

DRAFT MINUTES OF 3/15-16/07 ICOC MEETING

**Cedars-Sinai Medical Center
Harvey Morse Conference Center
South Professional Tower
8700 Beverly Blvd.
Los Angeles, CA 90048**

Ricardo Azziz	Present
David Baltimore	Present
Robert Birgeneau & Alternate Bob Price	Present
David Brenner	Present
Susan V. Bryant	Present
Marcy Feit	Absent
Michael A. Friedman	Present
Michael Goldberg	Present
Brian E. Henderson	Present
David A. Kessler	Present
Robert Klein	Present
Sherry Lansing	Present
Gerald S. Levey	Present
Ted W. Love	Present
Richard A. Murphy	Present
Tina S. Nova	Present
Ed Penhoet	Present
Philip A. Pizzo	Present
Claire Pomeroy	Present
Francisco J. Prieto	Present
John C. Reed Alternate Jeannie Fontana	Present
Duane Roth	Present
Joan Samuelson	Present
David Serrano Sewell	Absent
Jeff Sheehy	Present
Jonathan Shestack	Present
Oswald Steward	Present
Janet Wright	Present

Agenda Item # 5: Chairman's Report.

Chairman Klein spoke briefly about the importance of recognizing our partnership with the state legislature in this enterprise and local governments. He let everyone know we that during the meeting the next morning, Assembly Speaker Fabian Nunez and Los Angeles Mayor Villaraigosa would join us to show their ongoing support for the CIRM and its efforts.

Mr. Klein reminded ICOC members and let the public know staff had gone through extensive conflicts of interest identification procedures and that, as was done at the February 2007 ICOC meeting, there would be an announcement of any conflicts before consideration of any of the Comprehensive Grant applications, and before consideration of the SEED Grant applications carried over to this meeting from the last one. He provided detail on the difference between an actual conflict and a self-elected abstention by an ICOC member wanting to avoid even the appearance of a conflict when no disqualifying conflict exists.

Chairman Klein then provided background information on the issues around OMB circulars A21 and 110, which create limitations on access to equipment and materials purchased or created with federal funds. The Legislative subcommittee, and a future meeting, will discuss working with institutions around California to develop a unified approach to these matters for all California institutions.

Agenda Item # 6: President's Report.

President Hall highlighted the recent announcement that Yamanaka, one of the leading stem cell researchers in Japan, will be joining the Gladstone Institutes, which is a coup for the Gladstone and for California to have a scientist of this stature coming to join the effort here.

In an update on CIRM personnel, Dr. Hall updated the ICOC on the successful recruitment of Tamar Pachter as General Counsel, the hiring of Dennis Butler as Technology Officer to manage day-to-day IT, and the recent hire of Douglas Guillen as Office Manager.

Dr. Hall reported on status of the Shared Facilities RFA, including that the CIRM had received 22 applications in response to this RFA.

Providing details on the status of two different audits, Dr. Hall reminded the ICOC that by state law, the CIRM must have an annual financial audit, and that the one for the fiscal year ending June 30th 2006 had been completed and would be reported on directly to the ICOC at the next meeting. With regard to the Performance Audit done by the Bureau of State Audits, Dr. Hall updated the ICOC on the audit report released on February 27th, with 12 recommendations, to which the CIRM made a written response. He informed the

Agenda Item # 4 C
6/4-5/07 ICOC Meeting

ICOC that we are to respond on progress with respect to the BSA's recommendations 60 days after the release of their report, six months after and one year after. Each ICOC member received a copy of the published report, and as with all BSA audits, it is available to the public on the Web.

Dr. Hall updated the ICOC on recent work by Geoff Lomax, officer for the Medical and Ethical Standards Working Group, organizing two regional workshops, one in Northern California and one in Southern California, for the purpose of discussing and clarifying our regulations and to get feedback from the institutions required to follow the regulations.

Agenda Item # 7: Consideration of appointment of new scientific members and new alternate scientific members of the Grants Review Working Group.

Motion:

- Dr. Baltimore made a motion to approve the appointment of current Working Group alternate scientific member Jim Roberts as a new permanent scientific member of the Working Group.
- Dr. Wright seconded the motion.

Vote:

- This motion carried.

Motion:

- Dr. Henderson moved for approval of the proposed additional alternate members of the Working Group.
- Mr. Roth seconded the motion.

Vote:

- This motion carried.

Motion:

- Dr. Levey moved for approval of Dr. Jeff Bulte, just approved as a new alternate member to the Working Group in the previous motion, now as a permanent scientific member of the Working Group.
- Dr. Bryant seconded the motion.

Vote:

- This motion carried.

Agenda Item # 8: Consideration of report and potential actions from public session of Grants Review Working Group meeting of January 8, 2007, including:

- a. Recommendation that the ICOC amend the Grants Review Working Group bylaws to allow the Chair of the working group to designate a scientific member to serve as alternate Chairperson in the Chair's absence during scientific review.**

Motion:

- Dr. Henderson moved for approval of the Working Group's recommendation that the Working Group Chair be allowed to designate a scientific member of the Working Group to serve as alternate Chairperson in the Chair's absence during a scientific review.
- Dr. Love seconded the motion.

Vote:

- This motion carried.

- b. Makes no recommendation regarding designation of an ICOC patient advocate member of the working group by the Vice-Chair to serve as alternate Vice-Chairperson in his or her absence.**

Motion:

- Ms. Samuelson made a motion to adopt a procedure allowing the Vice-Chair of the Working Group to designate a patient advocate member of the Working Group to serve as alternate Vice-Chairperson in his or her absence during a Grants Review Working Group meeting.
- Dr. Wright seconded the motion.

Vote:

- This motion carried.

- c. Makes no recommendation regarding designation of other patient advocate members of the ICOC to serve as alternates in the absence of any of the ICOC patient advocate members of the Grants Review Working Group.**

Motion:

- Ms. Samuelson made a motion to approve the allowance of other patient advocate members of the ICOC to serve as alternates at a meeting of the Grants Review Working Group in the absence of any of the ICOC patient advocate members of

- the Grants Review Working Group, at the request of a patient advocate on the Working Group who will be absent.
- Dr. Wright seconded the motion.

Vote:

- This motion carried.

Agenda Item # 9: Consideration of amendment to Conflict of Interest Policy for the Grants Review Working Group to clarify applicability to specialist members assisting the working group.

Motion:

- Mr. Roth moved for approval of the amendment to the Conflict of Interest Policy for the Grants Review Working Group to clarify applicability to specialist members.
- Dr. Pomeroy seconded the motion.

Vote:

- This motion carried; the amendment was approved.

Agenda Item # 10: Continuation of consideration of Grants Working Group's recommendations regarding Dr. Leon J. Thal SEED Grant applications.

Motion:

- Mr. Roth made a motion to approve for funding SEED Grant application 308
- Dr. Prieto seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion carried.

Motion:

- Mr. Roth made a motion to approve for funding SEED Grant application 247.
- Dr. Pomeroy seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion carried.

Motion:

- Dr. Wright made a motion to permanently close off funding for SEED Grants remaining in Tier 2 and those in Tier 3.
- Mr. Shestack seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion carried.

Agenda Item # 11: Consideration of Grants Review Working Group's recommendations regarding Comprehensive Grant applications.

Mr. Sheehy provided an overview of the Working Group's task and recommendations with regard to the Comprehensive Grant applications. He informed the ICOC that the Working Group reviewed 70 applications, working in tandem with 22 outside experts who dialed in to the meeting for discussion of specific applications. They were working with an \$80 million pool of funding.

The Working Group placed the applications into 3 tiers, by way of first scoring them and then conducting a programmatic review. The Working Group recommended that the ICOC fund the applications in Tier One. There were 25 in Tier One based on scientific scoring, and 4 more were brought into Tier One during the programmatic review, for a total of 29 grants presented to the ICOC in Tier One and a funding total of \$74.6 million.

After funding Tier One, the Working Group recommended that the ICOC take another look at the SEED Grant applications before looking at the Tier Two Comprehensive Grant applications. They felt the overall quality level of the SEED grant was high enough to justify funding more of them before funding more Comprehensive grants at this time.

Dr. Hall and Chairman Klein provided some information as well, including the score distribution and the clarification that the ICOC has the ability to cut off funding wherever they see fit, based on the best science, and to move any money "left over" into another set of RFAs if appropriate.

Lori Hoffman provided details on funds available for Comprehensive Grant funding to taking into account the amount of funds awarded in Training Grants and SEED Grants and given no additional funds coming in the door -- by way of the anticipated bond sales or otherwise. Details can be found at this URL:

http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2007/03/031507_item_11b.pdf

Motion:

- Dr. Baltimore made a motion for the ICOC to consider among its alternatives the ability to fund Comprehensive Grants for two years rather than four.
- Dr. Penhoet seconded the motion.

Vote:

- By roll call vote, this motion carried.

FOCUSING ON TIER ONE

Motion:

- Dr. Baltimore made a motion to fund Comprehensive Grant application number 144 specifically for two years.
- Dr. Henderson seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion failed.

FOCUSING ON TIER TWO

Motion:

- Dr. Steward made a motion to move Comprehensive Grant application 107 from Tier Two into Tier One.
- Mr. Roth seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion failed.

Motion:

- Dr. Steward made a motion to move Comprehensive Grant application 356 from Tier Two into Tier One.
- Dr. Wright seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion failed.

Motion:

- Mr. Sheehy made a motion to fund Comprehensive Grant application 114 for two years.
- Dr. Prieto seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion failed.

FOCUSING ON TIER THREE

Motion:

- Dr. Love made a motion to not fund Tier Three.
- Dr. Wright seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion carried.

At this point, the total dollar amount for applications in Tier One was \$74,587,642, an approximation subject to scientific staff review and adjustments based on the CIRM Grants Administration Policy.

Motion:

- Dr. Wright made a motion to approve for funding all the applications in Tier One, for a funding total of \$74,587,642 (an approximate number subject to review and adjustment based on the CIRM Grants Administration Policy.)
- Dr. Love seconded the motion.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion carried.

Agenda Item # 14: Continuation of consideration of Grants Review Working Group's recommendations regarding Comprehensive Grant applications.

Motion:

- Dr. Wright made a motion to permanently close off funding for Comprehensive Grants remaining in Tier 2.
- Dr. Prieto seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion carried.

Agenda Item # 17: Consideration of report from Presidential Search Subcommittee including but not limited to consideration of job description for CIRM President.

Lisa Pieper from SpencerStuart and her team were present to lead the ICOC through the discussion of specifications for the CIRM President job description, in preparation for the search. The ICOC discussed elements of the job and characteristics desired including the following, as laid out in a worksheet provided by SpencerStuart:

- Leadership/Management Experience in areas including:
 - a. Not-for-profit
 - b. Government/Policy/Legal
 - c. Academic Medicine
 - d. Industry
- Skills/Competencies/Attributes including:
 - a. Strategic Orientation
 - b. Results Orientation
 - c. Team Leadership
 - d. Collaboration Skills
 - e. Financial Acumen
 - f. Scientific Experience/Background
 - g. Clinical Experience/Background
- Scientific or Clinical Credibility/R&D Background including:
 - a. Stem Cell
 - b. Basic Science
 - c. Clinical Research
 - d. Drug Development
 - e. Clinical Medicine
 - f. Other
- Miscellaneous items including:
 - a. Active Lab
 - b. Reside in Bay Area
 - c. Compensation Limit/Specificity

Agenda Item # 4 C
6/4-5/07 ICOC Meeting

SpencerStuart received an abundance of feedback and direction from the ICOC for further development of the job description, along with the specific direction to include the Internal Governance Policy, as approved by the ICOC at this ICOC meeting, in the job description.

The timeline for the search was discussed briefly, and the SpencerStuart team detailed how they would be working with the Chairman's staff and the Presidential Search Subcommittee to move things forward. The next step would be to finalize the job description, including changes made based on the ICOC's feedback and direction, and get sign off on it by select members of the Presidential Search Subcommittee.

Agenda Item # 19: Consideration of report from Governance Subcommittee including but not limited to consideration of Internal Governance Policy.

Motion:

- Dr. Pizzo made a motion to approve the updated Internal Governance policy.
- Dr. Prieto seconded.

Vote:

- This motion carried; the Internal Governance Policy was approved.

Agenda items tabled for future meetings included items 4/Consideration of minutes from February 15-16, 2007 ICOC Meeting and 18/Consideration of creation of International Subcommittee including composition of the subcommittee and its mission.

###