

Bylaws of the
Scientific and Medical Research Funding (Grants Review) Working Group

ARTICLE 1. Authority.

The Scientific and Medical Research Funding (Grants Review) Working Group (“GRWG”) of the Independent Citizen’s Oversight Committee (“ICOC”) to the California Institute for Regenerative Medicine (“Institute”) is established by Chapter 3, section 125290.50 and section 125290.60 of the Health & Safety Code, also known as the California Stem Cell Research and Cures Bond Act (“Act”).

ARTICLE II. Purpose.

The GRWG is created for the purpose of recommending standards, criteria and grant and loan awards to the ICOC. This purpose will be accomplished through the review of grants and loan applications, based on standards and criteria adopted by the ICOC, in order to make recommendations to the ICOC for the award of training, research, therapy development, and clinical trial grants and loans. Finally, this purpose will be accomplished through oversight reviews of grantees to ensure compliance with the terms and conditions of the award in order to fulfill the mission of the Act, and to make recommendations for subsequent actions to the ICOC.

ARTICLE III. Functions.

The duties of the GRWG shall include the following:

- (A) Recommend to the ICOC interim and final criteria, standards and requirements for considering funding applications and for awarding grants and loans;
- (B) Recommend to the ICOC standards for the scientific and medical oversight of awards;
- (C) Recommend to the ICOC any modifications of the criteria, standards and requirements described in sections (A) and (B) above as needed;
- (D) Review grant and loan applications based on the criteria, requirements and standards adopted by the ICOC and make recommendations to the ICOC for the award of grants and loans to promote training, research, therapy development, and clinical trials;
- (E) Oversee peer-group reviews of grantees to ensure compliance with the terms of the award, and report to the ICOC any recommendations for subsequent action;
- (F) Recommend to the ICOC standards for the evaluation of grantees to ensure that they comply with all applicable requirements. Such standards shall mandate periodic reporting by grantees and shall authorize the GRWG to audit a grantee and forward any recommendations for action to the ICOC.

ARTICLE IV. GRWG Membership, Selection, and Terms of Service

Section 1 (Method of Appointment) Members of the GRWG shall be appointed by the ICOC.

Section 2 (Appointment). The GRWG shall have 23 members composed of: (1) seven ICOC members from the ten (10) disease advocacy group members (“Disease Advocacy Members”) described in paragraphs (3), (4), and (5) of subdivision (a) of Section 125290.20 of the Act; (2) fifteen (15) scientists (“Scientist Members”) nationally recognized in the field of stem cell research from institutions outside the State of California, and; (3) the Chairperson of the ICOC.

Section 3 (Term of Service). GRWG members shall normally serve for six (6) years except that after the first six-year term the members’ terms will be staggered so that one-third of the members shall be appointed for a term that expires two years later, one-third of the members shall be appointed for a term that expires four years later, and one-third of the members shall be appointed for a term that expires six years later. Subsequent terms are for six years. In the event that a GRWG member resigns prior to completing his or her term of service, incoming members appointed by the ICOC shall be invited to serve for a term of two (2), four (4), or six (6) years. GRWG members may serve a maximum of two consecutive terms.

Section 4 (Expiration of Term). When a member’s term expires, the ICOC shall appoint a new member within 30 days. GRWG members shall continue to serve until their replacements are appointed.

Section 5 (Alternate Scientist Members). Individuals with strong scientific expertise in stem cell research may be appointed by the ICOC to serve as Alternate Scientist Members of the GRWG. Alternate Scientist Members may serve in place of a Scientist Member of the GRWG who is unavailable to attend a meeting. Alternate Scientist Members have voting privileges in the GRWG and their presence is counted towards a quorum. In the event that a Scientist Member resigns from the GRWG, an Alternate Scientist Member may be confirmed by the ICOC as a replacement.

Section 6 (Ad Hoc Members) Individuals with strong scientific expertise in stem cell research or on a particular issue may occasionally attend meetings of the GRWG when a Scientist Member is unavailable to attend a meeting. Ad Hoc members have voting privileges and their presence is counted towards a quorum.

Section 7 (Specialists) Individuals with scientific expertise on a particular issue may occasionally be invited to attend meetings of the GRWG for the purpose of providing evaluation or expertise with respect to specific grant(s) or research fields. Specialist members do not have voting privileges and their presence is not counted towards a quorum.

Section 8 (Chair of GRWG)

- (A) **(Appointment)** The ICOC shall appoint a Scientist Member of the GRWG to serve as Chair of the GRWG.
- (B) **(Duties)** The Chair of the GRWG shall preside over the scientific evaluation of grants described herewith in Article VI, Section 2(A).

Section 9 (Vice-Chair of GRWG)

- (A) **(Appointment)** The ICOC shall appoint a Disease Advocacy Member of the GRWG to serve as Vice-Chair of the GRWG.
- (B) **(Duties)** The Vice-Chair of the GRWG shall preside over the grant and loan recommendation procedures described herewith in Article VI, Section 2(B).

Section 10 (Compensation and Expenses of GRWG Members).

- (A) **ICOC Members** – Each member of the GRWG who is also an ICOC member, except the chairperson, shall receive a per diem of one hundred dollars (\$100) per day (adjusted annually for cost of living) for each day the member attends a GRWG meeting, plus reasonable and necessary travel and other expenses incurred in the performance of the member’s duties. In addition, compensation in the amount of \$12.50 per hour shall be paid to ICOC members of the GRWG for time spent in preparation for a meeting of the GRWG.
- (B) **Non-ICOC Members** – Non-ICOC members of the GRWG shall be entitled to a daily consulting rate and reimbursement for expenses, as established by the ICOC.

Section 11 (Conflict of Interest). All non-ICOC members of the GRWG shall be governed by conflict of interest rules and economic disclosure requirements adopted by the ICOC. ICOC members shall be governed by California conflict of interest laws, as set forth in Health and Safety Code section 125290.30(g) and the conflict of interest policy for ICOC members adopted by the ICOC.

ARTICLE V. Duties of GRWG Members.

Section 1 (Scientist Members). The fifteen (15) scientist members of the GRWG are responsible for evaluating and scoring grant and loan applications for scientific merit, and for recommending, along with the other members of the GRWG, grant and loan funding awards to the ICOC.

Section 2 (Disease Advocacy Members). The seven (7) disease advocacy members of the GRWG, together with the Scientist Members, are responsible for recommending grant and loan funding awards to the ICOC.

Section 3 (Alternate Scientist Members). At the discretion of staff, Alternate Scientist Members may serve as substitutes for GRWG scientist members when a Scientist Member cannot attend a GRWG meeting. Alternate Scientist Members shall perform the same duties as Scientist Members.

Section 4 (Ad Hoc Members) Ad Hoc members are responsible for attending meetings of the GRWG for the purpose of providing scientific expertise on a particular issue(s), area or field and, at the discretion of the staff, may serve as a substitute for a GRWG scientist members when a Scientist Member cannot attend a GRWG meeting. Ad Hoc members shall perform the same duties as Scientist Members.

Section 5 (Specialists). Specialists may be invited by the staff to participate in meetings of the GRWG for the purpose of providing scientific expertise on a particular issue(s), area, or field and/or for a specific grant application.

ARTICLE VI. Meetings.

Section 1 (Regular Meetings). The GRWG shall hold at least four meetings per year, one of which will be designated as its annual meeting. The GRWG may hold additional meetings as the CIRM determines are necessary or appropriate. The annual meeting shall be attended **in person** by GRWG members, any Alternate Members, and any Specialist/Ad Hoc Members.

Section 2 (Teleconference Meetings). At the discretion of staff, members of the GRWG may participate in meetings of the GRWG, with the exception of the annual meeting, by teleconference, provided that the public has the opportunity to participate in public sessions of the GRWG that are conducted by teleconference.

Section 3 (Open Meetings). The GRWG shall meet in public session except for discussions related to evaluation of grant applications and recommendation of applications to the ICOC, discussions related to appeals of GRWG recommendations, discussions related to the review of a grantee's compliance with the terms of the award, and discussions of other matters that may be considered in closed session under the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act or under Health & Safety Code section 125290.30. The GRWG may recommend additional exceptions to the ICOC as necessary to carry out the mission of the GRWG.

Section 4 (Special and Emergency Meetings). Special and emergency meetings may be called by the Chair if necessary.

ARTICLE VII. GRWG Procedure for Recommending Grant and Loan Applications.

Section 1 (Quorum). Sixty-five percent of the GRWG members who are eligible to vote shall constitute a quorum of the GRWG.

Section 2 (GRWG Recommendation Procedures).

(A) Unless excused due to conflicts, both ICOC and non-ICOC members of the GRWG shall be present in-person or via teleconference during the entire GRWG meeting, and may participate in all discussions.

(B) Scientific Evaluation and Scoring

1. The Chair of the GRWG shall preside over the scientific evaluation and scoring process.
2. The fifteen (15) scientist members of the GRWG shall evaluate each grant and loan application for scientific merit and assign a numerical value to each grant based on standards and criteria adopted by the ICOC. The criteria and standards for evaluation are hereby incorporated by reference into these Bylaws.
3. The average numerical score for each grant will be calculated and recorded as its scientific score.

(C) Funding Recommendations

1. Once grant and loan applications have been assigned a scientific score, all voting members of the GRWG shall place each grant and loan application into one of three categories by separate or by *en bloc* vote as appropriate:
 - a. **Recommended for Funding (Tier 1)** – Highly meritorious grant and loan applications that are recommended for funding to the ICOC.
 - b. **Recommended for Funding Pending Available Funds (Tier 2)** – Meritorious grant and loan applications that are recommended for funding to the ICOC pending available funds.
 - c. **Not Recommended for Funding (Tier 3)** – Grant and loan applications that are not sufficiently meritorious to be recommended to the ICOC.

Section 3 (Recommendations and Minority Reports). Recommendations of the GRWG to the ICOC shall be made by a majority vote of a quorum of the members of the GRWG. If thirty-five percent (35%) of the members of the GRWG join together in a minority position, a minority report may be submitted to the ICOC.

ARTICLE VIII. Rules of Order.

Debate and proceedings in the GRWG shall be conducted in accordance with Robert's Rules of Order (Newly Revised) when not in conflict with rules of the GRWG or other statutory requirements.

ARTICLE IX. Amendments.

These Bylaws may be amended or repealed by the ICOC at any regular or special meeting by a majority vote of a quorum of the ICOC. The GRWG may recommend amendments to these bylaws to the ICOC for its consideration.