

DRAFT MINUTES OF 2/15-16/07 ICOC MEETING

**Sheraton Gateway Hotel – San Francisco International Airport
600 Airport Boulevard
Burlingame, CA 94010
Tel: (650) 340-8500**

Ricardo Azziz	Present
David Baltimore Alternate Paul Jennings	Present
Robert Birgeneau & Alternate Bob Price	Present
Susan V. Bryant	Present
Marcy Feit	Present
Michael A. Friedman	Absent
Michael Goldberg	Present
Brian E. Henderson Alternate Frank Markland	Present
David A. Kessler	Present
Robert Klein	Present
Sherry Lansing	Present
Gerald S. Levey	Present
Ted W. Love	Absent
Richard A. Murphy	Absent
Tina S. Nova	Absent
Ed Penhoet	Present
Philip A. Pizzo	Present
Claire Pomeroy	Present
Francisco J. Prieto	Absent
John C. Reed	Absent
Duane Roth	Present
Joan Samuelson	Present
David Serrano Sewell	Present
Jeff Sheehy	Present
Jonathan Shestack	Absent
Oswald Steward	Present
Janet Wright	Present

Agenda Item # 4: Approval of minutes from December 7, 2006 ICOC meeting.

This item was not considered at the 2/15-16 meeting. It will be agendized for a future meeting. To view the draft minutes, see this URL:

<http://www.cirm.ca.gov/minutes/pdf/2006/12-07-06.pdf>

Agenda Item # 5: Chairman's Report.

Chairman Klein spoke briefly about the tragic loss of Dr. Leon Thal and his contributions to the scientific and medical community, to the Alzheimer's community and the ICOC, among many other contributions he made throughout his life. He also described for the board the extensive process checking for conflicts of interest conducted leading up to this meeting, and filled the ICOC in on how any such conflicts would be handled during the discussion of and votes on grant applications during the meeting.

Agenda Item # 6: President's Report.

Dr. Hall updated the ICOC on personnel matters, including new staff member Rick Keller, Senior Officer for Facilities, joining from UC Davis, where he was Assistant Vice Chancellor for Capital Planning. He also introduced the board to newer members of the science team whom the board was meeting for the first time. He let the board know the scientific strategic plan had been published, as had the final report of the IOM-sponsored meeting, "Assessing the Medical Risks of Human Oocyte Donation for Stem Cell Research." Dr. Hall also provided an update on several scientific events and meetings he and Dr. Arlene Chiu attended, and some local meetings and events taking place at or co-sponsored by the CIRM. He reported on CIRM RFAs and also the CIRM's audit status, followed by a brief update on the CIRM's Medical and Ethical Standards.

To view Dr. Hall's presentation, see this URL:

http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2007/02/021507_item_6.pdf

Agenda Item # 8: Consideration of Grants Working Group's recommendations regarding SEED Grant applications.

The Working Group's recommendations came to the ICOC grouping the applications into three "Tiers", each with a different recommendation. Tier One was "Recommended for funding." Tier Two was "Recommended for funding if funds available." Tier Three was "Not recommended for funding at this time." There were 9 applications at the top of Tier two, marked with an asterisk to denote that they were recommended, after programmatic

review, to be considered at the top of Tier 2 as “special consideration for funding should additional funds become available.”

The ICOC began consideration of the SEED grant applications by discussing the possibility of moving applications from Tier Three to Tier Two, and then the possibility of moving applications from Tier One down to Tier Two or Tier Three. No motions were made in either of these categories.

Following discussion on whether to move applications out of Tiers One and Three, the ICOC began discussion of applications in Tier Two, and specifically of the nine asterisked applications at the top of Tier Two. All votes at this time were provisional, for the purpose of moving these applications between the Tiers as desired by the ICOC. Actual approvals for funding were to be done the following morning.

Motion:

- Mr. Sheehy made a motion to move application RS1-00170-1 into Tier One.
- Dr. Steward seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion carried.

Motion:

- Dr. Levey moved to move application RS1-00249-1 into Tier One.
- Mr. Roth seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion carried.

Motion:

- Mr. Roth made a motion to move the following four applications into Tier One: RS1-00331-1, RS1-00222-1, RS1-00333-1, and RS1-00409.

- Mr. Sheehy seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with each of the four applications, this motion carried.

Motion:

- Dr. Steward moved to move application RS1-00453-1 into Tier 1.
- Dr. Bryant seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion carried.

Motion:

- Dr. Pizzo moved to move application RS1-00308-1 into Tier 1.
- Dr. Bryant seconded.

Agenda Item # 4 B
6/4-5/07 ICOC Meeting

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with

this application, this motion was defeated.

This completed discussion of the nine asterisked applications. Following that discussion, the ICOC began discussion of the rest of the applications in Tier Two.

Motion:

- Dr. Azziz made a motion to move application RS1-00416-1 from Tier Two into Tier One.
- Dr. Wright seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion carried.

Motion:

- Dr. Sheehy made a motion to move all applications remaining in Tier Two with a score of 80 or above into Tier One.
- Dr. Levey seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with each of the applications included in the motion, this motion carried.

Motion:

- Dr. Roth made a motion to move all applications remaining in Tier Two with a score of 78 an up into Tier One.
- Dr. Levey seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with each of the applications included in the motion, this motion carried.

Motion:

- Dr. Price made a motion to move application RS1-00157-1 down from Tier Two to Tier Three.
- Mr. Sheehy seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion carried.

Motion:

- Dr. Penhoet made a motion to move application RS1-00183-1 up to Tier One.
- Mr. Roth seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion carried.

Agenda Item # 4 B
6/4-5/07 ICOC Meeting

Motion:

- Dr. Levey made a motion to move application RS1-00239-1 to Tier One.
- Dr. Pomeroy seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion carried.

Motion:

- Dr. Price made a motion to move application RS1-00242-1 to Tier Three.
- Dr. Levey seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion was defeated.

Motion:

- Dr. Steward made a motion to move application RS1-00242-1 to Tier One.
- Dr. Wright seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion carried.

Motion:

- Dr. Pomeroy made a motion to move application RS1-00387-1 to Tier Three.
- Dr. Azziz seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion carried.

Motion:

- Mr. Roth made a motion to move application RS1-00413-1 to Tier One.
- Mr. Sheehy seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion carried.

Motion:

- Dr. Steward made a motion to move application RS1-00180-1 to Tier One.
- Dr. Wright seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion was defeated.

Motion:

- Mr. Sheehy made a motion to move application RS1-00295-1 into Tier One.
- Mr. Roth seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including
recusal of those in conflict with

this application, this motion
carried.

Following that vote, the meeting was recessed for the night at 10:10 PM.

THE MEETING RECONVENED ON THE MORNING OF 2/16/07

Agenda Item # 11: Continuation of consideration of Grants Working Group's recommendations regarding SEED Grant applications.

Motion:

- Dr. Levey made a motion to fund all applications now in Tier One, through grant number RS1-00295-1. This motion was expanded to include the designation of the group of grants now in Tier One as the final "Tier One", and to approve funding for all applications in this tier. Total funding would be \$41,155,000.
- Dr. Azziz seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion carried.

Agenda Item # 12: Consideration of naming initial SEED grant round in honor of Dr. Leon Thal.

Motion:

- Mr. Roth moved to name the SEED grants the Leon Thal Memorial SEED Grants, in honor of recently deceased ICOC member Leon Thal.
- Dr. Levey seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote, this motion carried unanimously.

BACK TO CONTINUATION OF CONSIDERATION OF SEED GRANT APPLICATIONS

Motion:

- Dr. Azziz moved to fund applications RS1-00377-1 and RS1-00477-1, both scored at 77.
- Dr. Wright seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with each of these applications, this motion carried.

Motion:

- Mr. Sheehy made a motion to not consider applications with a score below 74, with the exception of application RS1-00308-1, with which he had a conflict.
- Dr. Pizzo seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with each of these applications, this motion failed.

Motion:

- Dr. Sheehy moved to fund application RS1-00321-1
- Dr. Pomeroy seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion carried.

Motion:

- Dr. Penhoet moved to fund application RS1-00311-1.
- Dr. Azziz seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion failed.

Motion:

- Mr. Sheehy to fund application RS1-00464-1.
- Dr. Wright seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion carried.

Motion:

- Dr. Steward moved to fund application RS1-00193-1.
- Dr. Wright seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion carried.

Motion:

- Dr. Penhoet moved to fund application RS1-00408-1.
- Dr. Wright seconded.

Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion carried.

Motion:

- Dr. Steward moved to fund application RS1-00180-1.
- Ms. Samuelson seconded.

Straw Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion failed. However, quorum calculation after taking recusals showed there was not a quorum for this vote, so this vote will be considered a straw vote, and this item will be considered at a future meeting.

Motion:

- Mr. Roth moved to fund application RS1-00308-1.
- Ms. Lansing seconded.

Straw Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion carried. However, quorum calculation after taking recusals showed there was not a quorum for this vote, so this vote will be considered a straw vote, and this item will be considered at a future meeting.

Motion:

- Mr. Roth moved to fund application RS1-00247-1.
- Mr. Sheehy seconded.

Straw Vote:

- By roll call vote including recusal of those in conflict with this application, this motion carried. However, quorum calculation after taking recusals showed there was not a quorum for this vote, so this vote will be considered a straw vote, and this item will be considered at a future meeting.

At this point, the ICOC had approved a total of approximately \$46 million in SEED Grant applications, with two applications being carried over to a future meeting for consideration with a voting quorum.

Public Speaker:

Bill Fisher, the CEO of the Alzheimer's Association Northern California and Northern Nevada spoke briefly on the wonderful contributions and painful loss of Dr. Thal, and thanked the ICOC for their work today, providing hope for future generations.

Agenda Item # 17: Consideration of report from Presidential Search Subcommittee.

Chairman Klein gave a brief report on the reconvening of the Presidential Search Subcommittee for a meeting on January 31, 2007. At that meeting, the Subcommittee decided to issue an RFP for an executive search firm. The RFP was issued following the meeting, with a deadline of February 23rd. The Subcommittee is scheduled to make a decision with regard to the executive search firm at its next meeting, scheduled for March 2nd.

There was a recommendation by the Subcommittee to have on the agenda for the March ICOC meeting a discussion of the challenges and the role of the next CIRM President.

Agenda Item # 16: Consideration of amendment to Conflict of Interest Policy for the Grants Working Group to clarify applicability to specialist members assisting the working group.

We did not have a quorum present for this item, but it was presented and a straw vote was taken. The ICOC straw vote was to approve this change. It will be placed on a future agenda for consideration with a quorum.

Agenda items tabled for future meetings included items 14, 15 and 19.

###