**THE SCIENTIFIC AND MEDICAL RESEARCH FUNDING
(”RESEARCH FUNDING”) WORKING GROUP OF THE
CALIFORNIA INSTITUTE FOR REGENERATIVE MEDICINE**

**Recommendation to the ICOC: Interim Criteria for Review of the Scientific Merit of
Training Grant Applications received in response to RFA 05-01.**

According to Proposition 71 <http://www.voterguide.ss.ca.gov/propositions/prop71text.pdf>,
one of the functions of the Research Funding Working Group (RFWG) is to recommend to
the ICOC the "criteria, standards and requirements" by which CIRM grant applications are to
be evaluated. In the case of the Training Grants, CIRM issued an RFA for Training Grant
Applications before the RFWG was formed. The RFA, whose text was approved by the
ICOC at its meeting on May 6, 2005, stated that among the criteria by which the applications
will be evaluated are:

- *Overall quality of the Training Program*
- *Qualifications of the Program Leadership*
- *Research and Training Strength of the Proposed Mentors*
- *Quality of the Existing Training Programs*
- *Strength of Stem Cell Research at the Institution*

Although these were tacitly approved by the ICOC, we wish to fulfill the charge of
Proposition 71 that the RFWG should recommend criteria to the ICOC. Thus, the RFWG
considered and approved these interim criteria at its August 3rd meeting and now formally
recommends these as criteria for adoption by the ICOC at its September 9 meeting. Because
the criteria listed above and in the RFA were used by applicants preparing the proposals for
submission, the RFWG finds that it would be unfair and inappropriate to omit any of them at
this point. The RFWG recommends that these be adopted as Interim Criteria, so that a more
complete discussion can take place at a later date.

The ICOC has decided that consideration of review criteria should take place in a public
meeting, with appropriate input from the public before decisions are made.