

DRAFT MINUTES Wednesday, December 8th, 2010

**LOCATIONS**

Pacific Ballroom  
Student Center  
UC Irvine  
Irvine, CA

136 Roanoke Street  
San Francisco, Ca 94131

	December 8 <sup>th</sup> , 2010
<b>Robert Price</b> for Robert Birgeneau	Present
Floyd Bloom	Present
<b>Gordon Gill</b> for David Brenner	Present
<b>Kim Witmer</b> for William Brody	Present
Sue Bryant	Present
Marcy Feit	Present
Michael Friedman	Absent
Leeza Gibbons	Present
Michael Goldberg	Present
Sam Hawgood	Absent
Bob Klein	Present
Sherry Lansing	Absent
Ted Love	Absent
Shlomo Melmed	Present
Ed Penhoet	Absent
Phil Pizzo	Absent
Claire Pomeroy	Present
Francisco Prieto	Present
<b>Elizabeth Fini</b> for Carmen Puliafito	Present
Robert Quint	Present
John Reed	Present
Duane Roth	Present
Joan Samuelson	Present
David Serrano Sewell	Present
Jeff Sheehy by Phone	Present
Jon Shestack	Present
Oswald Steward	Present
Art Torres	Present
Eugene Washington and James Economou	Present

## REPORTS & DISCUSSION ITEMS

### Agenda Item # 4

Presentation and discussion of report from External Advisory Panel.

Presentation given by the External Review Panel Members followed by discussion by ICOC Board Members and Comment from members of the public

- Alan Bernstein
- Rick Klausner
- Nancy Wexler

### Agenda Item # 5

Financial Audit Report from Macias, Gini and O'Connell

[A: Independent Auditors Reports, Financial Statements & Supplementary Information](#)

[B: Report to ICOC](#)

### Agenda Item #6 Chairman's Report

[Bob Klein Comments](#)

- Comments given by Bob Klein

### Agenda Item #7 President's Report

[2010-11 Budget Allocation and Expenditure Report](#)

[2009-10 Budget Allocation and Expenditure Report Month 13](#)

[CIRM Financial Projections](#)

[External Review Report](#)

- External Review Report given by Alan Trounson
- Budget Update given by Chila Silva Martin

### Agenda Item #8

[Consideration of minutes from previous Board meeting.](#)

#### Motion:

- Motion made by Art Torres to pass the minutes from previous board Board meeting
- Motion seconded by Michael Goldberg

#### Vote:

- The ICOC by voice vote PASSED the motion
- Vote: 18 YES; 0 NO; 0 ABSTENTION;

### Agenda Item # 9

[Consideration of recommendation from Standards Working Group regarding Designation of hESC lines Derived Under the Australian Research Involving Human Embryos Act as Acceptably Derived for CIRM-Funded Research.](#)

#### Motion:

- Motion made by Art Torres to pass the recommendations from the Standards Working Group
- Motion seconded by Michael Goldberg

**Vote:**

- The ICOC by voice vote PASSED the motion
- Vote: 23 YES; 0 NO; 0 ABSTENTION;

**ACTION ITEMS**

**Agenda Item # 10**

Consideration of recommendation regarding Early Translational II Research Application 1778 submitted in response to RFA 10-01: CIRM Early Translational II Research Awards.

- Agenda Item postponed to next meeting per Joan Samuelson's request

**Agenda Item #11**

Consideration of new [scientific members](#) for Grants Working Group

**Motion:**

- Motion made by Michael Goldberg to pass the recommendations of new scientific members of the GWG
- Motion seconded by Claire Pomeroy

**Vote:**

- The ICOC by voice vote PASSED the motion
- Vote: 17YES; 0 NO; 1 ABSTENTION;

**Agenda Item #12**

Consideration of [amendments to CIRM Intellectual Property Policy](#) as recommended by IP Task Force and in response to SB 1064.

- Item presented by Elona Baum

**Motion:**

- Motion made by Duane Roth to approve amendments to IP Regulation 100607
- Motion seconded by Michael Goldberg

**Vote:**

- The ICOC by voice vote PASSED the motion
- Vote: 20 YES; 1 NO; 0 ABSTENTION;

**Motion:**

- Motion made by Duane Roth to approve amendments to IP Regulation 100608 Motion seconded by Michael Goldberg

**Vote:**

- The ICOC by voice vote PASSED the motion
- Vote: 21 YES; 0 NO; 0 ABSTENTION;

**Agenda Item #13**

Consideration of [items referred and recommended by Finance Subcommittee](#) with regard to CIRM Loan Program.

- Item presented by James Harrison

**Motion:**

- Motion made by Duane Roth to approve amendment to warrant coverage
- Motion seconded by Claire Pomeroy

**Vote:**

- The ICOC by voice vote PASSED the motion
- Vote: 21 YES; 0 NO; 0 ABSTENTION;

**Motion:**

- Motion made by Bob Klein to approve payback alternative to warrant coverage
- Motion seconded by Floyd Bloom

**Vote:**

- The ICOC by voice vote PASSED the motion
- Vote: 21 YES; 0 NO; 0 ABSTENTION;

**Agenda Item #14**

Consideration of items referred and recommended by Governance Subcommittee.

- No action taken at this meeting

**Agenda Item #15**

[Consideration of recommendation from Science Subcommittee regarding process for review of requests for change in scope to permit use of unused research award funds for human clinical trial research, when human research was not part of the original application.](#)

- Item presented by Jeff Sheehy

**Motion:**

- Motion made by Jeff Sheehy to approve unused fund policy
- Motion seconded by Bob Klein

**Vote:**

- The ICOC by voice vote PASSED the motion
- Vote: 22 YES; 0 NO; 0 ABSTENTION;

**CLOSED SESSION**

Agenda Item #16

a. Discussion of confidential intellectual property or work product, prepublication data, financial information, and confidential scientific research or data relating to applications for RFA 10-01: CIRM Early Translational II Research Awards. (Health & Safety Code 125290.30(d) (3) (B) and (C)),

b. Discussion of Personnel (Government Code section 11126, subdivision (a); Health & Safety Code section 125290.30(d) (3) (D)).

Public report of any action taken, if necessary, during closed session.

- Closed Session Held
- Nothing to Report back

**DISCUSSION ITEMS**

17. Public comment. The Committee will accept public testimony on any matter under its jurisdiction that is not on the agenda, but the Committee cannot act on any such matter at this meeting.

- No public Comment at meeting

ICOC MEETING  
VOTE TALLY  
December 8th, 2010

Independent Citizens Oversight Committee		12.08.2010		
Members	Attendance	Vote On:		
		Motion 1 Motion Maker: Torres Seconded: Goldberg	Motion 2 Motion Maker: Goldberg Seconded: Pomeroy	Motion 3 Motion Maker: Roth Seconded: Pomeroy
		Description: Approve Consent Calendar	Description: Approve New Members Of Grants Working Group	Description: Approve Amendment To Warrant Coverage
Robert Price <i>for Birgeneau</i>	P (9:35 A.M.)	Y	Y	Y
Floyd Bloom	P	Y	Y	Y
David Brenner	P (10:40 A.M.)			Y
Kim Witmer <i>for Brody</i>	P	Y	Y	Y
Susan Bryant	P	Y	Y	Y
Marcy Feit	P	Y	Y	Y
Michael Friedman	A			
Leeza Gibbons	P	Y	Y	Y
Michael Goldberg	P	Y	Y	Y
Sam Hawgood	A			
Bob Klein	P	Y	Y	Y
Sherry Lansing	A			
Ted Love	A			
Shlomo Melmed	P	Y	Y	Y
Ed Penhoet	A			
Phil Pizzo	A			
Claire Pomeroy	P	Y	Y	Y
Francisco Prieto	P	Y	Y	Y
Elizabeth Fini <i>for Puliafito</i>	P (10:15 A.M.)			Y
Robert Quint	P	Y	Y	Y
John Reed	A			
Duane Roth	P (10:33 A.M.)			Y
Joan Samuelson	P	Y	A	Y
David Serrano Sewell	P	Y	Y	Y
Jeff Sheehy	P (Telephone)			
Jon Shestack	P	Y	Y	Y
Oswald Steward	P	Y	Y	Y
Art Torres	P	Y	Y	Y
Eugene Washington	P	Y	Y	Y
<b>Total</b>	P: 22	Y: 18 (Voice Vote)	Y: 17	Y: 21 (Voice Vote)
	A: 7	N: 0	N: 0	N: 0
		A: 0	A: 1	A: 0
		C: 0	C: 0	C: 0
		<b>PASS</b>	<b>PASS</b>	<b>PASS</b>

ICOC MEETING  
VOTE TALLY  
December 8th, 2010

Independent Citizens Oversight Committee				
Members	12.08.2010			
	Vote On:			
	<b>Motion 4</b> Motion Maker: Klein Seconded: Bloom	<b>Motion 5</b> Motion Maker: Roth Seconded: Goldberg	<b>Motion 6</b> Motion Maker: Roth Seconded: Goldberg	<b>Motion 7</b> Motion Maker: Sheehy Seconded: Klein
	<b>Description:</b> Approve Payback Alternative To Warrant Coverage	<b>Description:</b> Approve Amendment To IP Regulation 100607	<b>Description:</b> Approve Amendment To IP Regulation 100608	<b>Description:</b> Approve Unused Funds Policy
Robert Price <i>for Birgeneau</i>	Y	Y	Y	Y
Floyd Bloom	Y	Y	Y	Y
David Brenner	Y	Y	Y	Y
Kim Witmer <i>for Brody</i>	Y	Y	Y	Y
Susan Bryant	Y	Y	Y	Y
Marcy Feit	Y	Y	Y	Y
Michael Friedman				
Leeza Gibbons	Y	Y	Y	Y
Michael Goldberg	Y	Y	Y	Y
Sam Hawgood				
Bob Klein	Y	Y	Y	Y
Sherry Lansing				
Ted Love				
Shlomo Melmed	Y	Y	Y	Y
Ed Penhoet				
Phil Pizzo				
Claire Pomeroy	Y	Y	Y	Y
Francisco Prieto	Y	Y	Y	Y
Elizabeth Fini <i>for Puliafito</i>	Y	Y	Y	Y
Robert Quint	Y	Y	Y	Y
John Reed				
Duane Roth	N	N	Y	Y
Joan Samuelson	Y	Y	Y	Y
David Serrano Sewell	Y	Y	Y	Y
Jeff Sheehy				Y
Jon Shestack	Y	Y	Y	Y
Oswald Steward	Y	Y	Y	Y
Art Torres	Y	Y	Y	Y
Eugene Washington	Y	Y	Y	Y
Total	Y: 20 (Voice Vote)	Y: 20 (Voice Vote)	Y: 21 (Voice Vote)	Y: 22 (Voice Vote)
	N: 1	N: 1	N: 0	N: 0
	A: 0	A: 0	A: 0	A: 0
	C: 0	C: 0	C: 0	C: 0
	<b>PASS</b>	<b>PASS</b>	<b>PASS</b>	<b>PASS</b>