# ICOC/Application Subcommittee Meeting August 25th, 2016 11:00am to 12:00pm

# Main Location

CIRM 1999 Harrison Street Suite 1650, Oakland, CA 94612

# Other Locations:

- 1180 Veterans Blvd, South San Francisco 94080
- 2619 Montclair Street San Diego, CA 92104
- 2007 Redwood Rd., Napa, CA.
- 170 Harbor Way, South San Francisco, 94080
- 4005 N. Fresno Street Fresno, CA 93726
- 10996 Torreyana Road, Suite 200 San Diego, CA 92121
- 8170 Laguna Bl, Elk Grove 95758
- 15775 Gum Tree Lane Los Gatos 95032
- 3440 Viking Drive Sacramento, CA 95827
- Room 1105, Gillespie Neuroscience Research Facility
- 837 Health Science Road Irvine, CA 92697-4292
- 575 Market Street, San Francisco 94103 -Site No Longer Available
- 9301 Wilshire Blvd. Ste. 507 Beverly Hills CA 90210

# **Open Session**

Member	Attendance
Anne-Marie Duliege	Р
David Higgins	Р
Steve Juelsgaard	Р
Sherry Lansing	NP
Kathy LaPorte	Р
Shlomo Melmed	Р
Lauren Miller	Р
Adriana Padilla	Р
Joe Panetta	Р
Francisco Prieto	Р
Robert Quint	Р
Al Rowlett	Р
Jeff Sheehy	Р
Os Steward	Р
Jonathan Thomas	Р
Art Torres	Р
Diane Winokur	NP
	15 P
	2 NP

# Agenda Item #3

Consideration of applications submitted in response to CLIN 1: Partnering Opportunity for Late Stage Preclinical Projects and CLIN 2: Partnering Opportunity for Clinical Trial Stage Projects. CLIN2-08839 Public Summary

#### Motion #1

- Motion made by Steve Juelsgaard to Assign score of 2 to CLIN2-08839 application
- Motion seconded by Art Torres

## Vote

- The ICOC Application Subcommittee by individual voice vote approved the motion
- 8 YES; 6 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 3 CONFLICTS

## **Closed Session**

# Agenda Item #4

Discussion of confidential intellectual property or work product, prepublication data, financial information, confidential scientific research or data, and other proprietary information relating to applications CLIN 1: Partnering Opportunity for Late Stage Preclinical Projects and CLIN 2: Partnering Opportunity for Clinical Trial Stage Projects, (Health & Safety Code 125290.30(f) (3) (B) and (C)).

No Closed Session taken at this meeting

## Agenda Item #5

**Public Comment** 

No Public Comment Taken

Application Subcommittee	7	
Meeting		
August 25, 2016		
		VOTE
		MOTION 1
		Maker: Juelsgaard
		Second: Torres
MEMBERS	ATTENDANCE	Assign score of 2 to CLIN2 08839 application
Anne-Marie Duliege	Р	Y
David Higgins	Р	Y
Steve Juelsgaard	Р	Y
Sherry Lansing	NP	
Kathy LaPorte	Р	N
Shlomo Melmed	Р	
Lauren Miller	Р	Y
Adriana Padilla	Р	N
Joe Panetta	Р	N
Francisco Prieto	Р	N
Robert Quint	Р	Y
Al Rowlett	Р	Y
Jeff Sheehy	Р	N
Os Steward	Р	Y
Jonathan Thomas	Р	N
Art Torres	Р	Y
Diane Winokur	NP	
	15 P	8 Y
	2 NP	6 N
		0 A
		0 C
		Approved by a vote of 8-
	$\exists$	
LEGEND		
Attendance		
NP – Not Present	_	
P – Present		
Votes		
A – Abstain C – Conflict	_	
N – No	$\dashv$	
VV – Voice Vote	$\dashv$	
vv – voice vote	$\dashv$	
Y – Yes Y/C – Yes, except for those which I have	: a	
conflict		

# ICOC Meeting Draft Minutes September 21, 2016

# **Main Location**

4240 La Jolla Village Drive, La Jolla, CA 92037

## Other Locations

- 170 Harbor Way, South San Francisco, 94080
- 1701 Divisadero St., Suite 426, San Francisco, CA 94143
- 3440 Viking Drive, Sacramento, CA 95827
- 8170 Laguna Bl, Elk Grove 95758
- 15775 Gum Tree Lane, Los Gatos, 95032
- 1021 NE Grand Ave. Portland, OR 97232
- 71 Boulevard du Général de Gaulle 06230 Saint-Jean-Cap-Ferrat
- 1 Bungtown Rd, Cold Spring Harbor, NY 11724

Member	Attendance
Ken Burtis	Р
Deborah Deas	Р
Jack Dixon	P (tel.)
Anne-Marie Duliege	Р
Howard Federoff	NP
Elizabeth Fini	Р
Michael Friedman	NP
Judy Gasson	Р
David Higgins	P (tel.)
Steve Juelsgaard	Р
Sherry Lansing	NP
Kathy LaPorte	P (tel.)
Bert Lubin	Р
Shlomo Melmed	Р
Lauren Miller	NP
Lloyd Minor	NP
Adriana Padilla	Р
Joe Panetta	NP
Francisco Prieto	P (tel.)
Robert Quint	P (tel.)
Al Rowlett	P (tel.)
Jeff Sheehy	Р
Os Steward	P (tel.)
Jonathan Thomas	Р
Art Torres	Р

Kristina Vuori	Р
Diane Winokur	Р
Bruce Wintroub	NP
	21 P
	6 NP

# Agenda Item #4

Chairman's Report

Report given by Jon Thomas

# Agenda Item #5

President's Report

Report given by Randy Mills

## PROPOSED CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS 6-10

# Agenda Item #6

Consideration of appointment of new scientific members to the Grants Working Group

# Agenda Item #7

Consideration of final adoption of amendments to the Scientific and Medical Accountability Standards.

# Agenda Item #8

Consideration of amendments to Business Meeting Expenditure Policy.

# Agenda Item #9

Consideration of minutes for March, April, May, June and July meetings.

# Agenda Item #10

Consideration of final adoption of Grants Administration Policy for the Discovery, Translational and Education programs.

## Motion #2

- Motion made by Art Torres to Approve consent calendar items (new scientific members, MES
  amendments, Business Meeting Expenditure Policy, Minutes for March, April, May, June and July)
- Motion seconded by Jeff Sheehy

#### Vote

- The ICOC voice vote approved the motion
- 7 YES; 2 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 0 CONFLICTS Participants on the Phone

# Motion #3

- Motion made by Jeff Sheehy to Approve DT&E GAP.
- Motion seconded by Art Torres.

# Vote

- The ICOC voice vote approved the motion.
- 6 YES; 0 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 0 CONFLICTS

# **ACTION ITEMS**

# Agenda Item #11

Consideration of amendments to the Grants Working Group Bylaws

Presented by James Harrison

## Motion #4

- Motion made by Jeff Sheehy to Approve amendments to GWG bylaws, with exception that all INFR
  applications going forward will be scored based on CLIN scoring system
- Motion seconded by Kathy LaPorte

## Vote

- The ICOC voice vote approved the motion
- 6 YES; 2 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 0 CONFLICTS Participants on the Phone

# Agenda Item #12

Consideration of policy for CIRM research budget allocation

Presented by Scott Tocher

## Motion #5

- Motion made by Steve Juelsgaard to Approve Research Budget Allocation Policy
- Motion seconded by Jack Dixon

## Vote

- The ICOC voice vote approved the motion
- 6 YES; 2 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 0 CONFLICTS Participants on the Phone

# Agenda Item #13

Consideration of ATP3 review process

Presented by Scott Tocher

## Motion #6

- Motion made by Steve Juelsgaard to Approve ATP3 Review Process
- Motion seconded by Deborah Deas

## Vote

- The ICOC voice vote approved the motion
- 5 YES; 2 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 0 CONFLICTS Participants on the Phone

# Agenda Item #14

Consideration of applications submitted in response to CLIN 1: Partnering Opportunity for Late Stage Preclinical Projects.

Presented by Gil Sambrano

## Motion #1

- Motion made by Steve Juelsgaard to Accept recommendation to approve funding for CLIN1-09230
- Motion seconded by Diane Winokur

## Vote

- The ICOC Application Subcommittee voice vote approved the motion
- 12 YES; 0 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 1 CONFLICTS

## Agenda Item #15

Consideration of applications submitted in response to the INFR: Translating Center. - ITEM POSTPONED

• No action taken on this item

# Agenda Item #16

Consideration of amendments to CIRM Travel Policy.

Presented by Chila Silva-Martin

## Motion #7

- Motion made by Art Torres to Approve amendments to Travel Policy
- Motion seconded by Francisco Prieto

## Vote

- The ICOC voice vote approved the motion
- 4 YES; 0 NO; 1 ABSTENTION; 0 CONFLICTS Participants on the Phone

## **CLOSED SESSION**

# Agenda Item #17

Discussion of confidential intellectual property or work product, prepublication data, financial information, confidential scientific research or data, and other proprietary information relating to applications CLIN 1: Partnering Opportunity for Late Stage Preclinical Projects, and INFR: Translating Center. (Health & Safety Code 125290.30(f) (3) (B) and (C)).

No Closed Session taken at this meeting

## **DISCUSSION ITEMS**

# Agenda Item #18

Discussion of Programmatic review of applications

Discussion led by Jeff Sheehy

# Agenda Item #19

Clinical Program updates

Discussion led by Maria Millan

# Agenda Item #20

Public comment. The Committee will accept public testimony on any matter under its jurisdiction that is not on the agenda, but the Committee cannot act on any such matter at this meeting

No public comment

Application Subcommittee	7	
Meeting		
September 21, 2016		
		VOTE
		MOTION 1
		Maker: Juelsgaard
		Second: Winukur
MEMBERS	ATTENDANCE	Accept recommendation to approve funding for CLIN1-09230
		V
Anne-Marie Duliege	P (tol.)	Y
David Higgins Steve Juelsgaard	P (tel.)	Y
Sherry Lansing	NP	C
Kathy LaPorte	P (tel.)	Y
Lauren Miller	NP	'
Adriana Padilla	P	Υ
Joe Panetta	NP	·
Francisco Prieto	P (tel.)	Υ
Robert Quint	P (tel.)	Y
Al Rowlett	P (tel.)	Y
Jeff Sheehy	P	Y
Os Steward	P (tel.)	Υ
Jonathan Thomas	Р	Y
Art Torres	Р	Y
Diane Winokur	Р	
	13 P	12 Y
	3 NP	0 N
		0 A
		1 C
		Approved
LEGEND Attendance		
NP – Not Present	-	
P – Present	+	
Votes		
A – Abstain	-	
C – Conflict	1	
N – No	┪	
VV – Voice Vote	1	
Y – Yes	┪	
Y/C – Yes, except for those which I have a		
conflict	···	

ICOC Meeting	
September 21, 2016	

		_					
		VOTE					
				<u> </u>	JOIE		1
		MOTION 2	MOTION 3	MOTION 4	MOTION 5	MOTION 6	MOTION 7
		Maker: Torres	Maker: Sheehy	Maker: Sheehy	Maker: Juelsgaard	Maker: Juelsgaard	Maker: Torres
		Second: Sheehy	Second: Torres	Second: Laporte	Second: Dixon	Second: Deas	Second: Prieto
MEMBERS	ATTENDANCE	Approve consent calendar items (new scientific members, MES amendments, Business Meeting Expenditure Policy, Minutes for March, April, May, June and July)	Approve DT&E GAP	Approve amendments to GWG bylaws, with exception that all INFR applications going forward will be scored based on CLIN scoring system	Approve Research Budget Allocation Policy	Approve ATP3 Review Process	Approve amendments to Travel Policy
Ken Burtis	Р						
Deborah Deas	Р						
Jack Dixon	P (tel.)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Anne-Marie Duliege	P						
Howard Federoff	NP						
Elizabeth Fini	P						
Michael Friedman	NP						
Judy Gasson	Р						
David Higgins	P (tel.)	Y	Υ				
Steve Juelsgaard	Р						
Sherry Lansing	NP						
Kathy LaPorte	P (tel.)	Y	Υ	Y	Y		
Bert Lubin	Р						
Shlomo Melmed	P						
Lauren Miller	NP						
Lloyd Minor	NP						
Adriana Padilla	P						
Joe Panetta	NP						
Francisco Prieto	P (tel.)	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ
Robert Quint	P (tel.)	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Α
Al Rowlett	P (tel.)	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ
Jeff Sheehy	Р						
Os Steward	P (tel.)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Jonathan Thomas	Р						
Art Torres	Р						
Kristina Vuori	Р						
Diane Winokur	Р						
Bruce Wintroub	NP						
	21 P	7 Y	7 Y	6 Y	6 Y	5 Y	4 Y
	6 NP	0 N	0 N	0 N	0 N	0 N	0 N
	1	0 A 0 C	0 A 0 C	0 A 0 C	0 A 0 C	0 A 0 C	1 A 0 C
	1	Approved on vv	Approved on vv	Approved on vv	Approved on vv	Approved on vv	Approved on vv
	4	Approved on VV	Approved on W	Approved on VV	Approved on vV	Approved on VV	Approved on W

LEGEND	
Attendance	
NP - Not Present	
P – Present	
Votes	
A – Abstain	
C – Conflict	
N – No	
VV - Voice Vote	
Y – Yes	
Y/C - Yes, except for those which I have a	

# ICOC Application Subcommittee Meeting Draft Minutes October 19<sup>th</sup>, 2016

## **Main Location**

CIRM 1999 Harrison Street Suite 1650, Oakland, CA 94612

## Other Locations:

- 2619 Montclair Street, San Diego, CA 92104
- 2007 Redwood Road, Napa, CA 94558
- 170 Harbor Way, South San Francisco, 94080
- 4005 N. Fresno Street, Fresno, CA 93726
- 320 West Yanonali Street, Santa Barbara, CA 93101 SITE NO LONGER AVAILABLE
- 15775 Gum Tree Lane Los Gatos 95032
- 3440 Viking Drive, Sacramento, CA 95827
- Room 1105, Gillespie Neuroscience Research Facility, 837 Health Science Road, Irvine, CA 92697-4292
- 575 Market Street, San Francisco, CA 94103
- Hyatt Regency, 350 N. High Street, Columbus, OH 43215.
- 11440 San Vicente, Los Angeles CA 90049

Members	Attendance
David Brenner	NP
Ken Burtis	NP
Deborah Deas	NP
Anne-Marie Duliege	NP
Howard Federoff	NP
Michael Friedman	NP
Judy Gasson	NP
Sam Hawgood	NP
David Higgins	Р
Steve Juelsgaard	Р
Sherry Lansing	NP
Kathy LaPorte	Р
Bert Lubin	NP
Shlomo Melmed	NP
Lauren Miller	Р
Lloyd Minor	NP
Adriana Padilla	Р
Joe Panetta	NP
Francisco Prieto	NP
Carmen Puliafito	NP
Robert Quint	Р
Al Rowlett	Р

Agenda Item #8 ICOC Meeting December 13th, 2016

Jeff Sheehy	Р
Os Steward	Р
Jonathan Thomas	Р
Art Torres	NP
Kristiina Vuori	Р
Diane Winokur	Р
	12 P
	16 NP

# Agenda Item #3

Consideration of applications submitted in response to INFR2: Partnering Opportunity to create a CIRM Translating Center.

Presented by Gil Sambrano

#### Motion #1

- Motion made by Art Torres to Approve Translating Center Application INFR2-09298 and do not approve Application INFR2-09233
- Motion seconded by Oswald Steward

#### Vote

- The ICOC Application Subcommittee by individual voice vote approved the motion
- 12 YES; 0 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 0 CONFLICTS

# Agenda Item #4

Consideration of applications submitted in response to CLIN 2: Partnering Opportunity for Clinical Trial Stage Projects. Item Withdrawn

# **Closed Session**

## Agenda Item #5

Discussion of confidential intellectual property or work product, prepublication data, financial information, confidential scientific research or data, and other proprietary information relating to INFR2: Partnering Opportunity to Create a CIRM Translating Center and CLIN 2: Partnering Opportunity for Clinical Trial Stage Projects, (Health & Safety Code 125290.30(f) (3) (B) and (C)).

No Closed Session Taken

# Agenda Item #6

**Public Comment** 

No Public Comment Made

ICOC Meeting		
October 19, 2016		
		VOTE
		MOTION 1
		Maker: Torres
		Second: Steward
		Approve Translating Center Application INFR2-09298 and do not approve
MEMBERS	ATTENDANCE	Application INFR2-09233
David Brenner	NP	
Ken Burtis	NP	
Deborah Deas	NP	
Anne-Marie Duliege	NP	
Howard Federoff	NP	
Michael Friedman	NP	
Judy Gasson	NP	
Sam Hawgood	NP	
David Higgins	Р	Y
Steve Juelsgaard	Р	Y
Sherry Lansing	NP	
Kathy LaPorte	Р	Y
Bert Lubin	NP	
Shlomo Melmed	NP	
Lauren Miller	Р	Y
Lloyd Minor	NP	
Adriana Padilla	Р	Y
Joe Panetta	NP	
Francisco Prieto	NP	
Carmen Puliafito	NP	
Robert Quint	Р	Y
Al Rowlett	Р	Y
Jeff Sheehy	Р	Y
Os Steward	Р	Y
Jonathan Thomas	Р	Y
Art Torres	NP	Y
Kristiina Vuori	Р	
Diane Winokur	Р	Y
	12 P	12 Y
	16 NP	0 N
		0 A
	$\dashv$	0 C
		Approved

LEGEND Attendance

Votes

Y/C - Yes, except for those which I have a

NP – Not Present P – Present

A – Abstain
C – Conflict
N – No
VV – Voice Vote

conflict

# ICOC Meeting Draft Minutes November 17<sup>th</sup>, 2016

# Main Location

• CIRM 1999 Harrison Street Suite 1650, Oakland, CA 94612

# Other Locations:

- 2619 Montclair Street San Diego, CA 92104
- 2007 Redwood Rd., Napa, CA.
- 170 Harbor Way, South San Francisco, 94080
- 9301 Wilshire Blvd. Suite. 507 Beverly Hills CA 90210 SITE NO LONGER AVAILABLE
- 4005 N. Fresno Street Fresno, CA 93726
- 10996 Torreyana Road, Suite 200 San Diego, CA 92121
- 8170 Laguna Blvd, Elk Grove 95758
- 15775 Gum Tree Lane Los Gatos 95032
- 3440 Viking Drive Sacramento, CA 95827
- Room 1105, Gillespie Neuroscience Research Facility 837 Health Science Road Irvine, CA 92697-4292
- 1601 Exposition Blvd. Sacramento Ca 95815
- 765 Market Street #31D, San Francisco, CA 94103
- 61 Street, Marks Place, New York, NY 10003
- 136 Roanoke Street, San Francisco, 94131

MEMBERS	ATTENDANCE
Anne-Marie Duliege	NP
David Higgins	Р
Steve Juelsgaard	Р
Sherry Lansing	NP
Kathy LaPorte	Р
Lauren Miller	Р
Adriana Padilla	Р
Joe Panetta	Р
Francisco Prieto	Р
Robert Quint	Р
Al Rowlett	Р
Jeff Sheehy	Р
Os Steward	NP
Jonathan Thomas	Р
Art Torres	NP
Diane Winokur	Р
	12 P
	4 NP

# Agenda Item #3

Consideration of applications submitted in response to the Partnering Opportunity for Translational Research Projects.

Presented by Gil Sambrano

## Motions #1

- Motion made by Kathy LaPorte to fund CLIN2-09339
- Motion seconded by Steve Juelsgaard

## Vote

- The ICOC Application Subcommittee by individual voice vote approved the motion
- 12 YES; 0 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 1 CONFLICTS

## Motions #2

- Motion made by Francisco Prieto to fund CLIN2-09444
- Motion seconded by Steve Juelsgaard

## Vote

- The ICOC Application Subcommittee by individual voice vote approved the motion
- 11 YES; 1 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 2 CONFLICTS

# Motions #3

- Motion made by Francisco Prieto to fund CLIN2-09577
- Motion seconded by David Higgins

## Vote

- The ICOC Application Subcommittee by individual voice vote approved the motion
- 12 YES; 0 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 0 CONFLICTS

# Agenda Item #4

Consideration of applications submitted in response to CLIN 2: Partnering Opportunity for Clinical Trial Stage Projects.

Presented by Gil Sambrano

# Motion #4

- Motion made by Al Rowlett Do not fund TRAN applications in Tier 2
- Motion seconded by David Higgins

## Vote

- The ICOC Application Subcommittee by individual voice vote approved the motion
- 10 YES; 0 NO; 1 ABSTENTION; 3 CONFLICTS

# Motion #5

- Motion made by Steve Juelsgaard to Fund applications at rate of 90.6% of requested budget provided that applicant agrees to fund remaining 9.4%, if all four applications in Tier 1 are approved
- Motion seconded by Francisco Prieto

## Vote

- The ICOC Application Subcommittee by individual voice vote approved the motion
- 6 YES; 3 NO; 1 ABSTENTION; 2 CONFLICTS

#### Motion #6

- Motion made by Francisco Prieto to fund TRAN1-09292
- Motion seconded by David Higgins

## Vote

- The ICOC Application Subcommittee by individual voice vote approved the motion
- 10 YES; 0 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 2 CONFLICTS

## Motion #7

- Motion made by Adriana Padilla to fund TRAN1-09394
- Motion seconded by Al Rowlett

#### Vote

- The ICOC Application Subcommittee by individual voice vote approved the motion
- 10 YES; 0 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 2 CONFLICTS

## Motion #8

- Motion made by Jeff Sheehy not to fund TRAN1-09288
- Motion seconded by Francisco Prieto

#### Vote

- The ICOC Application Subcommittee by individual voice did not approve the motion
- 3 YES; 8 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 0 CONFLICTS

## Motion #9

- Motion made by Kathy LaPorte to fund TRAN1-09270
- Motion seconded by Francisco Prieto

#### Vote

- No Quorum for the Vote
- 9 YES; 1 NO; 0 ABSTENTION; 0 CONFLICTS

# Agenda Item #5

Discussion of confidential intellectual property or work product, prepublication data, financial information, confidential scientific research or data, and other proprietary information relating to applications submitted in response to the Partnering Opportunity for Translational Research Projects, and CLIN 2: Partnering Opportunity for Clinical Trial Stage Projects (Health & Safety Code 125290.30(f) (3) (B) and (C)).

• No Closed Session taken at this meeting

# Agenda Item #6

Public Comment.

No Public Comment made at this time.

Application Subcommittee	
Meeting	
November 17, 2016	

		VOTE								
	VOIE									
		MOTION 1	MOTION 2	MOTION 3	MOTION 4	MOTION 5	MOTION 6	MOTION 7	MOTION 8	MOTION 9
		Maker: LaPorte	Maker: Prieto	Maker: Prieto	Maker: Rowlett	Maker: Juelsgaard	Maker: Prieto	Maker: Padilla	Maker: Sheehy	Maker: LaPorte
		Second: Juelsgaard	Second: Juelsgaard	Second: Higgins	Second: Higgins	Second: Prieto	Second: Higgins	Second: Rowlett	Second: Prieto	Second: Prieto
MEMBERS	ATTENDANCE	Fund CLIN2-09339	Fund CLIN2-09444	Fund CLIN2-09577	Do not fund TRAN applications in Tier 2	Fund applications at rate of 90.6% of requested budget provided that applicant agrees to fund remaining 9.4%, if all four applications in Tier 1 are approved	Fund TRAN1-09292	Fund TRAN1-09394	Do not fund TRAN1-09288	Fund TRAN1-09270
Anne-Marie Duliege	NP.									
David Higgins	D D		Y	V	Y	Y	Y	V	N	
Steve Juelsgaard	P	Y	Ÿ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y
Sherry Lansing	NP	c	c		C	C	c	c		
Kathy LaPorte	Р	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y
Lauren Miller	Р	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	N	Y
Adriana Padilla	Р	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Υ	N	Y
Joe Panetta	Р	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	N	Y	Υ	N	Υ
Francisco Prieto	Р	Υ	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y
Robert Quint	P	Y	N	Y	A	A	Y	Υ	N	N
Al Rowlett	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	N	Y
Jeff Sheehy	P	Y	Y	Y	С	С	С	С	Y	
Os Steward	NP				С					
Jonathan Thomas	P	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	N	Y	Υ	Y	Y
Art Torres	NP		С							
Diane Winokur	Р	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ					
	12 P	12 Y	11 Y	12 Y	10 Y	6 Y	10 Y	10 Y	3 Y	9 Y
	4 NP	0 N	1 N	0 N	0 N	3 N	0 N	0 N	8 N	1 N
		0 A	0 A	0 A	1 A	1 A	0 A	0 A	0 A	0 A
		1 C	2 C	0 C	3 C	2 C	2 C	2 C	0 C	0 C
		Approved	Approved	Approved	Approved	Approved	Approved	Approved	Not Approved	No Quorum

LEGEND							
Attendance							
NP - Not Present							
P – Present							
Votes							
A – Abstain							
C - Conflict							
N – No							
VV – Voice Vote							
Y – Yes							
Y/C - Yes, except for those which I have a conflict							