



Unit 1: Appendix F

Name _____

Preimplantation Genetic Diagnosis (PGD) Policy Options In-Vitro Fertilization and Embryonic Development Application

- I. Rank these policy options in order of which seems most reasonable to you after doing the jigsaw, with number 1 being most reasonable.
- _____ a. **Federal or state bans**. This option appeals to those who feel any creation or destruction of human embryos is immoral, said Susannah Baruch, JD, a policy researcher at the Hopkins Center. However, such restrictions on reproductive decision making will raise Constitutional concerns and could drive determined couples underground or to less restrictive countries.
 - _____ b. **Legal limits**. Congress could pass laws prohibiting preimplantation genetic diagnosis for certain uses—sex selection, for instance—while authorizing it for others, or establish a new regulatory agency. Such an agency could list acceptable uses of the technology while inspecting and licensing clinics. Such limits on a currently accepted medical practice would likely face stiff opposition from physicians.
 - _____ c. **Professional guidelines**. Physicians almost always favor self-regulation over more intrusive approaches, and professional guidelines can evolve alongside advances in science. But such guidelines are generally unenforceable. “There will always be providers to step in if there’s a market for it,” said Baruch.
 - _____ d. **Status quo**. Today, prospective parents decide if they want to pursue preimplantation genetic diagnosis; providers decide which tests to offer. Such an approach allows for a range beliefs, said Baruch, and avoids the follies of foisting a particular worldview onto all. But some argue that such a laissez-faire approach fails to address the profound social changes that the technology portends.



II. Write a paragraph to explain your ranking in the box below.

(Vastag, 2004)