Leeza Gibbons	1			
Michael Goldberg				
San Hawgood	1			
Bob Klein				1
Sheery Lansing				
Gerald Levey	1			
Ted Love	1			
Ed Penhoet	1			
Phil Pizzo				
Claire Pomeroy	1			
Francisco Prieto	1			
Carmen Puliafito	1			
Robert Quint	1			
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed	1			
Duane Roth				1
Joan Samuelson		1		
David Serrano Sewell		1		
Jeff Sheehy				1
Jon Shestack				
Oswald Steward	1			
Art Torres	1			
TOTAL	18	2		3

MOTION To Add Item to Agenda re SB
471

Motion Maker Torres

Seconded Lansing

MEMBER	YES	NO	CONFLICT	ABSTAIN
Ricardo Azziz	Absent			
Robert Price for Robert Birgeneau				
Floyd Bloom	Absent			
David Brenner				
Jacob Levin for Susan Bryant				
Marsha Chandler	Absent			
Marcy Feit	Y (Tel)			
Michael Friedman				
Leeza Gibbons				
Michael Goldberg	Y (Tel)			
San Hawgood	Absent			
Bob Klein				
Sheery Lansing				
Gerald Levey				
Ted Love				
Ed Penhoet				
Phil Pizzo	Y (Tel)			
Claire Pomeroy	Y (Tel)			
Francisco Prieto				
Carmen Puliafito				
Robert Quint				
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed				
Duane Roth				
Joan Samuelson				
David Serrano Sewell				
Jeff Sheehy				
Jon Shestack				
Oswald Steward	Absent			
Art Torres				

TOTAL Voice Vote- Motion Carries

MOTION

To Adopt Evaluation Procedure w/ Chair/ VC of Governance Subcommittee. as Chair/VC of Evaluation Subcommittee

Motion Maker
Seconded

Sheehy
Pomeroy

<u>MEMBER</u>	<u>YES</u>	<u>NO</u>	<u>CONFLICT</u>	<u>ABSTAIN</u>
Ricardo Azziz		1		
Robert Price for Robert Birgeneau		1		
Floyd Bloom				
David Brenner		1		
Jacob Levin for Susan Bryant		1		
Marsha Chandler				
Marcy Feit		1		
Michael Friedman	1			
Leeza Gibbons		1		
Michael Goldberg	1			
San Hawgood				
Bob Klein		1		
Sheery Lansing				1
Gerald Levey	1			
Ted Love		1		
Ed Penhoet		1		
Phil Pizzo	1			
Claire Pomeroy				1
Francisco Prieto		1		
Carmen Puliafito		1		
Robert Quint		1		
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed		1		
Duane Roth				1
Joan Samuelson		1		
David Serrano Sewell		1		
Jeff Sheehy	1			
Jon Shestack				1
Oswald Steward				1
Art Torres				1
TOTAL	5	15		6

MOTION
Motion Maker
Seconded

To Adopt Evaluation Procedure
 Steward
 Prieto

MEMBER	YES	NO	CONFLICT	ABSTAIN
Ricardo Azziz		1		
Robert Price for Robert Birgeneau	1			
Floyd Bloom				
David Brenner	1			
Jacob Levin for Susan Bryant		1		
Marsha Chandler				
Marcy Feit	1			
Michael Friedman	1			
Leeza Gibbons	1			
Michael Goldberg	1			
San Hawgood				
Bob Klein	1			
Sheery Lansing	1			
Gerald Levey	1			
Ted Love	1			
Ed Penhoet	1			
Phil Pizzo	1			
Claire Pomeroy	1			
Francisco Prieto	1			
Carmen Puliafito		1		
Robert Quint		1		
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed	1			
Duane Roth				1
Joan Samuelson	1			
David Serrano Sewell	1			
Jeff Sheehy		1		
Jon Shestack				1
Oswald Steward	1			
Art Torres				1
TOTAL	18	5		3

MOTION
Motion Maker
Seconded

To Approve Early Translational
 Research applications in Tier 1
 Roth
 Gibbons

MEMBER	YES	NO	CONFLICT	ABSTAIN
Ricardo Azziz	1		Except	
Robert Price for Robert Birgeneau	1		Except	
Floyd Bloom				
David Brenner	1		Except	
Jacob Levin for Susan Bryant	1		Except	
Marsha Chandler				
Marcy Feit	1		Except	
Michael Friedman	1		Except	
Leeza Gibbons	1			
Michael Goldberg	1		Except	
San Hawgood				
Bob Klein	1			
Sheery Lansing				
Gerald Levey	1		Except	
Ted Love	1			
Ed Penhoet	1			
Phil Pizzo	1		Except	
Claire Pomeroy				
Francisco Prieto	1		Except	
Carmen Puliafito	1		Except	
Robert Quint	1			
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed	1		Except	
Duane Roth	1			
Joan Samuelson	1			
David Serrano Sewell				
Jeff Sheehy	1		Except	
Jon Shestack	1			
Oswald Steward	1		Except	
Art Torres	1			
TOTAL	23			

MOTION
Motion Maker
Seconded

Not to Fund Early Translational
 Research applications in Tier III
 Roth
 Gibbons

MEMBER	YES	NO	CONFLICT	ABSTAIN
Ricardo Azziz	1		Except	
Robert Price for Robert Birgeneau	1		Except	
Floyd Bloom				
David Brenner	1		Except	
Jacob Levin for Susan Bryant	1		Except	
Marsha Chandler				
Marcy Feit	1		Except	
Michael Friedman	1		Except	
Leeza Gibbons	1			
Michael Goldberg	1		Except	
San Hawgood				
Bob Klein	1			
Sheery Lansing				
Gerald Levey	1		Except	
Ted Love	1			
Ed Penhoet	1		Except	
Phil Pizzo	1		Except	
Claire Pomeroy	1		Except	
Francisco Prieto	1		Except	
Carmen Puliafito	1		Except	
Robert Quint	1			
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed	1		Except	
Duane Roth	1			
Joan Samuelson	1			
David Serrano Sewell				
Jeff Sheehy	1		Except	
Jon Shestack	1			
Oswald Steward	1		Except	
Art Torres				
TOTAL	23			

MOTION To authorize co-sponsorship of ISSCR Conference of \$200,000 from donated funds

Motion Maker Torres

Seconded Lansing

<u>MEMBER</u>	<u>YES</u>	<u>NO</u>	<u>CONFLICT</u>	<u>ABSTAIN</u>
Ricardo Azziz				
Robert Price for Robert Birgeneau				
Floyd Bloom				
David Brenner				
Jacob Levin for Susan Bryant				
Marsha Chandler				
Marcy Feit	Y (Tel)			
Michael Friedman				
Leeza Gibbons				
Michael Goldberg	Y (Tel)			
San Hawgood				
Bob Klein				
Sheery Lansing				
Gerald Levey				
Ted Love				
Ed Penhoet				
Phil Pizzo	Y (Tel)			
Claire Pomeroy	Y (Tel)			
Francisco Prieto				
Carmen Puliafito				
Robert Quint				
Jeannie Fontana for John Reed				
Duane Roth				
Joan Samuelson				
David Serrano Sewell				
Jeff Sheehy				
Jon Shestack				
Oswald Steward				
Art Torres				
TOTAL	Voice Vote- Motion Carries			