

## California Institute for Regenerative Medicine

**This supporting document addresses Agenda Item #4:**

**Consideration of the search process for the scientific members of the Scientific and Medical Research Funding Working Group.**

**Description: The following guidance was distributed, along with a list of candidates, to each of the Grants Working Group Search Subcommittee Interview Team members to aid in the process of recommending candidates for the Grants Working Group.**

### INTERVIEW TEAM INFORMATION AND GUIDANCE

#### **Selection Criteria:**

**As ratified by the ICOC Board at the February 3 ICOC Board Meeting, the selection of the Grants Working Group Members will be guided by the following criteria:**

- A. The Grants Working Group must be comprised of “Outstanding and highly recognized experts in the field of stem cell research, including biomedical research that is necessary to develop therapies to implement stem cell research.”

***All of the names in the interview teams’ packets who are identified as “highly recognized”, by definition, satisfy this requirement.***

- B. The Grants Working Group must be balanced:
- Must have a mix of basic scientists and physician scientists from institutions outside the state of California
  - Scientists who are not doing stem cell research but are considered experts in biomedical research subsumed by and related to stem cell research are eligible for membership.

***We have attempted, in as much as possible, to ensure an equal distribution of physician- and basic scientists as well as area of research among interview teams***

- C. Grants Working Group members must have had substantial research publications

***Wherever possible, a list of PubMed publications has been provided for each “highly recommended” candidate for the interview teams’ review***

- D. Grants Working Group members must have sufficient experience reviewing grants to encompass the multiple grant types that the California Institute for Regenerative Medicine (CIRM) plans to support.

***This is information that the interview team will need to gather directly from the candidate(s).***

***The Institute will be supporting multiple types of grants and is therefore seeking broad-based grant review experience among its Grants Working Group members. The type(s) of grants that will be awarded in the initial grant cycle remains under consideration.***

E. Grants Working Group members must be willing to make the required time commitment

**Time commitment:**

***In addition to the investment of time required to review the grant proposals, the Grants Working Group members will be asked to participate in (4) meetings per year***

- ***There is flexibility within the statute with regard to the Grants Working Group quarterly meetings.***
  - ***To minimize the time commitment of reviewers, one or more of the quarterly grant cycles may be limited to less time-intensive grants.***
  - ***In addition, the quarterly meetings are not required to all be conducted in person (although this is preferable)***

**Term of service:**

***The legislation specifies a term of “up to 6 years.” While this period may be considered a disincentive for top quality reviewers, it is feasible that an individual may serve less than a six year term. The length of service will need to be contractually determined at the outset in order to ensure that there is consistent and appropriate representative membership on the Committee at all times. (So as to avoid complete “turnover” after 6 years.)***

**Additional information:**

**Compensation**

- Grants Working Group members will receive honoraria
  - Grants Working Group members will receive funds for support staff

**Ad hoc Reviewer Support**

- The Grants Working Group has latitude to select ad hoc members from sources of expertise outside of the working group depending on the needs of the grants under review.

**Conflicts of interest**

- During this interim period in which the Standards and Accountability Working Group is developing conflict of interest standards that will apply to the Institute, the baseline standards that will inform the practice of the Grants Working Group will be those currently in effect for the NIH. The NIH guidelines can be found at the following website:  
<http://grants2.nih.gov/grants/policy/coi/index.htm>

### **Standards Working Group Consideration**

- If the interview team is reviewing a candidate who, in the team members' estimation, would be more appropriate for or, when asked, more interested in serving on the Standards Review Committee, please refer these individuals to one of the CIRM staff members listed below. We would like, in any way that we can, assist the Standards Working Group in populating their committee.

#### **Caveat:**

*Please do not discuss individual candidates with any other subcommittee member(s) other than your interview partner prior to the next full subcommittee meeting.*

*This would risk violation of the Bagley-Keene open meeting laws.*

*Please do feel free to seek guidance regarding individual candidates or the interview process from a CIRM staff member (please see contact information below)*

### **Timeline to submit ALL recommendations: six weeks from receipt of materials**

- **April 19, 2005**  
Nominate 5 potential reviewers and submit corresponding comments by April 19
  - These should be submitted to the CIRM (see contact information below)
  - Information for nominees will be compiled and distributed to subcommittee members in preparation for the April open subcommittee meeting (tentatively scheduled for April 26). The subcommittee will consider the 30 individuals recommended by the 6 interview teams to serve either as ad hoc members or as full members of the Grants Funding Working Group.

#### **CIRM Contact information:**

Mary Maxon, PhD  
Deputy Vice-Chair  
California Institute For Regenerative  
Medicine  
PO Box 99740  
Emeryville, CA 94662-9470  
(510) 450-2418  
Fax: (510) 450 2435

Kate Shreve  
Senior Policy Analyst  
Scientific and Medical Research Funding Working Group  
California Institute For Regenerative Medicine  
PO Box 99740  
Emeryville, CA 94662-9470  
(510) 450-2418  
Fax: (510) 450 2435