

DRAFT MINUTES OF 12/9-10/09 ICOC MEETING

MAIN LOCATION:

Paul Brest Hall
Munger Complex
Stanford University
Stanford, CA 94305

TELEPHONIC LOCATION:

City of Hope
1500 E. Duarte Road
Duarte, California 91010

Ricardo Azziz Alternate Donald Dafoe	Present
Robert Birgeneau Alternate Robert Price	Present
Floyd Bloom	Absent
David Brenner Alternate Gordon Gill	Present
William Brody	Present
Susan V. Bryant	Present
Marcy Feit	Present
Michael A. Friedman	Absent
Leeza Gibbons	Present
Michael Goldberg	Present
Sam Hawgood	Present
Robert Klein	Present
Sherry Lansing	Absent
Gerald Levey	Present
Ted W. Love	Present
Ed Penhoet	Present
Philip A. Pizzo	Absent
Claire Pomeroy Alternate Ken Burtis	Present
Francisco J. Prieto	Present
Carmen Puliafito	Absent
Robert Quint	Absent
John C. Reed Alternate Jeannie Fontana	Absent
Duane Roth	Present
Joan Samuelson	Present
David Serrano Sewell	Present
Jeff Sheehy	Present
Jonathan Shestack	Absent
Oswald Steward	Present
Art Torres	Present

I. Agenda Item # 4: Chairman's Report.

Chairman Klein ceded his time to staff members and other agenda items.

II. Agenda Item # 5: President's Report

To see the report as presented, see this URL:

http://www.cirm.ca.gov/Agenda_ICOC_12_9-10_09

**III. Agenda Item # 6: Financial Audit Report from Macias, Gini and O'Connell.
(Will take place Dec. 10th)**

Shelley Walker-Davies, the lead Audit Manager for CIRM at Macias, Gini and O'Connell, delivered this report in person. There were no findings in the audit. The same is true of the Controller's Office review of the audit.

To view the Financial Audit Report and the Auditor's Report to the ICOC, please see this URL and go to the links below item # 6:

http://www.cirm.ca.gov/Agenda_ICOC_12_9-10_09

IV. Agenda Items #7 Consideration of minutes from October 27-8, 2009 ICOC meeting.

The board approved the minutes from the October 27-8, 2009 ICOC meeting.

Motion:

- Dr. Hawgood moved to approve the minutes.
- Mr. Roth seconded the motion.

By voice vote, the board approved htre motion.

To view the minutes as approved, please see this URL and go the link in item # 7 (which is the word "minutes"):

http://www.cirm.ca.gov/Agenda_ICOC_12_9-10_09

V. Agenda Item # 8 Consideration for approval amendments to Cal. Code of Regulations section 100070.

The board approved the amendments to this section of the Regulations, part of CIRM's Medical and Ethical Standards and their corresponding state Regulations.

Motion:

- Sen. Torres moved to approve the amendments.
- Dr. Prieto seconded the motion.

Vote:

- The ICOC, by voice vote, approved this motion, approving the proposed amendments to the Regulations.

To view the amendments to the Regulations as approved, see this URL and click on the links in and below agenda item # 8:

http://www.cirm.ca.gov/Agenda_ICOC_12_9-10_09

VI. Agenda item # 9 Consideration of new scientific members of Grants Working Group

The board approved the proposed new scientific members for the Grants Working Group.

Motion:

- Sen. Torres moved to approve the new scientific members for the Grants Working Group.
- Mr. Goldberg seconded the motion.

Vote:

- The ICOC, by voice vote, approved this motion, approving the proposed new scientific members for the Grants Working Group.

To view the biographies of the new members as approved, see this URL and click on the link in item # 9:

http://www.cirm.ca.gov/Agenda_ICOC_12_9-10_09

VII. Agenda Item # 10 Consideration of amendments to Grants Working Group bylaws

The board approved the proposed amendments to the Grants Working Group bylaws.

Motion:

- Mr. Roth moved to approve the amendments to the Grants Working Group bylaws.
- Mr. Goldberg seconded the motion.

Vote:

- The ICOC, by voice vote, approved this motion, approving the proposed amendments to the Grants Working Group bylaws.

To view the amendments to the bylaws as approved, please see this URL and click on the link in agenda item # 10:

http://www.cirm.ca.gov/Agenda_ICOC_12_9-10_09

VIII. Agenda Item # 11 Consideration of appointment of Administrative Chair of Grants Working Group

The board approved the proposed Administrative Chair of the Grants Working Group.

Motion:

- Mr. Roth moved to approve the proposed Administrative Chair for the Grants Working Group.
- Sen. Torres seconded the motion.

Vote:

- The ICOC, by voice vote, approved this motion, approving the proposed Administrative Chair for the Grants Working Group.

To view the biography of the proposed Administrative Chair of the Grants Working Group, as approved, see this URL and click on the link in agenda item # 11:

http://www.cirm.ca.gov/Agenda_ICOC_12_9-10_09

IX. Agenda Item # 12: Consideration of amendment of motion adopted in January 2009 not to fund Tier II applications for Bridges to Stem Cell Research Awards and for Training Grant II Awards; if approved, consideration of recommendations from Grants Working Group regarding Tier II applications for Bridges to Stem Cell Research Awards and for Training Grant II Awards.

With regard to the first item (A) listed above:

The board voted to amend the motion approved by the board in January 2009 not to fund applications in Tier II in both the Bridges to Stem Cell Research Awards and the Training Grant II Awards programs, and reopen the discussion of whether or not to fund any of these applications.

Motion:

- Dr. Love moved to amend the motion approved by the board in January 2009 not to fund applications in Tier II in both the Bridges to Stem Cell Research Awards and the Training Grant II Awards programs.

- Ms. Gibbons seconded the motion.

Vote:

- The ICOC, via roll call vote, approved this motion, effectively reopening the discussion on whether or not to fund Tier II applications in the two programs.

With regard the second item (B) listed above:

The board voted to fund all of the applications on Tier II of the Bridges to Stem Cell Research Awards program

Motion:

- Dr. Love moved to approve for funding all (5) of the Tier II applications in the Bridges to Stem Cell Research Awards program.
- Mr. Goldberg seconded the motion.

Vote:

- The ICOC, via roll call vote, approved this motion, approving all five Bridges to Stem Cell Research Awards applications in Tier II.

With regard to the third item (C) listed above:

The board voted to fund both of the applications in Tier II of the Training Grants II Awards program recommendations from the Grants Working Group.

Motion:

- Mr. Sheehy moved to approve for funding the two applications in Tier II of the Training Grants II Awards program.
- Mr. Goldberg seconded the motion.

Vote:

- The ICOC, via roll call vote, approved this motion, approving both the applications in Tier II of the Training Grants II Awards program.

To view the list of Tier II applications as approved for both programs, please see this URL and click on the link below item # 12, which is the text “List of Tier II Applications for Bridges to Stem Cell Research & Training II.”

http://www.cirm.ca.gov/Agenda_ICOC_12_9-10_09

CLOSED SESSION

X. Agenda Item #13

a. Discussion of confidential intellectual property or work product and prepublication, and confidential scientific research or data relating to applications for Bridges to Stem Cell Research and Training Grant II, awards. (Health & Safety Code 125290.30(d) (3) (B) and (C)).

b. Discussion of Personnel (Government Code section 11126, subdivision (a); Health & Safety Code section 125290.30(d) (3) (D)).

Public report of any action taken, if necessary, during closed session.

There was nothing to report out of the Closed Session.

XI. Agenda Item #14 Consideration of compensation of statutory Vice Chair.

The board approved a modification of the Vice-Chair, Art Torres', percent effort and salary to account for the fact Senator Torres has undertaken government relations duty in addition to his duties as Vice-Chair. These government relations duties were formerly carried out by a full time CIRM employee. By undertaking these duties, the Vice-Chair has not only increased his time commitment to CIRM substantially beyond the 50 percent time, he has also saved the agency cost of hiring a full-time government relations staff member.

Motion:

- Mr. Goldberg moved, in recognition of the increased efforts on the part of Vice-Chair Art Torres (as described above), that his salary be adjusted to \$225,000 per year for 80 percent time, effective October 1, 2009.
- Mr. Serrano Sewell seconded the motion.

Vote:

- The ICOC, by voice vote, approved this motion, adjusting Vice-Chair Art Torres' salary to \$225,000 per year for 80 percent time, effective October 1, 2009.

XII. Agenda Item # 15 Consideration of recommendation for continuation of Pre-Application Process.

Following a robust discussion the the Pre-Application process, including whether to approve moving forward with it for only the Early Translational RFA up for approval later in this meeting or for any additional RFAs – possibly just the core RFAs – the board approved a motion to use the existing Pre-Application Process for the Early Translational and Tools & Technology II RFA.

During the discussion, board member Ed Penhoet suggested that undertaking further analysis would be an appropriate role for a Subcommittee, to engage deeply in this and

look at it carefully, which is something we don't have time to do during board meetings. He volunteered Jeff Sheehy to be the Chairman of that Subcommittee. He further suggested that the Subcommittee should somehow be balanced between the various different viewpoints, a group of volunteers.

Based on a motion from Jeff Sheehy, the board approved the use of the Pre-Application process for the Early Translational and Tools & Technology II RFAs, and to go about the process of setting up a Subcommittee to focus on the Pre-Application process and other scientific issues, including the Appeals Process vs. Extraordinary Petition Process and priority for funding research conducted with/on pluripotent cells.

Dr. Love asked to modify the motion to state that the board was approving use of the Pre Application process until the Subcommittee meets and defines an approved process.

Chairman Klein stated he would confer with the members who have spoken about pulling a committee together, and put it on the next ICOC agenda. He also suggested that, on an ad-hoc basis, President Trounson and Dr. Olson can informally talk with those individuals in the interim to try and move the conversation forward, limiting it to four or five individuals, keeping the larger group of public discussion on a public session.

Motion:

- Mr. Sheehy moved approved the use of the Pre-Application process for the Early Translational and Tools & Technology II RFAs, and to go about the process of setting up a Subcommittee as discussed.
Mr. Roth seconded the motion.

Vote:

- The ICOC, by voice vote, approved this motion.

To view the report on the Pre-Application process as presented, see this URL and click on the link below item # 15, which is the text: "Report on Pre-Application Process":

http://www.cirm.ca.gov/Agenda_ICOC_12_9-10_09

XIII. Agenda Item # 16 Consideration of concept approval for Early Translational Awards.

The board approved the concept for Early Translational Awards.

Motion:

- Mr. Roth moved approval of the concept plan for Early Translational Awards with the caveat that staff will make adjustments as they feel necessary around the board discussion regarding priority vs. exclusivity for pluripotent cells.

- Mr. Sheehy suggested a friendly amendment, which evolved into a separate motion.
- Mr. Roth withdrew his motion so Mr. Sheehy could make his motion separately and prior to a motion on actual approval of the concept plan.

Motion:

- Mr. Sheehy moved that the Early Translational RFA be limited to pluripotent cells.
- Mr. Serrano-Sewell seconded the motion.

Vote:

- The ICOC, by roll-call vote, voted down this motion.

Following Mr. Sheehy's motion, another motion was made to approve the concept. This took place as follows:

Motion:

- Mr. Roth moved for approval of the concept proposal for the Early Translational Awards RFA with a priority for pluripotent cells.
- Ms. Gibbons seconded the motion.

Vote:

- The ICOC, by roll-call vote, approved this motion, approving the concept proposal for the Early Translational RFA, with a priority for pluripotent cells.

http://www.cirm.ca.gov/Agenda_ICOC_12_9-10_09

XIV. Agenda Item #17 Consideration of approval of Disease Research Team Application No. DR1-01471, subject to President's determination that the application, as modified, can achieve the aims of the original application.

The board approved Application No. DR1-01471, in its revised form and as recommended by CIRM's president.

Motion:

- Mr. Serrano Sewell moved to approve Application No. DR1-01471, in its revised form and as recommended by CIRM's president.
- Dr. Love seconded the motion.

Vote:

- The ICOC, via roll call vote, approved this motion, approving Application No. DR1-01471, in its revised form and as recommended by CIRM's president.

XV. Agenda Item #18 Consideration of creation of a board Subcommittee on Communications with the California Public and a Task Force of the Subcommittee on Public Media. Consideration shall include, without limitation, appointment of the Chair and Vice-Chair of the Subcommittee and the Task Force Leadership.

The board approved the creation of a Communications Subcommittee of the board. Volunteers to serve on the Communications Subcommittee include: Floyd Bloom, Leeza Gibbons, Sherry Lansing, Ted Love, and Jeff Sheehy, with Robert Klein as Chair of the Subcommittee and Art Torres as the Vice-Chair of the Subcommittee.

Motion:

- Mr. Sheehy moved to approve the creation of the Communications Subcommittee of the board.
- Dr. Burtis seconded the motion.

Vote:

- The ICOC, by voice vote, approved this motion, creating the Communications Subcommittee of the board.

To view the summary information on the Communications Subcommittee as approved, see this URL and click on the link in item # 18:

http://www.cirm.ca.gov/Agenda_ICOC_12_9-10_09

XVI. Agenda Item 19 # Consideration of request to President to present recommendation at next Board meeting regarding modification of Disease Research Team Awards, Grants Administration Policy, and Loan Administration Policy to permit unutilized Disease Research Team Award funds to be used for Phase 1 or Phase 2A or 2B human clinical trial after FDA approval.

The board approved a motion to ask CIRM President Alan Trounson and his staff to come back with a recommendation at the next board meeting, in February 2010.

Motion:

- Dr. Love moved to
- Mr. Sheehy seconded the motion.

Vote:

- The ICOC, via roll call vote, approved this motion, assigning the staff to bring back its recommendation at the next board meeting, in February 2010.

**XVII. Agenda Item #20 Consideration of correction to Grants Administration
Policy regarding conflict of interest appeals.**

This item was not considered.

Independent Citizens
Oversight Committee

12/9/2009

Vote On:

Motion 1
Motion Maker: Hawgood
Seconded: Roth

Motion 2
Motion Maker: Torres
Seconded: Prieto

Motion 3
Motion Maker: Torres
Seconded: Goldberg

Description:
Approve Minutes

Description:
Approve Amendments to
Reg. 100070

Description:
Approve GWG Nominees

Members

Attendance

Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz	P	Y	Y	Y
Robert Price for Robert Birgenau	P/4:33 P.M.	Y	Y	Y
Floyd Bloom	A			
Gordon Gill for David Brenner	P/4:52 P.M.	Y	Y	Y
William Brody	P	Y	Y	Y
Susan Bryant	P	Y	Y	Y
Marcy Feit	P	Y	Y	Y
Michael Friedman	A			
Leeza Gibbons	P	Y	Y	Y
Michael Goldberg	P	Y	Y	Y
Sam Hawgood	A			
Bob Klein	P	Y	Y	Y
Sherry Lansing	A			
Leonard Rome for Gerald Levey	P	Y	Y	Y
Ted Love	A			
Ed Penhoet	P	Y	Y	Y
Phil Pizzo	A			
Ken Burtis for Claire Pomeroy	P	Y	Y	Y

Independent Citizens
Oversight Committee

12/9/2009

Vote On:

Motion 1
Motion Maker: Hawgood
Seconded: Roth

Motion 2
Motion Maker: Torres
Seconded: Prieto

Motion 3
Motion Maker: Torres
Seconded: Goldberg

Members

Attendance

Description:
Approve Minutes

Description:
Approve Amendments to
Reg. 100070

Description:
Approve GWG Nominees

Francisco Prieto	P/4:30 P.M.	Y	Y	Y
Carmen Puliafito	A			
Robert Quint	A			
John Reed	A			
Duane Roth	P	Y	Y	Y
Joan Samuelson	A			
David Serrano Sewell	P	Y	Y	Y
Jeff Sheehy	P	Y	Y	Y
Jon Shestack	A			
Oswald Steward	P	Y	Y	Y
Art Torres	P	Y	Y	Y
Total	P: 18	Y: 18	Y: 18	Y: 18
	A: 11	N: 0	N: 0	N: 0
		A: 0	A: 0	A: 0
		C: 0	C: 0	C: 0

Independent Citizens
Oversight Committee

Members	12/9/2009		12/10/2009	
	Vote On:		Attendance	Vote On:
	Motion 4 Motion Maker: Roth Seconded: Goldberg	Motion 5 Motion Maker: Roth Seconded: Torres		Motion 6 Motion Maker: Love Seconded: Gibbons
	Description: Approve GWG Bylaws Amendment	Description: Approve Dr. Sladek as GWG Chair		Description: Amend Motion Adopted in January 2009 Not to Fund Tier II Applications in Bridges and Training Grants II
Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz	Y	Y	P	C
Robert Price for Robert Birgenau	Y	Y	P	C
Floyd Bloom			A	C
Gordon Gill for David Brenner	Y	Y	P	Y
William Brody	Y	Y	P	Y
Susan Bryant	Y	Y	P	C
Marcy Feit	Y	Y	P	C
Michael Friedman			A	C
Leeza Gibbons	Y	Y	P	Y
Michael Goldberg	Y	Y	P	Y
Sam Hawgood			P	C
Bob Klein	Y	Y	P	Y
Sherry Lansing			A	C
Leonard Rome for Gerald Levey	Y	Y	P	C
Ted Love			P	Y
Ed Penhoet	Y	Y	P/9:59 A.M.	C
Phil Pizzo			A	
Ken Burtis for Claire Pomeroy	Y	Y	P	C

Independent Citizens
Oversight Committee

	12/9/2009		12/10/2009	
	Vote On:		Vote On:	
	Motion 4 Motion Maker: Roth Seconded: Goldberg	Motion 5 Motion Maker: Roth Seconded: Torres	Attendance	Motion 6 Motion Maker: Love Seconded: Gibbons
	Description: Approve GWG Bylaws Amendment	Description: Approve Dr. Sladek as GWG Chair		Description: Amend Motion Adopted in January 2009 Not to Fund Tier II Applications in Bridges and Training Grants II
Members				
Francisco Prieto	Y	Y	P	C
Carmen Puliafito			A	C
Robert Quint			A	
John Reed			A	C
Duane Roth	Y	Y	P	Y
Joan Samuelson			A	
David Serrano Sewell	Y	Y	P	Y
Jeff Sheehy	Y	Y	P	C
Jon Shestack			A	
Oswald Steward	Y	Y	P	C
Art Torres	Y	Y	P	Y
Total	Y: 18	Y: 18	P: 20	Y: 9
	N: 0	N: 0	A: 9	N: 0
	A: 0	A: 0		A: 0
	C: 0	C: 0		C: 16

Independent Citizens
Oversight Committee

12/10/2009

Vote On:

Motion 7

Motion Maker: Love
Seconded: Goldberg

Motion 8

Motion Maker: Sheehy
Seconded: Love

Motion 9

Motion Maker: Sewell
Seconded: Love

Members

Description:
Fund Bridges Tier II
Applications

Description:
Funding Grant II Tier II
Applications

Description:
Approve Disease Research
Team 1471 in its Revised Form,
subject to President's
Determination that the
Application, as Modified, Can
Achieve the Aims of the
Original Application

Donald Dafoe <i>for</i> Ricardo Azziz	Y/C	Y	Y
Robert Price <i>for</i> Robert Birgenau	Y/C	Y	Y
Floyd Bloom			C
Gordon Gill <i>for</i> David Brenner	Y	Y	C
William Brody	Y	Y	C
Susan Bryant	Y/C	Y	Y
Marcy Feit	Y/C	Y	C
Michael Friedman	C		C
Leeza Gibbons	Y	Y	Y
Michael Goldberg	Y	Y	Y
Sam Hawgood	Y/C	Y	C
Bob Klein	Y	Y	Y
Sherry Lansing	C		C
Leonard Rome <i>for</i> Gerald Levey	Y/C	Y	Y
Ted Love	Y	Y	Y
Ed Penhoet	Y/C	Y	Y
Phil Pizzo			
Ken Burtis <i>for</i> Claire Pomeroy	Y	Y	Y

**Independent Citizens
Oversight Committee**

12/10/2009

Vote On:

Motion 7
Motion Maker: Love
Seconded: Goldberg

Motion 8
Motion Maker: Sheehy
Seconded: Love

Motion 9
Motion Maker: Sewell
Seconded: Love

Members

Description:
Fund Bridges Tier II
Applications

Description:
Funding Grant II Tier II
Applications

Description:
Approve Disease Research
Team 1471 in its Revised Form,
subject to President's
Determination that the
Application, as Modified, Can
Achieve the Aims of the
Original Application

Francisco Prieto	Y	Y	Y
Carmen Puliafito	C		
Robert Quint			
John Reed			
Duane Roth	Y	Y	Y
Joan Samuelson			
David Serrano Sewell	Y	Y	Y
Jeff Sheehy	Y/C	Y	C
Jon Shestack			
Oswald Steward	Y/C	Y	Y
Art Torres	Y	Y	Y
Total	Y: 20	Y: 20	Y: 15
	N: 0	N: 0	N: 0
	A: 0	A: 0	A: 0
	C: 12	C: 0	C: 8

Independent Citizens
Oversight Committee

12/10/2009

Vote On:

Vote

Motion 10

Motion Maker: Love
Seconded: Torres

Motion 11

Motion Maker: Goldberg
Seconded: Sewell

Motion 12

Motion Maker: Sheehy
Seconded: Burtis

Members

Description:

Request President to Present Proposal Regarding Modifying Disease Research Team Awards to Permit Use of Unutilized Funds to be Used for Phase 1 or 2A or 2B Human Clinical Trial after FDA Approval and also to Consider Whether CIRM could Supplement the Unutilized Funds from the Disease Team Program arising from Grants that Did Not Meet Milestones.

Description:

Recommend that We Modify Vice Chair Torres's Percent Effort and Salary to Account for the Fact that the Vice Chair has Undertaken Government Relations Duties, in Addition to His Duties as Vice Chair. These Duties were Formerly Carried Out by a Full Time CIRM Employee. By Undertaking these Duties, the Vice Chair has Not Only Substantially Increased his Time Commitment Beyond 50% Time, He has also Saved the Agency the Costs of Hiring a Full Time Government Relations Director. In Recognition of this Increased Effort and Responsibility, and in Furtherance of CIRM's Mission, I Move to Adjust the Vice Chair's Salary to \$225,000 for 80% Time, Effective October 1, 2009.

Description:

Establish Subcommittee on Communications with the California Public and a Taskforce on Public Media, with BK as Chair and AT as VC.

Donald Dafoe for Ricardo Azziz	C	Y	Y
Robert Price for Robert Birgenau	Y	Y	Y
Floyd Bloom	C		
Gordon Gill for David Brenner	C	Y	Y
William Brody	C	Y	Y
Susan Bryant	C	Y	Y
Marcy Feit	C	Y	Y
Michael Friedman	C		
Leeza Gibbons	Y	Y	Y
Michael Goldberg	C	Y	Y
Sam Hawgood	C	Y	Y
Bob Klein	Y	Y	Y
Sherry Lansing			
Leonard Rome for Gerald Levey	C	Y	Y
Ted Love	Y	Y	Y
Ed Penhoet	Y	Y	Y
Phil Pizzo			
Ken Burtis for Claire Pomeroy	C	Y	Y

Independent Citizens
Oversight Committee

12/10/2009

Vote On:

Vote

Motion 10

Motion Maker: Love
Seconded: Torres

Motion 11

Motion Maker: Goldberg
Seconded: Sewell

Motion 12

Motion Maker: Sheehy
Seconded: Burtis

Members

Description:
Request President to Present Proposal Regarding Modifying Disease Research Team Awards to Permit Use of Unutilized Funds to be Used for Phase 1 or 2A or 2B Human Clinical Trial after FDA Approval and also to Consider Whether CIRM could Supplement the Unutilized Funds from the Disease Team Program arising from Grants that Did Not Meet Milestones.

Description:
Recommend that We Modify Vice Chair Torres's Percent Effort and Salary to Account for the Fact that the Vice Chair has Undertaken Government Relations Duties, in Addition to His Duties as Vice Chair. These Duties were formerly Carried Out by a Full Time CIRM Employee. By Undertaking these Duties, the Vice Chair has Not Only Substantially Increased his Time Commitment Beyond 50% Time, He has also Saved the Agency the Costs of Hiring a Full Time Government Relations Director. In Recognition of this Increased Effort and Responsibility, and in Furtherance of CIRM's Mission, I Move to Adjust the Vice Chair's Salary to \$225,000 for 80% Time, Effective October 1, 2009.

Description:
Establish Subcommittee on Communications with the California Public and a Taskforce on Public Media, with BK as Chair and AT as VC.

Francisco Prieto	C	Y	Y
Carmen Puliafito			
Robert Quint			
John Reed			
Duane Roth	Y	Y	Y
Joan Samuelson			
David Serrano Sewell	Y	Y	Y
Jeff Sheehy	C	Y	Y
Jon Shestack			
Oswald Steward	C	Y	Y
Art Torres	Y	A	Y
Total	Y: 8	Y: 19	Y: 20
	N: 0	N: 0	N: 0
	A: 0	A: 1	A: 0
	C: 14	C: 0	C: 0

Independent Citizens
Oversight Committee

Members	12/10/2009		
	Vote On:	Vote On:	
	Motion 13 Motion Maker: Sheehy Seconded: Roth	Motion 14 Motion Maker: Sheehy Seconded: Sewell	Motion 15 Motion Maker: Roth Seconded: Klein
	Description: Adopt Pre-Application Process for Early Translation and Tools and Tech 2	Description: Approve Concept Plan for Early Translation II, but Limit It to Pluripotent Stem Cells.	Description: Approve Concept Plan for Early Translation II RFA, with Higher Priority for Pluripotent Stem Cells.
Donald Dafoe <i>for Ricardo Azziz</i>	Y	N	Y
Robert Price <i>for Robert Birgenau</i>	Y	A	Y
Floyd Bloom			
Gordon Gill <i>for David Brenner</i>	Y	N	N
William Brody	Y		
Susan Bryant	Y	Y	Y
Marcy Feit	Y	Y	Y
Michael Friedman			
Leeza Gibbons	Y	N	Y
Michael Goldberg	Y	N	Y
Sam Hawgood	Y	N	Y
Bob Klein	Y	N	Y
Sherry Lansing			
Leonard Rome <i>for Gerald Levey</i>	Y	N	Y
Ted Love	Y	N	Y
Ed Penhoet	Y	N	Y
Phil Pizzo			
Ken Burtis <i>for Claire Pomeroy</i>	Y	N	Y

Independent Citizens
Oversight Committee

12/10/2009

Vote On:

Vote On:

Motion 13

Motion Maker: Sheehy
Seconded: Roth

Motion 14

Motion Maker: Sheehy
Seconded: Sewell

Motion 15

Motion Maker: Roth
Seconded: Klein

Members

Description:

Adopt Pre-Application Process
for Early Translation and Tools
and Tech 2

Description:

Approve Concept Plan for Early
Translation II, but Limit It to
Pluripotent Stem Cells.

Description:

Approve Concept Plan for Early
Translation II RFA, with Higher
Priority for Pluripotent Stem
Cells.

Francisco Prieto	Y	Y	Y
Carmen Puliafito			
Robert Quint			
John Reed			
Duane Roth	Y	N	Y
Joan Samuelson		Y	Y
David Serrano Sewell	Y	Y	Y
Jeff Sheehy	Y	Y	Y
Jon Shestack			
Oswald Steward	Y	A	Y
Art Torres	Y	N	Y
Total	Y: 20	Y: 6	Y: 19
	N: 0	N: 12	N: 1
	A: 0	A: 2	A: 0
	C: 0	C: 0	C: 0