

**THE SCIENTIFIC AND MEDICAL RESEARCH FUNDING (GRANTS REVIEW)
WORKING GROUP OF
THE CALIFORNIA INSTITUTE FOR REGENERATIVE MEDICINE**

Agenda Item 5:

Consideration of the interim criteria for review of the scientific merit of Training Grant applications received in response to RFA 05-01.

According to Proposition 71 <<http://www.voterguide.ss.ca.gov/propositions/prop71text.pdf>>, one of the functions of Grants Review Working Group is to recommend to the ICOC the “criteria, standards and requirements” by which CIRM grant applications are to be evaluated. In the case of the Training Grants, CIRM issued an RFA for Training Grant Applications <<http://www.cirm.ca.gov/funding/pdf/RFA05-01final.pdf>> before the Grants Review Working Group was formed. The RFA, whose text was approved by the ICOC at its meeting on May 6, 2005, stated that among the criteria by which the applications will be evaluated are:

- *Overall quality of the Training Program*
- *Qualifications of the Program Leadership*
- *Research and Training Strength of the Proposed Mentors*
- *Quality of the Existing Training Programs*
- *Strength of Stem Cell Research at the Institution*

Although these were tacitly approved by the ICOC, we wish to fulfill the charge of Proposition 71 that the GRWG should recommend criteria to the ICOC. Thus, we ask the GRWG to consider these interim criteria, and any other that it wishes to add, and to forward/present their formal recommendation as criteria to the ICOC, to be adopted at the next ICOC meeting on August 5, 2005. Because the criteria listed above and in the RFA were used by applicants preparing the proposals for submission, we suggest that it would be unfair and inappropriate to omit any of them in our discussions today. We also suggest that these be adopted as Interim Criteria, so that a more complete discussion can take place at a later date.

The ICOC has decided that consideration of review criteria should take place in a public meeting, with appropriate input from the public before decisions are made.